

Council Findings and Recommendations



January 2023

*Full report available at
councilonpolicingreforms.org*

TABLE OF CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION	1
ADDRESSING RACIAL DISPARITIES IN TRAFFIC STOPS	2
BODY WORN CAMERAS	6
COMMUNITY-BASED VIOLENCE PREVENTION	10
CULTURE OF POLICING	15
DATA COLLECTION, ANALYSIS, AND REPORTING	23
FINES AND FEES	26
MENTAL HEALTH & SUBSTANCE ABUSE	29
PEDESTRIAN STOPS	35
POLICE TRAINING	38
POLICING IN SCHOOLS	43
MEET THE COUNCIL	47

INTRODUCTION

On October 18, 2020, the National Policing Institute, formerly the National Police Foundation, announced the formation of the Council on Policing Reforms and Race, an independent initiative to support excellence in policing, address racial disparities, and build and enhance trust and legitimacy.

The Council is a majority African American-led nonpartisan initiative that will use research and evidence to consider and offer recommendations to resolve some of the most significant and pressing issues concerning policing reforms and race. In launching this effort, the Institute acknowledges the role that racism, bias, culture (societal and organizational), and patterns and practices have played in the deterioration of trust and respect between law enforcement and Black communities. The Institute will encourage the Council to offer commentary, recommendations, and solutions for addressing these issues.

While various national panels and blue-ribbon commissions have been put forth previously to address similar areas of concern, this effort is distinguished by bringing together a broad cross-section of perspectives, infusing what we know and don't know from science in relation to these issues, elevating the voices of Black Americans working inside and outside of the policing profession.

ADDRESSING RACIAL DISPARITIES IN TRAFFIC STOPS

THE PROBLEM ►

Although traffic stops have been shown to improve traffic safety and reduce and prevent crime, they have also been associated with harmful police-community interactions. Black motorists are disproportionately stopped by the police, more likely to be searched, cited, and arrested, and are less likely to be treated with respect during the stop.¹ This has been associated with psychological harm and damage to trust in the police.² The risk of harm may be enhanced when the volume of stops, or stop-related outcomes, are linked to officer performance through formal or informal “quotas.” Pretextual or investigative stops, in particular, can lead to decreased perceptions of police legitimacy and increased safety risks to both the public and the officers. Given the potential harms caused by traffic enforcement, their use must be carefully tied to traffic safety, closely monitored by agency supervisors and leadership, and carried out by officers trained in procedural justice.

WHAT WE KNOW ►

TRAFFIC STOPS ARE COMMON AND MOST ARE CARRIED OUT RESPECTFULLY

Nearly 15% of all police-community contacts in the United States were traffic-related in 2018 (more than 18.6 million traffic stops).

Traffic stops are the most common reason for public contact with the police.³ A discretionary tool, they are the most common form of proactive policing. Given the high level of discretion and limited oversight, traffic stops are at risk of both implicit and explicit bias. Nevertheless, more than 85% of people involved in a traffic stop reported that officers behaved properly and treated them with respect. Black drivers were less likely to report the reasons for the stop as legitimate compared to Hispanic/Latino and White drivers.⁴

ROADWAYS ARE MORE DANGEROUS FOR PEOPLE OF COLOR

Blacks had the second highest per capita rate (68.5 per 100,000) of total traffic deaths nationally (2001–2010), exceeding the per capita rate of White traffic deaths (55.2 per 100,000).⁵ This was true for total traffic deaths, pedestrian traffic deaths, and bicyclist traffic deaths. People who live in areas of great economic hardship have an increased risk of being in a severe crash and dying in a traffic crash more often and at a higher rate than residents of more affluent neighborhoods.⁶

TRAFFIC STOPS CAN EFFECTIVELY REDUCE CRIME AND IMPROVE ROADWAY SAFETY

Traffic stops are used for two primary uses to improve traffic safety and to prevent and/or investigate crime (pretextual stops). The U.S. Supreme Court, in *Whren v. United States*, determined that pretextual stops are constitutional.⁷ Research has demonstrated that traffic stops can effectively reduce traffic injuries and fatalities, and violent crime, particularly homicides,

- 1 Voigt, R., Camp, N. P., Prabhakaran, V., Hamilton, W. L., Hetey, R. C., Griffiths, C. M., Jurgens, D., Jurafsky, D., & Eberhardt, J. L. (2017). Language from police body camera footage shows racial disparities in officer respect. *Psychological and Cognitive Sciences*, 114(25). <https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1702413114>
- 2 Epp, C.R., Maynard-Moody, S. and Haider-Markel, D. (2017), Beyond Profiling: The Institutional Sources of Racial Disparities in Policing. *Public Admin Rev*, 77: 168-178. <https://doi.org/10.1111/puar.12702>
- 3 Harrell, E., & Davis, E. (2020). *Contacts between Police and the Public, 2018 – Statistical Tables*. Bureau of Justice Statistics. <https://bjs.ojp.gov/library/publications/contacts-between-police-and-public-2018-statistical-tables>
- 4 Langton, L. and Durose, M. (2013). *Police Behavior during Traffic and Street Stops, 2011*. Bureau of Justice Statistics.
- 5 Governors Highway Safety Association. (2021). *An Analysis of Traffic Fatalities by Race and Ethnicity*. <https://www.ghsa.org/sites/default/files/2021-06/An%20Analysis%20of%20Traffic%20Fatalities%20by%20Race%20and%20Ethnicity.pdf>
- 6 Naumann, R.B., & Beck, L.F. (2013). Motor vehicle traffic-related pedestrian deaths — United States, 2001–2010. *Morbidity and Mortality Weekly Report*, 62(15), 277-282.
- 7 *Whren v. United States*, 517 U.S. 806 (1996). <https://supreme.justia.com/cases/federal/us/517/806/>

shootings, and illegal gun possession. To be effective, traffic stops must be highly focused on particular driving behaviors and locations; however, research indicates that the location of stops does not always align well with areas of traffic safety risk. Appropriating officers from traffic duties for other purposes, such as revenue collection⁸ and measures or displays of police productivity, has negative repercussions and unnecessarily puts officers and the community at risk.

TRAFFIC STOPS CAN BE DANGEROUS, BUT MOST OF THE DANGER COMES FROM TRAFFIC-RELATED FATALITIES

Traffic stops pose dangers for both officers and the individuals stopped, even though officers do not use force in most traffic stops.⁹ This suggests that eliminating traffic stops will not likely result in major reductions in officer-involved shootings. In contrast, officer injuries from traffic collisions are much more common. Traffic-related fatalities, including being struck by a vehicle while working along a roadway, are among the most common cause of officer fatalities.¹⁰ Data from 2021 found a substantial increase in “struck-by” incidents where officers are struck by another vehicle while working on the road or roadside.¹¹

THERE ARE ALTERNATIVES TO TRADITIONAL TRAFFIC ENFORCEMENT

Systematic reviews and meta-analyses found that speed cameras¹² can reduce fatal and non-fatal crashes, although they may not resolve all racial disparities. Red-light cameras (RLCs) may effectively reduce red light violations and are likely to reduce some types of traffic crashes.¹³ More recently, automated traffic

enforcement through network-connected vehicles has been proposed as a way to reduce the need for discretionary traffic enforcement.¹⁴

ASSESSING BIAS AND DISPARITY IN TRAFFIC STOP ACTIVITY IS CHALLENGING

Developing appropriate benchmarks for measuring racial disparities in traffic stops is challenging.¹⁵ There are considerable limitations in using population data as a benchmark^{16,17}, and scholars have argued that their use provides limited analytic value or is misleading.¹⁸ Compounding this problem, the relative value of the population as a benchmark appears to vary by place and type of agency (e.g., state highway patrol versus municipal police).¹⁹ At the operational level, law enforcement agencies face additional challenges in tracking and assessing for bias and disparity. Many approaches require sophisticated statistical modeling, skills which may not exist in agencies. Smaller agencies may also be limited by the small volume of traffic stops, making many analytic techniques unfeasible. Finally, most assessment approaches take an aggregate approach to assessing bias and disparity, and few approaches have been tested for officer- or command-level performance.

-
- 8 Piven, B. (2021, February 2). When Police Become Tax Collectors. *Q&A, Arnold Ventures*. <https://www.arnoldventures.org/stories/when-police-become-tax-collectors/>
- 9 Stephens, D. (2019). Officer-involved shootings: Incident executive summary. National Policing Institute.
- 10 Center for Disease Control and Prevention. (n.d.). *Law enforcement officer motor vehicle safety*. See <https://www.cdc.gov/niosh/topics/leo/default.html>
- 11 National Law Enforcement Memorial and Museum. (2022). 2021 End-of-year preliminary law enforcement officers fatalities report.
- 12 Center for Disease Control and Prevention. (n.d.). *Automated Speed-Camera Enforcement* [Fact sheet]. <https://www.cdc.gov/motorvehiclesafety/calculator/factsheet/speed.html>
- 13 Center for Disease Control and Prevention. (n.d.). *Automated Red-Light Enforcement* [Fact sheet]. <https://www.cdc.gov/motorvehiclesafety/calculator/factsheet/redlight.html>
- 14 Joh, Elizabeth. (2006). Discretionless Policing: Technology and the Fourth Amendment. *California Law Rev.* 95.
- 15 See, for example, Grogger, J., & Ridgeway, G. (2006). Testing for Racial Profiling in Traffic Stops From Behind a Veil of Darkness. *Journal of the American Statistical Association*, 101(475), 878-887. https://www.rand.org/content/dam/rand/pubs/reprints/2007/RAND_RP1253.pdf
- 16 Alpert, G., Smith, M., & Dunham, R. (2004). Toward a Better Benchmark: Assessing the Utility of Not-at-Fault Traffic Crash Data in Racial Profiling Research. *Justice Research & Policy*, Spring, 43.
- 17 Smith, W., Tomaskovic-Devey, D., Zingraff, M., Mason, M.H., Warren, P., Wright, C. P., McMurray, H., & Fenlon, C. R., The North Carolina Highway Traffic Study 6 (U.S. Department of Justice, Working Paper No. 204021, 2004)
- 18 Withrow, B., & Williams, H. (2015). Proposing a Benchmark Based on Vehicle Collision Data in Racial Profiling Research. *Criminal Justice Review*. 40. 449.
- 19 Lovrich, N. P., Gaffney, M. J., Mosher, C. M., Pickerill, M., Pratt, T. C. (2005). Analysis of traffic stop data collected by the Washington State Patrol: Assessment of racial and ethnic equity and bias in stops, citations, and searches using multivariate quantitative and multi-method qualitative research techniques. University of Washington, Submitted to the Washington State Police, Olympia, WA.

COUNCIL RECOMMENDATIONS ►

RECOMMENDATION 1

REDUCE RELIANCE ON TRAFFIC STOPS

Traffic stops, while not always improving driver and pedestrian safety, must be reduced to decrease the criminalization of community members and racial and economic disparities. Alternative traffic-safety strategies focusing on high-risk behaviors, including automated tools and civilian-led traffic-safety enforcement. Alternative strategies should be rigorously evaluated to determine their effectiveness in reducing disparate impact and negative police-community encounters while maintaining roadway and pedestrian safety.

RECOMMENDATION 2

ABOLISH PERFORMANCE INCENTIVES AND 'QUOTAS' BASED ON THE VOLUME OF TRAFFIC STOPS

Agencies must stop the use of traffic stop volume as a performance measure. Agencies should instead rely on problem-solving approaches that use stops when and where data suggests that traffic-safety issues (collisions, complaints) or crime may be prevalent.

RECOMMENDATION 3

CHANGE LAWS AND POLICIES REGARDING THE USE OF PRETEXTUAL (INVESTIGATIVE) STOPS

Policies and laws that encourage or allow pretextual stops for minor safety violations, such as items hanging from mirrors, lights out, and other minor mechanical issues, should be changed.

RECOMMENDATION 4

EXPLORE AND EVALUATE ALTERNATIVES TO TRADITIONAL TRAFFIC ENFORCEMENT AND ROADWAY SAFETY APPROACHES

Alternative approaches to enforce traffic laws and improve roadway safety should be explored, including civilian-based organizations to enforce minor traffic and vehicle violations and

respond to non-injury traffic collisions. Alternative strategies should be rigorously and independently evaluated for their impact on outcomes, including public safety and racially disparate impacts.

RECOMMENDATION 5

EXPLORE AND EVALUATE ALTERNATIVES TO TRADITIONAL TRAFFIC ENFORCEMENT AND ROADWAY SAFETY APPROACHES

Alternative approaches to enforce traffic laws and improve roadway safety should be explored, including civilian-based organizations to enforce minor traffic and vehicle violations and respond to non-injury traffic collisions. Alternative strategies should be rigorously and independently evaluated for their impact on outcomes, including public safety and racially disparate impacts.

RECOMMENDATION 5

IMPLEMENT DIVERSE APPROACHES TO REDUCE TRAFFIC INJURIES AND FATALITIES

Implement a variety of evidence-based strategies to reduce traffic-related injuries and fatalities, particularly where they disproportionately occur among groups and within communities. Proposed frameworks include the Data-Driven Approaches to Crime and Traffic Safety (DDACTS) model, education campaigns, and roadway modification.

RECOMMENDATION 6

OFFICERS SHOULD RECEIVE TRAINING ON USING PROCEDURAL JUSTICE PRINCIPLES IN TRAFFIC STOPS AND REQUIRE SIGNED CONSENT FOR VEHICLE SEARCHES

To reduce negative interactions and potentially coercive situations, officers should receive training on using principles of procedural justice in traffic stops. Training should include skills in active listening, neutral and transparent decision-making, and demonstrating dignity and respect toward community members. Signed consent forms should be required prior to voluntary vehicle searches.

RECOMMENDATION 7

MONITOR TRAFFIC STOP ACTIVITY FOR BIAS AND DISPARATE IMPACT

Regular monitoring of traffic stop activity will ensure there is no bias or racially disparate impact and outcomes. This analysis should be conducted at both officer- and organizational-levels (e.g., by special assignment, districts) and be broader than basic stop data, including officer behavior captured via body-worn cameras.

RECOMMENDATION 8

COLLECT AND DISSEMINATE TRAFFIC STOP DATA AT THE AGENCY AND STATE LEVELS AND DISSEMINATE TO THE PUBLIC

Detailed data on officer traffic stops should be collected at the agency and state levels and submitted to a centralized state repository. These data should include the time, date, and precise location of the stop, the reason for the stop, and the outcomes, including searches and searches incidental to arrest, contraband recovery, arrests and charges, and the demographic details of those involved. States should promote accountability and transparency by releasing such data to the public.

RECOMMENDATION 9

USE TRAFFIC STOP DATA TO IMPROVE EARLY INTERVENTION SYSTEMS

A more detailed and identifiable dataset (see Recommendation 8 above) should be used to develop anti-bias, early intervention, and early-warning systems. Stop data for every officer should be reviewed to detect potential bias and to intervene to mitigate bias. Agency-wide aggregate data and the actions taken should be monitored to reduce disparate outcomes.

DISSENTING VIEWS ►

Traffic stops are an important law enforcement and investigative tool that has proven to protect communities and enhance roadway and pedestrian safety. Proactive traffic enforcement reduces crash rates and ensures that vehicles on the road are in compliance with safety regulations. I do not believe the intent of the council is to simply reduce traffic enforcement. As a former police chief, who also served as commander of the traffic

enforcement and traffic homicide units, I vehemently disagree with encouraging any law enforcement agency to simply reduce traffic enforcement. However, I do believe the ultimate intent of the council is to reduce racial profiling and other inappropriate behavior that violates department policies and, in some cases, violates the law.

As we wrestle with our criminal justice system and debate the best, most effective ways to improve it, we must always remember that public safety is and must continue to be our top priority. Police executives must continue to emphasize unbiased policing, provide human diversity training, ensure departments reflect the diversity of the communities they serve, acknowledge good performance, and hold bad actors accountable.

In effort to ensure these stops are not leveraged negatively against certain communities, officers should report the nature of the stop and whom they pulled over. Such reports should be given to the law enforcement department for auditing purposes to ensure communities of color are not being negatively impacted. Violations in biased policing should be heavily punished.

– Council Co-Chair, Congresswoman Val Demings

BODY WORN CAMERAS

THE PROBLEM ►

The emergence of bystander videos of police actions has enabled the public to see officers responding and acting in the moment. In some cases, this has revealed objectionable behaviors of officers in highly publicized incidents over the last several decades. Some of these widely shared videos have shaken the confidence of many communities, particularly communities of color, who are disproportionately represented in these videos. Though such events are rare and do not represent most police encounters, the videos have led to demands for greater accountability. The latest available data indicates that nearly half of law enforcement agencies in the United States have acquired body-worn cameras. Among agencies that deployed their body-worn cameras, little is known about how footage is being used in accountability processes, including in training and supervision. The inability or failure to make use of body-worn camera footage proactively in supervision, training, and accountability reduces the potential for improving outcomes in police-community encounters and relations.

WHAT WE KNOW ►

BODY-WORN CAMERAS HAVE BEEN RAPIDLY ADOPTED BY LAW ENFORCEMENT

As of 2016, 47% of local, county, and state police agencies had acquired body-worn cameras. Larger agencies were more likely to have body-worn cameras; 80% of police departments with 500 or more officers had adopted body-worn cameras, with around 70% of those agencies placing the body-worn cameras in service. Agencies report adopting body-worn cameras to improve training and officer and agency accountability, improve community perceptions, increase officer safety, reduce and resolve civilian complaints, improve evidence quality, reduce liability, and help build better cases for prosecution.²⁰ Using body-worn cameras as a mechanism to reform practices and policies, however, is less well understood.²¹ Interestingly, officers and community members both seem to believe that body-worn cameras help protect them, which suggests incongruence between police and public perceptions and expectations about this technology.²²

UTILIZATION OF BODY-WORN CAMERAS HAVE MIXED IMPACTS

A 2020 review of the empirical literature revealed a proliferation of research on body-worn cameras since a U.S. Department of Justice assessment four years earlier.²³ The impact of body-worn cameras on officer behavior has largely examined two areas: 1) change in complaints against officers, and 2) officer reports on

- 20 Hyland, S. (2018). *Body-worn cameras in law enforcement agencies, 2016*. US Department of Justice, Office of Justice Programs, Bureau of Justice Statistics. <https://bjs.ojp.gov/content/pub/pdf/bwclea16.pdf>
- 21 Willis, J. (2022). "Culture eats strategy for breakfast": An in-depth examination of police officer perceptions of body-worn camera implementation and their relationship to policy, supervision, and training. *Criminology & Public Policy*, 1-25. Advance online publication. <https://doi.org/10.1111/1745-9133.12591>
- Lum, C., Stoltz, M., Koper, C. S., & Scherer, J. A. (2019). Research on body worn cameras: What we know, what we need to know. *Criminology & Public Policy*, 18(1), 93-118. <https://doi.org/10.1111/1745-9133.12412>
- 22 Lum, C., Stoltz, M., Koper, C. S., & Scherer, J. A. (2019). Research on body worn cameras: What we know, what we need to know. *Criminology & Public Policy*, 18(1), 93-118. <https://doi.org/10.1111/1745-9133.12412>
- 23 White, M. (2014). *Police officer body-worn cameras: Assessing the evidence*. U.S. Department of Justice, Office of Justice Programs. https://bja.ojp.gov/sites/g/files/xyckuh186/files/bwc/pdfs/diagnosticcenter_policeofficerbody-worncameras.pdf

use of force.²⁴ Some evidence suggests body-worn cameras are associated with fewer community complaints against officers and uses of force, but more citations and arrests.²⁵ Other evidence suggests uses of force and community-initiated complaints actually increase with the use of body-worn cameras.²⁶ Some of these variations may be due to structural variations across agencies (e.g., policies regarding use and opinions or definitions on what constitutes force) and less due to behavioral changes by officers. Restricting officers' discretion in turning the body-worn cameras on and off (i.e., requiring officers to have body-worn cameras on during all enforcement actions) may help reduce uses of force and eliminate a number of community complaints.²⁷ The high variability in research findings suggests that the impact of body-worn cameras may depend on a variety of agency- and officer-level factors.

THE IMPACT OF BODY-WORN CAMERAS ON REDUCING RACIAL DISPARITIES IN POLICING OUTCOMES IS NOT YET KNOWN

Researchers point to how little is known about the impact of various police interventions, including body-worn cameras, on reducing racial disparities in policing outcomes.²⁸ A national study of local police departments suggests that body-worn cameras do not have an effect on officers' overall treatment of Black versus White individuals.²⁹ In another study using computational linguistic methods, researchers found that officers were consistently less respectful to Black versus White persons even after controlling for a number of variables.³⁰

ISSUES OF TRANSPARENCY AND PUBLIC RELEASE OF BODY-WORN CAMERA VIDEOS HAVE NOT BEEN CLEARLY RESOLVED

As of 2016, 86% of law enforcement agencies that had acquired body-worn cameras had policies for body-worn camera usage and management of resulting footage. Nearly 85% specified the types of events to record; 80–90% required the recording higher-risk events (e.g., traffic stops, officer-initiated contacts, and firearm deployment); 54% covered public release of raw footage, 64% controlled officer review of footage, and 76% had provisions about routine supervisor review of footage. Larger and municipal agencies were more likely to have these policies. It remains unclear how often agencies use body-worn camera footage for investigating potential officer misconduct or for training and supervision purposes. In 2016, the most recent year for which data exists, most agencies received no public requests to view footage on a monthly basis; among agencies with at least one public request per month, 41% of agencies denied access, primarily because the video was part of an ongoing investigation.³¹

COMMUNITIES ARE GENERALLY SUPPORTIVE OF THE ADOPTION OF BODY-WORN CAMERAS BUT HAVE NUANCED VIEWS OF THEIR IMPACT

Those who believe that body-worn cameras increase transparency, improve police-community relationships, and enhance trust in police are most likely to support the use of body-worn cameras; these beliefs, however, are also affected by pre-existing views and experiences with police.³² In a 2019

- 24 Lum, C., Koper, C. S., Wilson, D. B., Stoltz, M., Goodier, M., Eggins, E., ... & Mazerolle, L. (2020). Body-worn cameras' effects on police officers and citizen behavior: A systematic review. *Campbell Systematic Reviews*, 16(3), e1112. <https://doi.org/10.1002/cl2.1112>
- 25 Braga, A. A., Sousa, W. H., Coldren, Jr., J. R., & Rodriguez, D. (2018). The effects of body-worn cameras on police activity and police-citizen encounters: A randomized control trial. *Journal of Criminal Law and Criminology*, 108(3), 511-538. <https://scholarlycommons.law.northwestern.edu/jclc/vol108/iss3/3/>
- 26 Ariel, B. (2016). Police body cameras in large police departments. *Journal of Criminal Law and Criminology*, 106(4), 729-768. <https://scholarlycommons.law.northwestern.edu/jclc/vol106/iss4/3/>
- 27 Ariel, B., Sutherland, A., Henstock, D., Young, J., Drover, P., Sykes, J., Megicks, S., & Henderson, R. (2016). Report: Increases in police use of force in the presence of body-worn cameras are driven by officer discretion: A protocol-based subgroup analysis of 10 randomized experiments. *Journal of Experimental Criminology*, 12(3), 453-463. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11292-016-9261-3>
- Hedberg, E., Katz, C. M., & Choate, D. E. (2016). Body-worn cameras and citizen interactions with police officers: Estimating plausible effects given varying compliance levels. *Justice Quarterly*, 34(4), 627-651. <https://doi.org/10.1080/07418825.2016.1198825>
- 28 Lum, C., Stoltz, M., Koper, C. S., & Scherer, J. A. (2019). Research on body worn cameras: What we know, what we need to know. *Criminology & Public Policy*, 18(1), 93-118. <https://doi.org/10.1111/1745-9133.12412>
- 29 Pyo, S. (2021). Do body-worn cameras change law enforcement arrest behavior? A national study of local police departments. *The American Review of Public Administration*, 51(3), 184-198. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0275074020982688>
- 30 Voigt, R., Camp, N. P., Prabhakaran, V., & Eberhardt, J. L. (2017). Language from police body camera footage shows racial disparities in officer respect. *PNAS*, 114(25), 6521-6526. <https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1702413114>
- 31 Hyland, S. (2018). *Body-worn cameras in law enforcement agencies, 2016*. US Department of Justice, Office of Justice Programs, Bureau of Justice Statistics. <https://bjs.ojp.gov/content/pub/pdf/bwclea16.pdf>
- 32 Sousa, W. H., Miethe, T. D., & Sakiyama, M. (2018). Inconsistencies in public opinion of body-worn cameras on police: Transparency, trust, and improved police-citizen relationships. *Policing: A Journal of Policy and Practice*, 12(1), 100-108. <https://doi.org/10.1093/police/pax015>

study, researchers found that, although community members generally have high expectations that body-worn cameras will increase accountability and trust, “there are disparities between the legitimacy afforded to the police by various groups, which does not seem to be remedied by body-worn cameras.”³³

OFFICERS APPEAR TO DEVELOP MORE POSITIVE VIEWS OF BODY-WORN CAMERAS OVER TIME

Research reveals that most officers develop more positive or neutral views about body-worn cameras after they use them. Surveys have found that officers see body-worn cameras as protection from unsubstantiated complaints and can help improve the quality and availability of evidence. Some officers use body-worn camera footage to assist with report writing rather than relying on memory alone.³⁴ Officers’ receptivity towards body-worn cameras is shaped by technological difficulties and the workload of managing devices and videos,³⁵ concerns about additional oversight resulting in less proactive policing activity (i.e., de-policing)³⁶, and perceived ineffectiveness of body-worn cameras in affecting community behavior.

CAREFUL PLANNING AND PREPARATION FOR BODY-WORN CAMERA UTILIZATION ARE CRITICAL TO SUCCESSFUL IMPLEMENTATION AND BUY-IN FOR INTERNAL AND EXTERNAL STAKEHOLDERS

Internally, resistance to or support of body-worn cameras appears to have some connection to organizational factors (e.g., police culture, leadership support, policy and procedure, and training).³⁷ Officers with greater perceptions of organizational justice (i.e., belief that the agency will act in a fair and consistent manner) were more resistant to wearing body-worn cameras. When officers were mandated to wear body-worn cameras (compared to volunteering to wear them), they perceived a larger negative impact on body-worn camera efficacy (i.e., the ability of body-worn cameras to improve policing outcomes such as capturing better quality evidence and more accurate accounts of what happened).³⁸ Clearly defined objectives and explicit procedures and expectations linked to organizational goals increase the likelihood of successful implementation of body-worn cameras and other technologies.³⁹ External stakeholder engagement (e.g., community groups, other criminal justice agencies), particularly with regard to policies governing the use of body-worn cameras and the resulting video footage, may also be critical to successful implementation.⁴⁰

- 33 Lum, C., Stoltz, M., Koper, C. S., & Scherer, J. A. (2019). Research on body worn cameras: What we know, what we need to know. *Criminology & Public Policy*, 18(1), 93-118. <https://doi.org/10.1111/1745-9133.12412>
- 34 Lum, C., Stoltz, M., Koper, C. S., & Scherer, J. A. (2019). Research on body worn cameras: What we know, what we need to know. *Criminology & Public Policy*, 18(1), 93-118. <https://doi.org/10.1111/1745-9133.12412>
- 35 Katz, C. M., Choate, D. E., Ready, J. R., & Nuño, L. (2014). *Evaluating the impact of officer worn body cameras in the Phoenix Police Department*. Center for Violence Prevention & Community Safety, Arizona State University. https://publicservice.asu.edu/sites/default/files/ppd_spi_feb_20_2015_final.pdf
- 36 Rushin, S., & Edwards, G. (2017). De-policing. *Cornell Law Review*, 102(3), 721-782. <https://scholarship.law.cornell.edu/clr/vol102/iss3/3/>
- Lichtblau, E. (2016, May 11). F.B.I. Director says ‘viral video effect’ blunts police work. *The New York Times*. <https://www.nytimes.com/2016/05/12/us/comey-ferguson-effect-police-videos-fbi.html>
- Lum, C., Koper, C. S., Wilson, D. B., Stoltz, M., Goodier, M., Eggins, E., ... & Mazerolle, L. (2020). Body-worn cameras’ effects on police officers and citizen behavior: A systematic review. *Campbell Systematic Reviews*, 16(3), e1112. <https://doi.org/10.1002/cl2.1112>
- Newell, B. C., & Greidanus, R. (2018). Officer discretion and the choice to record: Officer attitudes towards body-worn camera activations. *North Carolina Law Review*, 96(5), 1525-1578. <https://scholarship.law.unc.edu/nclr/vol96/iss5/8/>
- 37 Willis, J. (2022). “Culture eats strategy for breakfast”: An in-depth examination of police officer perceptions of body-worn camera implementation and their relationship to policy, supervision, and training. *Criminology & Public Policy*, 1-25. Advance online publication. <https://doi.org/10.1111/1745-9133.12591>
- Lum, C., Koper, C. S., Wilson, D. B., Stoltz, M., Goodier, M., Eggins, E., ... & Mazerolle, L. (2020). Body-worn cameras’ effects on police officers and citizen behavior: A systematic review. *Campbell Systematic Reviews*, 16(3), e1112. <https://doi.org/10.1002/cl2.1112>
- 38 Huff, J., Katz, C. M., Webb, V. J., & Hedberg, E. C. (2020). Attitudinal changes toward body-worn cameras: Perceptions of cameras, organizational justice, and procedural justice among volunteer and mandated officers. *Police Quarterly*, 23(4), 547-588. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1098611120928306>
- Kyle, M. J., & White, D. R. (2017). The impact of law enforcement perceptions of organizational justice on their attitudes regarding body-worn cameras. *Journal of Crime and Justice*, 40(1), 68-83. <https://doi.org/10.1080/0735648X.2016.1208885>
- 39 Koen, M. C., Willis, J. J., & Mastrofski, S. D. (2018) The effects of body-worn cameras on police organisation and practice: A theory-based analysis. *Policing and Society*, 29(8), 968-984. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10439463.2018.1467907>
- 40 Todak, N., Gaub, J. E., & White, M. (2018). The importance of external stakeholders for police body-worn camera diffusion. *Policing: An International Journal*, 41(4), 448-464. <https://doi.org/10.1108/PIJPSM-08-2017-0091>

COUNCIL RECOMMENDATIONS ►

RECOMMENDATION 10

USE BODY-WORN CAMERAS AND CONDUCT RESEARCH ON DISPARATE IMPACT OF THEIR USE AND OUTCOMES

The use of body-worn cameras is needed to promote accountability, increase transparency, and improve police-community interactions, particularly in impoverished and minority communities and neighborhoods. Body-worn cameras should be used by officers in every law enforcement agency. Rigorous, peer-reviewed studies must be conducted to examine the impact of body-worn cameras on traffic stops, arrests, use of force, complaints against officers, policies concerning officer discretion (when recording is mandatory vs. voluntary), officer pro-activity, training, and community's perceptions of law enforcement agency transparency, particularly with respect to racially disparate treatment and outcomes.

RECOMMENDATION 11

ENGAGE THE COMMUNITY IN DEVELOPMENT OF BODY-WORN CAMERA POLICIES

To help promote a culture of transparency and accountability, law enforcement agencies should engage the community in the development and implementation of regulations, policies, and practices that govern the use of body-worn cameras, including protecting the privacy of the public and the storage of video footage.

RECOMMENDATION 12

USE BODY-WORN CAMERA VIDEOS FOR INVESTIGATIONS OF COMMUNITY COMPLAINTS AND OFFICER TRAINING

Video footage from body-worn cameras should be used to investigate community complaints of alleged officer misconduct and in training to help prevent misconduct and to support skills regarding procedural justice and de-escalation techniques. Periodic, random monitoring of routine interactions should be performed in a continuous learning framework to improve and highlight positive interactions.

RECOMMENDATION 13

IMPROVE TECHNICAL SOLUTIONS TO CHALLENGES CREATED BY BODY-WORN CAMERAS

Research is needed to improve technologies regarding body-worn camera data management, particularly the preservation of evidence and redaction of private information not suitable for public release.

COMMUNITY-BASED VIOLENCE PREVENTION

THE PROBLEM ►

It has long been recognized that law enforcement alone cannot prevent crime and make communities safe. Contemporary thinking suggests that crime and violence prevention must be a co-production between law enforcement agencies, the community they serve, and other parts of the criminal justice system, such as prosecutors and corrections. Because of the crucial role that law enforcement plays, it must — like other bedrock institutions — be carefully monitored to reduce the negative impact its actions have on the community and individuals. Much of policing focuses on reactive strategies such as stops, citations, and arrests, which can have a negative impact and create secondary harm to social structures and community stability. Collaboration is crucial to the effectiveness of programs and policies that touch so many lives, and strategies that strengthen police-community partnerships can reduce crime and victimization while also minimizing the collateral harm of over-policing and punitive criminal justice responses.

WHAT WE KNOW ►

CRIME CAN BE REDUCED BY INVESTMENT IN COMMUNITY VITALITY AND WELLBEING

Research has found that when communities have more nonprofit organizations focused on reducing violence and building strong communities, there is less violent and property crime.^{41;42} Access to mental healthcare and substance abuse treatment^{43;44}, and affordable housing programs⁴⁵ have also been associated with decreased crime and violence. Investing in the physical environment can also reduce property and violent crime. Studies have documented correlations between physical improvements — such as increased green space^{46;47;48}, reductions in vacant lots^{49;50}, and increased street lighting^{51;52} — with lower crime and greater perceptions of safety.

- 41 Sharkey, P., Torrats-Espinosa, G., & Takyar, D. (2017). Community and the crime decline: The causal effect of local nonprofits on violent crime. *American Sociological Review*, 82(6), 1214-1240.
- 42 Zimmerman, E. B., Woolf, S. H., & Haley, A. (2015). Understanding the relationship between education and health: A review of the evidence and an examination of community perspectives. *Population health: Behavioral and social science insights. Rockville (MD): Agency for Health-care Research and Quality*, 347-84.
- 43 Bondurant, S. R., Lindo, J. M., & Swensen, I. D. (2018). Substance abuse treatment centers and local crime. *Journal of Urban Economics*, 104, 124-133.
- 44 Deza, M., Maclean, J. C., & Solomon, K. (2021). Local access to mental healthcare and crime. *Journal of Urban Economics*, 103, 410.
- 45 Freedman, M., & Owens, E. G. (2011). Low-income housing development and crime. *Journal of Urban Economics*, 70(2-3), 115-131; Roy, L., Crocker, A. G., Nicholls, T. L., Latimer, E. A., & Ayllon, A. R. (2014). Criminal behavior and victimization among homeless individuals with severe mental illness: A systematic review. *Psychiatric services*, 65(6), 739-750.
- 46 Garvin, E. C., Cannuscio, C. C., & Branas, C. C. (2013). Greening vacant lots to reduce violent crime: A randomised controlled trial. *Injury Prevention*, 19(3), 198-203.
- 47 Heinze, J. E., Krusky Morey, A., Vagi, K. J., Reischl, T. M., Franzen, S., Pruett, N. K., ... & Zimmerman, M. A. (2018). Busy streets theory: The effects of community engaged greening on violence. *American Journal of Community Psychology*, 62(1-2), 101-109.
- 48 Kuo, F. E., & Sullivan, W. C. (2001). Environment and crime in the inner city: Does vegetation reduce crime? *Environment and Behavior*, 33(3), 343-367.
- 49 Branas, C. C., South, E., Kondo, M. C., Hohl, B. C., Bourgois, P., Wiebe, D. J., & MacDonald, J. M. (2018). Citywide cluster randomized trial to restore blighted vacant land and its effects on violence, crime, and fear. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences*, 115(12), 2946-2951.
- 50 Moyer, R., MacDonald, J. M., Ridgeway, G., & Branas, C. C. (2019). Effect of remediating blighted vacant land on shootings: A citywide cluster randomized trial. *American Journal of Public Health*, 109(1), 140-144.
- 51 Chalfin, A., Hansen, B., Lerner, J., & Parker, L. (2021). Reducing crime through environmental design: Evidence from a randomized experiment of street lighting in New York City. *Journal of Quantitative Criminology*, 1-31.
- 52 Farrington, D. P., & Welsh, B. C. (2002). Improved street lighting and crime prevention. *Justice Quarterly*, 19(2), 313-342.

YOUTH ENGAGEMENT STRATEGIES CAN REDUCE YOUTH CRIME

Providing young people with summer employment^{53;54;55} focusing on their social and emotional wellbeing^{56;57} can reduce crime, anti-social behaviors, and delinquency. Examples of specific types of youth programs^{58;59;60}, Youth Violence Prevention.^{61;62;63}

PROGRAMS NEED TO BE SENSITIVE TO COMMUNITY CONTEXT

Community-based violence prevention programs should be designed to fit the demographics, type of violence, and risk and protective factors of the community it is being implemented.^{64;65} Programs often include a variety of strategies such as social and professional development, intervention, outreach and engagement, counseling and therapy, case management, and financial support. Programs must also be sensitive and flexible in identifying and engaging the stakeholders and influential community leaders. Stakeholders can include clergy, elders, community activists, and athletes.

ALTHOUGH MANY PROGRAMS HAVE SUCCEEDED, SUCCESS SEEMS CONTINGENT ON LOCAL IMPLEMENTATION AND EVALUATION METHODS

It remains unclear which components of violence prevention

programs lead to success. A meta-evaluation of community policing suggests that these strategies improve public satisfaction, perceptions of disorder, and police legitimacy, but have limited effects on crime and fear of crime.⁶⁶ Another meta-analysis of problem-oriented policing suggests that it reduces crime and disorder, but has a limited impact on police legitimacy, fear of crime, and collective efficacy. Given inconsistencies in current research findings, best practices for violence prevention programs should include:

- » Tailoring to local problems
- » Identification of problems, informed by a variety of stakeholders
- » Clear definition of strategies that are supported by research and are implemented with high fidelity to program design
- » Consistent funding for programs shown to be effective

THE EFFECTIVENESS OF VIOLENCE INTERRUPTION PROGRAMS VARIES

Violence interruption programs focus on intervening in violence, mediating conflict, and preventing violence through outreach, strengthening anti-violence norms, and building positive peer relationships. Although program evaluations have been generally positive, success depends on local implementation and context. Research findings on this approach are mixed. Some implementations found reductions in shootings, homicides,

53 Davis, J. M., & Heller, S. B. (2020). Rethinking the benefits of youth employment programs: The heterogeneous effects of summer jobs. *Review of Economics and Statistics*, 102(4), 664-677.

54 Modestino, A. S. (2019). How do summer youth employment programs improve criminal justice outcomes, and for whom? *Journal of Policy Analysis and Management*, 38(3), 600-628.

55 Rhew, I. C., Hawkins, J. D., Murray, D. M., Fagan, A. A., Oesterle, S., Abbott, R. D., & Catalano, R. F. (2016). Evaluation of community-level effects of Communities That Care on adolescent drug use and delinquency using a repeated cross-sectional design. *Prevention Science*, 17(2), 177-187.

56 Augimeri, L. K., Walsh, M., Donato, A., Blackman, A., & Piquero, A. R. (2018). SNAP (Stop Now And Plan): Helping children improve their self-control and externalizing behavior problems. *Journal of Criminal Justice*, 56, 43-49.

57 Heller, S. B., Shah, A. K., Guryan, J., Ludwig, J., Mullainathan, S., & Pollack, H. A. (2017). Thinking, fast and slow? Some field experiments to reduce crime and dropout in Chicago. *The Quarterly Journal of Economics*, 132(1), 1-54.

58 Hawkins, J. D., Oesterle, S., Brown, E. C., Monahan, K. C., Abbott, R. D., Arthur, M. W., & Catalano, R. F. (2012). Sustained decreases in risk exposure and youth problem behaviors after installation of the Communities That Care prevention system in a randomized trial. *Archives of Pediatrics & Adolescent Medicine*, 166(2), 141-148.

59 Hawkins, J. D., Oesterle, S., Brown, E. C., Abbott, R. D., & Catalano, R. F. (2014). Youth problem behaviors 8 years after implementing the Communities That Care prevention system: A community-randomized trial. *JAMA pediatrics*, 168(2), 122-129.

60 Oesterle, S., Kuklinski, M. R., Hawkins, J. D., Skinner, M. L., Guttmanova, K., & Rhew, I. C. (2018). Long-term effects of the Communities That Care trial on substance use, antisocial behavior, and violence through age 21 years. *American Journal of Public Health*, 108(5), 659-665.

61 Heinze, J. E., Reischl, T. M., Bai, M., Roche, J. S., Morrel-Samuels, S., Cunningham, R. M., & Zimmerman, M. A. (2016). A comprehensive prevention approach to reducing assault offenses and assault injuries among youth. *Prevention Science*, 17(2), 167-176.

62 Smokowski, P. R., Bacallao, M., Evans, C. B. R., Rose, R. A., Stalker, K. C., Guo, S., ... & Bower, M. (2018). The North Carolina Youth Violence Prevention Center: Using a multifaceted, ecological approach to reduce youth violence in impoverished, rural areas. *Journal of the Society for Social Work and Research*, 9(4), 575-597.

63 Spoth, R. L., Trudeau, L. S., Redmond, C., Shin, C., Greenberg, M. T., Feinberg, M. E., & Hyun, G. H. (2015). PROSPER partnership delivery system: Effects on adolescent conduct problem behavior outcomes through 6.5 years past baseline. *Journal of Adolescence*, 45, 44-55.

64 Le, T. N., Arifuku, I., Vuong, L., Tran, G., Lustig, D. F., & Zimring, F. (2011). Community mobilization and community-based participatory research to prevent youth violence among Asian and immigrant populations. *American Journal of Community Psychology*, 48(1), 77-88.

65 Hipple, N. K., Saunders, J., Allison, K., & Peterson, J. (2020). What does success look like? Lessons from the innovations in Community-Based Crime Reduction (CBCR) Program. *Justice Evaluation Journal*, 3(2), 227-244.

66 Gill, C., Weisburd, D., Telep, C. W., Vitter, Z., & Bennett, T. (2014). Community-oriented policing to reduce crime, disorder and fear and increase satisfaction and legitimacy among citizens: A systematic review. *Journal of Experimental Criminology*, 10(4), 399-428.

and assaults, while others found no impact or an increase in violence.^{67;68;69} Other programs based on mentorship, cognitive behavioral therapy, professional development, financial incentives, and community-based crisis response have been effective in reducing violence and may even have positive spillover effects.^{70;71;72;73} Hospital-based violence intervention programs, which focus on intervening while an individual is in the hospital as a result of a violent injury, have been found to reduce violent reinjury, violent crime arrests, and convictions.^{74;75;76;77;78;79}

LAW ENFORCEMENT CANNOT BE SOLELY RESPONSIBLE FOR PUBLIC SAFETY

The co-production of public safety through police-community partnerships is essential for safe and healthy communities. Several programs focused on developing strong partnerships had positive impacts. For example, Project ROAR focused on developing inter-agency collaboration (comprised of tenants, social service agency and housing authority staff, business owners, politicians and policymakers, and police) to empower

public housing tenants to improve their quality of life. An evaluation found that residents' perceptions of the quality of their neighborhood life, police services, and decreased crime improved.⁸⁰ Other programs involving a variety of strategies have demonstrated that strong police-community partnerships can both reduce both crime and strengthen police-community relations.^{81;82;83;84;85;86;87}

EVIDENCE FOR POLICE AND COMMUNITY-LED VIOLENCE REDUCTION STRATEGIES

Over the last several decades, police agencies across the United States have invested in proactive strategies to prevent and reduce violent crime in their jurisdictions.⁸⁸ A number of research evaluations have examined the impact of these strategies on reducing violence (see McManus et al., 2020 for review). The available evidence suggests that police-led strategies designed with a focus on specific repeat places, people, and behaviors that contribute to violence can be particularly effective in reducing

- 67 Tita, G. E., Riley, K. J., Ridgeway, G., & Greenwood, P. W. (2005). *Reducing gun violence: Operation Ceasefire in Los Angeles*. National Institute of Justice; Office of Justice Programs
- 68 Butts, J. A., Roman, C. G., Bostwick, L., & Porter, J. R. (2015). Cure violence: A public health model to reduce gun violence. *Annual Review of Public Health, 36*, 39-53.
- 69 Braga, A. A., & Pierce, G. L. (2005). Disrupting illegal firearms markets in Boston: The effects of Operation Ceasefire on the supply of new handguns to criminals. *Criminology & Public Policy, 4*(4), 717-748
- 70 Matthey, E. C., Farkas, K., Rudolph, K. E., Zimmerman, S., Barragan, M., Goin, D. E., & Ahern, J. (2019). Firearm and Nonfirearm Violence After Operation Peacemaker Fellowship in Richmond, California, 1996–2016. *American Journal of Public Health, 109*(11), 1605-1611. <https://doi.org/10.2105/ajph.2019.305288>
- 71 Brantingham, P. J., Yuan, B., Sundback, N., Schoenberg, F. P., Bertozzi, A. L., Gordon, J., ... & Malinowski, S. (2018). Does violence interruption work. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, 8*(7), 1-6
- 72 Park, J., Schoenberg, F. P., Bertozzi, A. L., & Brantingham, P. J. (2021). Investigating clustering and violence interruption in gang-related violent crime data using spatial-temporal point processes with covariates. *Journal of the American Statistical Association, 116*(536), 1674-1687.
- 73 Kennedy, D. M., Braga, A. A., Piehl, A. M., & Waring, E. J. (2001). *Reducing Gun Violence: The Boston gun project's Operation Ceasefire*. National Institute of Justice; Office of Justice Programs
- 74 Evans, D., & Vega, A. (2018). *Critical Care: The Important Role of Hospital-Based Violence Intervention Programs*. New York, NY: Research and Evaluation Center, John Jay College of Criminal Justice, City University of New York.
- 75 Cheng, T. L., Haynie, D., Brenner, R., Wright, J. L., Chung, S. E., & Simons-Morton, B. (2008). Effectiveness of a mentor-implemented, violence prevention intervention for assault-injured youths presenting to the emergency department: Results of a randomized trial. *Pediatrics, 122*(5), 938-946.
- 76 Cooper, C., Eslinger, D. M., & Stolley, P. D. (2006). Hospital-based violence intervention programs work. *Journal of Trauma and Acute Care Surgery, 61*(3), 534-540
- 77 Juillard, C., Cooperman, L., Allen, I., Pirracchio, R., Henderson, T., Marquez, R., ... & Dicker, R. A. (2016). A decade of hospital-based violence intervention: Benefits and shortcomings. *Journal of Trauma and Acute Care Surgery, 81*(6), 1156-116
- 78 Shibus, D., Zahnd, E., Becker, M., Bekaert, N., Calhoun, D., & Victorino, G. P. (2007). Benefits of a hospital-based peer intervention program for violently injured youth. *Journal of the American College of Surgeons, 205*(5), 684-689.
- 79 Zun, L. S., Downey, L., & Rosen, J. (2006). The effectiveness of an ED-based violence prevention program. *The American Journal of Emergency Medicine, 24*(1), 8-13.
- 80 Giacomazzi, A. L. (1995). *Community crime prevention, community policing, and public housing: An evaluation of a multi-level, collaborative drug-crime elimination program in Spokane, Washington* (Doctoral dissertation, Washington State University).
- 81 Pate, A. M., Skogan, W., Wycoff, M.A., and Sherman, L.W. (1985). *Coordinated community policing: The Newark experience. Technical Report*. Washington, DC: Police Foundation.
- 82 Tuffin, R., Morris, J., Poole, A., & Great Britain Home Office Research, Development and Statistics Directorate. (2006). *An evaluation of the impact of the National Reassurance Policing Programme* (Vol. 296). London: Home Office Research, Development and Statistics Directorate.
- 83 Laycock, G. (1991). Operation identification, or the power of publicity? *Security Journal, 2*, 67-72.
- 84 Lindsay, B., & McGillis, D. (1986). Citywide community crime prevention: An assessment of the Seattle program. In D. Rosenbaum (Ed.), *Community crime prevention: Does it work?* (pp. 46-67). Beverly Hills, CA: Sage.
- 85 Schneider, A. L. (1986). Restitution and recidivism rates of juvenile offenders: Results from four experimental studies. *Criminology, 24*(3), 533-552.
- 86 Bennett, T., Holloway, K., & Farrington, D. (2008). The effectiveness of neighborhood watch. *Campbell systematic reviews, 4*(1), 1-46.
- 87 Taft, P. B. (1986). Fighting Fear: The Baltimore County COPE (Citizen-Oriented Police Enforcement) Project. In *Police Executive Research Forum, Washington, DC*.
- 88 Weisburd, D., & Majmundar, M. (Eds.). (2018). *Proactive policing: Effects on crime and communities*. National Academies Press.

overall violent crime. For example, hot spot policing focuses police resources on the most crime-ridden micro-locations within a city. Substantial research demonstrates crime reductions in areas receiving additional police attention. This approach can also produce crime prevention benefits that spread to areas adjacent to the micro-locations targeted for the intervention.⁸⁹ A growing body of scholarly research has also demonstrated that focused deterrence, an offender-focused violence reduction strategy, also significantly reduces violent crime.⁹⁰ Similarly, Project Safe Neighborhoods (PSN), a DOJ-developed, offender-focused approach that emphasizes enforcement, deterrence, and prevention, has also been observed to reduce violence across communities.⁹¹ While these and other police-led violence reduction strategies have shown significant short-term reductions in violence, long-term impact has been elusive, leading many to advocate for the increased implementation of community-led approaches.⁹²

Community-led approaches to violence intervention mobilize a variety of community stakeholders and multi-disciplinary resources to address violent crime.^{93;94;95} The role of the police in community-led strategies varies widely, with some initiatives operating independently from the police, while others have the police as one of many partners.^{96;97} There are strengths and weaknesses to each of these approaches. However, many argue that collaborative partnerships between public health and public safety in addressing violence offer the greatest chance for success.^{98;99;100} When compared to police-led violence reduction strategies, there is less overall evidence for the

effectiveness of community-led initiatives in reducing violence. The available research suggests promising community-led violence intervention strategies, particularly when implemented with a high level of model fidelity and stakeholder collaboration is achieved. However, more research is needed before strong conclusions on the impact of community-led violence reduction interventions can be made.¹⁰¹

COUNCIL RECOMMENDATIONS ►

RECOMMENDATION 14

IMPROVE COMMUNITY-DRIVEN VIOLENCE PREVENTION PROGRAMS

Community-driven violence prevention and intervention strategies must be developed to supplement policing efforts. These should be data-driven, tailored to neighborhood needs, and focused on at-risk individuals. Community-based violence prevention programs should be evaluated for a variety of performance metrics, including changes in community perceptions (such as fear of crime and police-community relations) and disproportionate impacts on racial and ethnic minorities.

- 89 Braga, A. A., Turchan, B. S., Papachristos, A. V., & Hureau, D. M. (2019). Hot spots policing and crime reduction: An update of an ongoing systematic review and meta-analysis. *Journal of Experimental Criminology*, 15, 289-311.
- 90 Braga, A. A., Weisburd, D., & Turchan, B. (2018). Focused deterrence strategies and crime control: An updated systematic review and meta-analysis of the empirical evidence. *Criminology & Public Policy*, 17, 205-250.
- 91 McGarrell, E. F., Kroovand Hipple, N., Corsaro, N., Bynum, T. S., Perez, H., Zimmerman, C. A., & Garmo, M. (2009). *Project Safe Neighborhoods – A national program to reduce gun crime: Final project report*. Michigan State University. Available from <https://www.ojp.gov/pdffiles1/nij/grants/226686.pdf>
- 92 McManus, H. D., Engel, R. S., Calnon Cherkaskas, J., Light, S. C., & Shoulberg, A. M. (2020). Street violence crime reduction strategies: A review of the evidence. IACP/UC Center for Police Research and Policy. Available from https://www.theiacp.org/sites/default/files/Research%20Center/Violence%20Reduction%20Literature%20Review_FINAL.pdf
- 93 David-Ferdon, C., Vivolo-Kantor, A. M., Dahlberg, L. L., Marshall, K. J., Rainford, N. & Hall, J. E. (2016). *A comprehensive technical package for the prevention of youth violence and associated risk behaviors*. National Center for Injury Prevention and Control, Centers for Disease Control and Prevention. Available from <https://www.cdc.gov/violenceprevention/pdf/yv-technicalpackage.pdf>
- 94 Petrosino, A., Campie, P., Pace, J., Fronius, T., Guckenburg, S., Wiatrowski, M., & Rivera, L. (2015). Cross-sector, multi-agency interventions to address urban youth firearms violence: A rapid evidence assessment. *Aggression and Violent Behavior*, 22, 87-96.
- 95 Welsh, B. C., Braga, A. A., & Sullivan, C. J. (2014). Serious youth violence and innovative prevention: On the emerging link between public health and criminology. *Justice Quarterly*, 31, 500-523.
- 96 Abt, T. P. (2017). Towards a framework for preventing community violence among youth. *Psychology, Health & Medicine*, 22, 266-285.
- 97 Butts, J. A., Gouvis Roman, C., Bostwick, L., & Porter, J. R. (2015). Cure Violence: A public health model to reduce gun violence. *Annual Review of Public Health*, 36, 39-53.
- 98 Abt, T. P. (2017). Towards a framework for preventing community violence among youth. *Psychology, Health & Medicine*, 22, 266-285.
- 99 Anderson, J. F., Reinsmith-Jones, K., & Reddington, F. P. (2017). Violence prevention in disadvantaged communities: The need for using criminal justice and public health approaches. *Journal of Human Behavior in the Social Environment*, 27, 743-744.
- 100 Williams, D. J., & Donnelly, P. D. (2014). Is violence a disease? Situating violence prevention in public health policy and practice. *Public Health*, 128, 960-967.
- 101 McManus, H. D., Engel, R. S., Calnon Cherkaskas, J., Light, S. C., & Shoulberg, A. M. (2020). *Street violence crime reduction strategies: A review of the evidence*. IACP/UC Center for Police Research and Policy. Available from https://www.theiacp.org/sites/default/files/Research%20Center/Violence%20Reduction%20Literature%20Review_FINAL.pdf

RECOMMENDATION 15

**VIOLENCE PREVENTION STRATEGIES
MUST INCLUDE RESOURCES AND
SERVICES**

Whether operated by law enforcement or community-based programs, violence prevention strategies must provide resources and services to deter at-risk individuals from crime. Communities should be involved in developing strategies and programs, such as focused deterrence, which connects offenders with social, community, and economic resources and sources necessary for deterrence, while still ensuring offender accountability.

RECOMMENDATION 16

**SUPPORT COMMUNITY PROGRAMS AND
RESEARCH THEIR EFFECTIVENESS**

Community-led, community-based public-health approaches to reducing violence, including capacity-building, should be well supported. More research to reduce crime and the fear of crime without reliance on justice-system interventions and punitive measures is needed.

CULTURE OF POLICING

THE PROBLEM ►

Law enforcement organizations' formal and informal cultures shape strategy choices, agency values and priorities, hiring and training decisions, and, ultimately, officer behavior and attitudes. Negative or toxic cultures can enhance and entrench biases that lead to disparate responses and fail to support the needs of officers and staff working within the agencies who deserve a positive and healthy work environment.

In many ways, policing culture reflects aspects of societal culture. Despite progress, racial biases and stereotypes continue influencing professional cultures, including policing. When these biases combine with policing approaches designed to increase enforcement and suppression rather than solving the underlying problems, they can lead to problematic responses and greater disparities.

In addition, the difficulties of a career in law enforcement take a toll on officers and their families. These same cultural problems can orient agencies away from providing a more supportive environment for wellness and make it more challenging for individual officers and staff to seek support when needed.

Communities and agencies can take action to mitigate these factors and the outcomes they can produce. There are exceptions to these harmful cultural traits, and many officers and agency leaders are working diligently to create change, but more must be done.

WHAT WE KNOW ►

POLICE CULTURE VARIES ACROSS AND WITHIN AGENCIES – NO SINGLE CULTURE EXISTS

Traditional views of police culture are often characterized by a preoccupation with the dangers of the job, the use of coercive authority, authoritarian organizational structures, and the uncertainty and ambiguity of the role. However, complexities in police culture cast doubt on a homogenous view and suggest that subcultural components need to be taken into account.¹⁰² Surveys of officers in different types of law enforcement agencies demonstrate similarities and differences in officers' cultural attitudes. Some features of police culture are more prevalent among law enforcement officers, but one unified police culture does not exist for all law enforcement agencies and all officers.¹⁰³ In addition, there can be a sharp divergence of attitudes and interests between what researchers call "street cops" and "management cops."¹⁰⁴

LAW ENFORCEMENT TRAINING IS A CULTURAL SOCIALIZATION GATEWAY

The training academy orients recruits to the traditions that characterize the police profession and particular law enforcement agencies. Institutional history and associated perspectives are passed down to recruits through formal and informal narrativization, including the telling and retelling of "war stories" from more seasoned officers. These approaches orient recruits to "think like a police officer" and help build collective understanding.¹⁰⁵ Considerable variation exists in law enforcement training in the United States. Training programs range from 650 to over 1,000 hours of basic training, plus an average of 508 hours in field training; discontinuity is typical

102 Paoline, E. A. III. (2003). Taking stock: Toward a richer understanding of police culture. *Journal of Criminal Justice*, 31(3), 199-214. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0047-2352\(03\)00002-3](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0047-2352(03)00002-3)

103 Paoline, E. A. III., & Gau, J. M. (2017). Police Occupational Culture: Testing the Monolithic Model. *Justice Quarterly*, 35(4), 670-698. <https://doi.org/10.1080/07418825.2017.1335764>

104 Reuss-Ianni, E. (1983). *Two Cultures of Policing*. Routledge.

105 van Maanen, J. (1973). Observations on the making of policemen. *Human Organization*, 32(4), 407-418. <https://doi.org/10.17730/humo.32.4.13h7x81187mh8km8>

between academy instruction and field training programs.¹⁰⁶ Traditional police training and certification, the requirements of which are set by state legislatures, emphasize the acquisition of “hard skills” (e.g., marksmanship, defensive tactics, and control)¹⁰⁷ while “soft skills” (e.g., interpersonal communication, problem-solving, rapport, and relationships) are either neglected or minimized.¹⁰⁸ Recruits are generally trained using authoritarian, paramilitary styles; a shift toward adult learning models, coupled with organizational buy-in and support, can help develop more psychologically skilled officers.¹⁰⁹

INDIVIDUAL AND GROUP PERCEPTIONS OF CULTURE INFLUENCE OFFICER BEHAVIORS AND OUTCOMES

Subcultures exist within law enforcement agencies, and officers exhibit varying degrees of alignment with and resistance to specific elements of traditional police cultural elements.¹¹⁰ The perceptions of officers that routinely work together can be stronger than individual attitudes; groups of officers adapt to the challenges and strains of the job in similar ways.¹¹¹ When officers are aligned with traditional elements of police culture (e.g., officer cynicism, negative attitudes toward the public, focus on crime-fighting, aggressive police tactics), they are more likely

to engage in problematic behavior, including higher levels of force during police-community encounters such as conducting traffic searches of drivers.¹¹² Further, officers who value aggressive patrol tactics and view their jobs as more dangerous use greater force, both in frequency and severity, and generate more complaints.¹¹³ Officers with more favorable views toward order maintenance and more positive views toward top management tend to use higher levels of force.¹¹⁴ Officers’ perceptions of what their supervisors expect and prioritize enforcement and problem-solving activities also impact their behavior and actions while on patrol.¹¹⁵

A WARRIOR MINDSET CAN NEGATIVELY IMPACT POLICE-COMMUNITY RELATIONS; A “GUARDIAN MINDSET” CAN POSITIVELY IMPACT POLICE-COMMUNITY RELATIONS

The warrior mindset or culture is based on military frameworks and is characterized by four key attributes: honor, duty, resolve, and willingness to engage in righteous violence.¹¹⁶ This mindset can promote an adversarial policing style that encourages conflict and distance between the police and the public and reinforces

-
- 106 Buehler, E. D. (2021, July). *State and local law enforcement training academies, 2018 – Statistical tables*. Bureau of Justice Statistics. <https://bjs.ojp.gov/sites/g/files/xyckuh236/files/media/document/slleta18st.pdf>
- Blumberg, D. M., Schlosser, M. D., Papazoglou, K., Creighton, S., & Kaye, C. (2019). New directions in police academy training: A call to action. *International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health*, 16(24), Article 4941. <https://doi.org/10.3390/ijerph16244941>
- 107 Alpert, G. P., & Dunham, R. G. (1997). *Policing Urban America*. Waveland Press.
- 108 Birzer, M. L. (1999). Police training in the 21st century. *FBI Law Enforcement Bulletin*, 68(7), 16-21.
- 109 Blumberg, D. M., Schlosser, M. D., Papazoglou, K., Creighton, S., & Kaye, C. (2019). New directions in police academy training: A call to action. *International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health*, 16(24), Article 4941. <https://doi.org/10.3390/ijerph16244941>
- 110 Terrill, W., Paoline, E. A. III., & Manning, P. K. (2006). Police culture and coercion. *Criminology*, 41(4), 1003-1034. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1745-9125.2003.tb01012.x>
- 111 Ingram, J. R., Paoline, E. A. III., & Terrill, W. (2013). A multilevel framework for understanding police culture: The role of the workgroup. *Criminology*, 51(2), 365-397. <https://doi.org/10.1111/1745-9125.12009>
- 112 Terrill, W., Paoline, E. A. III., & Manning, P. K. (2006). Police culture and coercion. *Criminology*, 41(4), 1003-1034. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1745-9125.2003.tb01012.x>
- Paoline, E. A. III., & Terrill, W. (2005). The impact of police culture on traffic stop searches: an analysis of attitudes and behavior. *Policing: An International Journal*, 28(3), 455-472. <https://doi.org/10.1108/13639510510614555>
- Hickman, M. J. (2008). On the context of police cynicism and problem behavior. *Applied Psychology in Criminal Justice*, 4(1), 1-44. <http://www.apcj.org/journal/index.php?mode=view&item=35>
- 113 Ingram, J. R., Terrill, W., & Paoline, E. A. III. (2018). Police culture and officer behavior: Application of a multilevel framework. *Criminology*, 56(4), 780-811. <https://doi.org/10.1111/1745-9125.12192>
- McCluskey, J. D., Terrill, W., & Paoline, E. A. III. (2006). Peer group aggressiveness and the use of coercion in police-suspect encounters. *Police Practice and Research*, 6(1), 19-37. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1561426050046954>
- Paoline, E. A. III., Terrill, W., & Somers, L. J. (2021). Police officer use of force mindset and street-level behavior. *Police Quarterly*, 24(4), 547-577. <https://doi.org/10.1177/10986111211025523>
- 114 Paoline, E. A. III., Terrill, W., & Somers, L. J. (2021). Police officer use of force mindset and street-level behavior. *Police Quarterly*, 24(4), 547-577. <https://doi.org/10.1177/10986111211025523>
- 115 Engel, R. S., & Worden, R. E. (2006). Police officers’ attitudes, behavior, and supervisory influences: An analysis of problem solving. *Criminology*, 41(1), 131-166. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1745-9125.2003.tb00984.x>
- 116 Stoughton, S. W. (2016). Principled policing: Warrior cops and guardian officers. *Wake Forest Law Review*, 51(3), 611-676. https://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract_id=2830642

tolerance for problematic policing behaviors.^{117;118;119;120} When police engage in warrior-type strategies (i.e., aggressively pursuing stopping cars, conducting pedestrian stops, running license plates)¹²¹, it can negatively impact trust and legitimacy in communities of color.^{122;123;124} The preoccupation with officer safety and the danger of police work fuels a warrior mentality and an us-against-them police culture; this shapes how officers behave on the job and can contribute to inequalities in treatment and impact.¹²⁵ This mentality is often reinforced by storytelling within law enforcement agencies and sharing narratives emphasizing violence and risk, officer harm, and death (sometimes referred to as survivability discourse).¹²⁶ On the other hand, the guardian mindset upholds democratic principles of policing, prioritizes the protection of all community members, builds public engagement, increases trust, and promotes collaboration. Essential attributes of the guardian mindset include respect for human dignity and rights, fairness, empathy, patience, inclusivity, and introspection.^{127;128;129} Although the warrior and guardian are

distinct mindsets, they can be seen as part of a spectrum that varies over time and situational context. Officers may embrace warrior and guardian approaches depending on their activities and circumstances.^{130;131} Law enforcement agencies are more likely to reward officers for warrior strategies than guardian ones.¹³²

IMPLICIT (UNCONSCIOUS) BIAS EXISTS IN ALL INDIVIDUALS AND HAS IMPLICATIONS FOR POLICING

Unconscious biases can create implicit preferences that result in skewed treatment toward people of color and other historically marginalized groups.¹³³ For instance, officers may be more likely to conduct a vehicle search during a traffic stop if the driver's race differs from theirs.¹³⁴ Stereotypes also exist that associate people of color, particularly Black individuals, with aggression, criminality, and weapon possession.¹³⁵ These stereotypes have implications for officer decision-making, such as in the decision

-
- 117 Kraska, P. B. (2007). Militarization and policing — Its relevance to 21st century police. *Policing: A Journal of Policy and Practice*, 1(4), 501-513. <https://doi.org/10.1093/police/pam065>
- 118 Phillips, S. W. (2014). Myths, militarism and the police patrol rifle. *Policing and Society*, 26(2), 185-196. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10439463.2014.922088>
- 119 Rahr, S., & Rice, S. K. (2015). From warriors to guardians: Recommitting American police culture to democratic ideals. *New Perspectives in Policing Bulletin*. <https://www.ojp.gov/pdffiles1/nij/248654.pdf>
- 120 Stoughton, S. W. (2016). Principled policing: Warrior cops and guardian officers. *Wake Forest Law Review*, 51(3), 611-676. https://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract_id=2830642
- 121 Ingram, J. R., Terrill, W., & Paoline, E. A. III. (2018). Police culture and officer behavior: Application of a multilevel framework. *Criminology*, 56(4), 780-811. <https://doi.org/10.1111/1745-9125.12192>
- 122 Braga, A. A., Brunson, R. K., & Drakulich, K. M. (2019). Race, place, and effective policing. *Annual Review of Sociology*, 45(1), 535-555. <https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev-soc-073018-022541>
- 123 Brunson, R. K., & Miller, J. (2006). Gender, race, and urban policing: The experience of African American youths. *Gender & Society*, 20(4), 531-552. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0891243206287727>
- 124 Kochel, T. R. (2017). Explaining racial differences in Ferguson's impact on local residents' trust and perceived legitimacy: Policy implications for police. *Criminal Justice Policy Review*, 30(3), 374-405. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0887403416684923>
- 125 Sierra-Arévalo, M. (2021). American policing and the danger imperative. *Law & Society Review*, 55(1), 70-103. <https://doi.org/10.1111/lasr.12526>
- 126 Kurtz, D. L., & Upton, L. (2017). War stories and occupying soldiers: A narrative approach to understanding police culture and community conflict. *Critical Criminology*, 25(4), 539-558. <https://link.springer.com/article/10.1007/s10612-017-9369-4>
- 127 McLean, K., Wolfe, S. E., Rojek, J., Alpert, G. P., & Smith, M. R. (2018). Police officers as warriors or guardians: Empirical reality of intriguing rhetoric? *Justice Quarterly*, 37(6), 1096-1118. <https://doi.org/10.1080/07418825.2018.1533031>
- 128 Rahr, S., & Rice, S. K. (2015). From warriors to guardians: Recommitting American police culture to democratic ideals. *New Perspectives in Policing Bulletin*. <https://www.ojp.gov/pdffiles1/nij/248654.pdf>
- 129 Stoughton, S. W. (2016). Principled policing: Warrior cops and guardian officers. *Wake Forest Law Review*, 51(3), 611-676. https://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract_id=2830642
- 130 Clifton, S., Torres, J., & Hawdon, J. (2021). Examining guardian and warrior orientations across racial and ethnic lines. *Journal of Police and Criminal Psychology*, 36(3), 436-449. <https://link.springer.com/article/10.1007/s11896-020-09427-6>
- 131 McLean, K., Wolfe, S. E., Rojek, J., Alpert, G. P., & Smith, M. R. (2018). Police officers as warriors or guardians: Empirical reality or intriguing rhetoric? *Justice Quarterly*, 37(6), 1096-1118. <https://doi.org/10.1080/07418825.2018.1533031>
- 132 Sierra-Arévalo, M. (2019). The commemoration of death, organizational memory, and police culture. *Criminology*, 57(4), 632-658. <https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.1111/1745-9125.12224>
- 133 Jost, J. T., Rudman, L. A., Blair, I. V., Carney, D. R., Dasgupta, N., Glaser, J., & Hardin, C. D. (2009). The existence of implicit bias is beyond reasonable doubt: A refutation of ideological and methodological objections and executive summary of ten studies that no manager should ignore. *Research in Organizational Behavior*, 29, 39-69. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.riob.2009.10.001>
- 134 Antonovics, K., & Knight, B. G. (2009). A new look at racial profiling: Evidence from the Boston Police Department. *The Review of Economics and Statistics*, 91(1), 163-177. <https://doi.org/10.1162/rest.91.1.163>
- 135 Correll, J., Park, B., Judd, C. M., & Wittenbrink, B. (2002). The police officer's dilemma: Using ethnicity to disambiguate potentially threatening individuals. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, 83(6), 1314-1329. <https://doi.org/10.1037/0022-3514.83.6.1314>
- Eberhardt, J. L., Goff, P. A., Purdie, V. J., & Davies, P. G. (2004). Seeing Black: Race, crime, and visual processing. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, 87(6), 876-893. <https://psycnet.apa.org/fulltext/2004-21339-010.html>

to use force, including deadly force.¹³⁶

MEASURING IMPLICIT BIAS IS CHALLENGING, AND EVIDENCE LINKING IMPLICIT BIAS AND DISCRIMINATORY BEHAVIOR IS LIMITED

Research on how to measure implicit bias has produced considerable debate. One of the most recognized, used, and critiqued tools for measuring implicit bias is the Implicit Association Test (IAT). When combined, the IAT and self-reported attitudinal measures may partially, but not entirely, explain certain officer behaviors.¹³⁷ However, using the test to identify individuals more or less likely to discriminate can yield high error rates since the evidence supporting the link between implicit bias as measured by the IAT and actual individual-level discriminatory behavior is weak.¹³⁸

STRATEGIES CAN IMPROVE COGNITIVE CONTROLS THAT REDUCE BIAS IN DECISION-MAKING

Training and external factors can reduce biased decision-making. Practice and repetition with use of force scenarios and perceived consequences for making errors can reduce racial disparities in shooting simulations.¹³⁹ Cognitive controls are essential for reducing reliance on heuristics for decision-making. For instance,

one study found that White police officers experiencing sleep deprivation had lower levels of anti-Black bias, but anti-Black bias persisted independently of sleep deprivation.¹⁴⁰

IMPLICIT BIAS TRAINING CAN IMPROVE AWARENESS OF BIASES BUT HAS NOT BEEN SHOWN TO CHANGE BEHAVIORS

Implicit bias training can change implicit associations but has produced weak results and does not consistently change behavior. The types of interventions that are most effective at changing implicit associations focus on associating sets of concepts, using goals or motivations, and relying on cognitive resources. Still, even the most successful training has short-term effects, often lasting only a few days.¹⁴¹ Implicit bias training in policing has similar limitations. Trainings designed to mitigate implicit biases can improve officer knowledge and understanding of the science of bias. However, these trainings have shown limited effects on attitudes about discriminatory or prejudiced behavior and no impact on reducing actual racial disparities in enforcement outcomes.¹⁴² It is important to note that many law enforcement agencies rely on training such as implicit bias or fair and impartial policing training to reduce individual biases. Nevertheless, because of weak or non-existent relationships between implicit bias training and behavioral change, it may be more beneficial to focus on reducing the impact of implicit bias on behavior rather

- 136 Fachner, G., & Carter, S. (2015). An assessment of deadly force in the Philadelphia Police Department. *Collaborative Reform Initiative*. <https://cops.usdoj.gov/RIC/Publications/cops-w0753-pub.pdf>
- Correll, J., Park, B., Judd, C. M., Wittenbrink, B., Sadler, M. S., & Keesee, T. (2007). Across the thin blue line: Police officers and racial bias in the decision to shoot. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, 92(6), 1006-1023. <https://psycnet.apa.org/fulltext/2007-07951-004.html>
- James, L., James, S. M., & Vila, B. J. (2016). The reverse racism effect: Are cops more hesitant to shoot Black than White suspects? *Criminology & Public Policy*, 15(2), 457-479. <https://doi.org/10.1111/1745-9133.12187>
- Peruche, B. M., & Plant, E. A. (2010). The correlates of law enforcement officers' automatic and controlled race-based responses to criminal suspects. *Basic and Applied Social Psychology*, 28(2), 193-199. https://doi.org/10.1207/s15324834basps2802_9
- 137 Greenwald, A. G., Poehlman, T. A., Uhlmann, E. L., & Banaji, M. R. (2009). Understanding and using the Implicit Association Test: III. Meta-analysis of predictive validity. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, 97(1), 17-41. <https://psycnet.apa.org/fulltext/2009-08950-006.html>
- 138 Greenwald, A. G., Banaji, M. R., & Nosek, B. A. (2015). Statistically small effects of the Implicit Association Test can have societally large effects. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, 108(4), 553-561. <https://psycnet.apa.org/fulltext/2014-48911-001.html>
- Oswald, F. L., Mitchell, G., Blanton, H., Jaccard, J., & Tetlock, P. E. (2013). Predicting ethnic and racial discrimination: A meta-analysis of IAT criterion studies. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, 105(2), 171-192. <https://psycnet.apa.org/fulltext/2013-20587-001.html>
- 139 Plant, E. A., Peruche, B. M., & Butz, D. A. (2005). Eliminating automatic racial bias: Making race non-diagnostic for responses to criminal suspects. *Journal of Experimental Social Psychology*, 41(2), 141-156. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jesp.2004.07.004>
- James, L., Vila, B., & Daratha, K. (2013). Results from experimental trials testing participant responses to White, Hispanic and Black suspects in high-fidelity deadly force judgment and decision-making simulations. *Journal of Experimental Criminology*, 9(2), 189-212. <https://link.springer.com/article/10.1007/s11292-012-9163-y>
- 140 James, L. (2017). The stability of implicit racial bias in police officers. *Police Quarterly*, 21(1), 30-52. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1098611117732974>
- Ma, D. S., Correll, J., Wittenbrink, B., Bar-Anan, Y., Sriram, N., & Nosek, B. A. (2013). When fatigue turns deadly: The association between fatigue and racial bias in the decision to shoot. *Basic and Applied Social Psychology*, 35(6), 515-524. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01973533.2013.840630>
- Johnson, D. J., Stepan, M. E., Cesario, J., & Fenn, K. M. (2020). Sleep deprivation and racial bias in the decision to shoot: A diffusion model analysis. *Social Psychology and Personality Science*, 12(5), 638-647. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1948550620932723>
- 141 Forscher, P. S., Lai, C. K., Axt, J. R., Ebersole, C. R., Herman, M., Devine, P. G., & Nosek, B. A. (2019). A meta-analysis of procedures to change implicit measures. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, 117(3), 522-559. <https://psycnet.apa.org/fulltext/2019-31306-001.html>
- 142 Worden, R. E., McLean, S. J., Engel, R. S., Cochran, H., Corsaro, N., Reynolds, D., Najdowski, C. J., & Isaza, G. T. (2020). *The Impacts of Implicit Bias Awareness Training in the NYPD*. International Association of Chiefs of Police (IACP)/University of Cincinnati (UC) Center for Police Research and Policy. <https://www.theiacp.org/sites/default/files/Research%20Center/NYPD%20Implicit%20Bias%20Report.pdf>

than reducing the bias itself.¹⁴³ Further, changing organizational and social environments may impact attitude change more than trying to change personal biases.¹⁴⁴ For example, organizational policies and procedures designed to increase equity will impact all kinds of bias, including implicit bias.

PROCEDURALLY JUST POLICING CAN REDUCE POLICE VIOLENCE AND IMPROVE THE RESPECTFUL TREATMENT OF COMMUNITY MEMBERS

Procedurally just policing has been closely linked with improved perceptions of legitimacy and cooperation from the public.¹⁴⁵ The four principles of procedural justice include fairness of the process and outcomes, transparency and openness, voice and representation, and neutrality.¹⁴⁶ Recent research suggests that procedurally just models can improve officer behavior, enhance community engagement, and reduce arrests and uses of force.¹⁴⁷ Fairness and respect in policing, however, must be modeled from the inside out. Internally, procedurally just models of leadership and supervision (referred to as organizational justice) have positively impacted external police behaviors and trust in the public.¹⁴⁸

ACTIVE BYSTANDERSHIP TRAINING MAY HELP TO POSITIVELY IMPACT POLICING CULTURE AND ORGANIZATIONS

In policing, the concept of “active bystandership”¹⁴⁹ empowers officers to intervene strategically in the actions of fellow officers, regardless of rank. This peer-to-peer intervention aims to prevent misconduct and other unlawful activities, mitigate harmful and potentially costly mistakes, promote a culture of officer health and wellness, and enhance community safety while nurturing rapport and relationships.¹⁵⁰ Officers trained in active bystandership report a greater likelihood to confront or intervene with their peers on policy violations or excessive use of force; officers also reported enhanced awareness or ability to recognize signs of distress in their coworkers.¹⁵¹ More research on whether promoting active bystandership among officers translates into behavior change by officers in the field is needed.

RACIST HUMOR CAN DEHUMANIZE AND FOSTER TOLERANCE OF RACISM, DISCRIMINATION, AND ABUSE

Although law enforcement agencies may prohibit racist discourse through policy and law, it may continue to exist within organizational subgroups. Racist humor dehumanizes people and fosters tolerance of racism, discrimination, and abuse. Referred

- 143 FitzGerald, C., Martin, A., Berner, D., & Hurst, S. (2019). Interventions designed to reduce implicit prejudices and implicit stereotypes in real world contexts: A systematic review. *BMC Psychology*, 7(29), 1-12. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s40359-019-0299-7>
- 144 Vuletich, H. A., & Payne, B. K. (2019). Stability and change in implicit bias. *Psychological Science*, 30(6), 854-862. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0956797619844270>
- 145 Tyler, T. R., & Fagan, J. (2008). Legitimacy and cooperation: Why do people help the police fight crime in their communities. *Ohio State Journal of Criminal Law*, 6(1), 231-276. https://kb.osu.edu/bitstream/handle/1811/73064/1/OJCL_V6N1_231.pdf
- 146 Tyler, T. R. (2004). Enhancing police legitimacy. *Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science*, 593(1), 84-99. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0002716203262627>
- Hollander-Blumoff, R. & Tyler, T. R. (2008). Procedural justice in negotiation: Procedural fairness, outcome acceptance, and integrative potential, *Law & Social Inquiry* 33(2), 473-500. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1747-4469.2008.00110.x>
- <https://law.yale.edu/justice-collaboratory/procedural-justice>
- <https://trustandjustice.org/resources/intervention/procedural-justice>
- 147 Weisburd, D., Telep, C. W., Vovak, H., Zastrow, T., Braga, A. A., & Turchan, B. (2022). Reforming the police through procedural justice training: A multicity randomized trial at crime hot spots. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences*, 119(14). Advance online publication. <https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.2118780119>
- Owens, E., Weisburd, D., Amendola, K. L., & Alpert, G. P. (2018). Can you build a better cop? Experimental evidence of supervision, training, and policing in the community. *Criminology & Public Policy*, 17(1), 41-87. <https://doi.org/10.1111/1745-9133.12337>
- Wood, G., Tyler, T. R., & Papachristos, A. V. (2020). Procedural justice training reduces police use of force and complaints against officers. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences*, 117(18), 9815-9821. <https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1920671111>
- 148 Carr, J. D., & Royo Maxwell, S. (2018). Police officers' perceptions of organizational justice and their trust in the public, *Police Practice and Research*, 19(4), 365-379. <https://doi.org/10.1080/15614263.2017.1387784>
- Sun, I. Y., Wu, Y., van Maarten, C., Kuen-lung Hsu, K. (2018). Internal procedural justice, moral alignment, and external procedural justice in democratic policing. *Police Quarterly*, 27(3), 387-412. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1098611118772270>
- Hass, N. E., van Maarten, C., Skogan, W. G., & Fleitas, D. M. (2015). Explaining officer compliance: The importance of procedural justice and trust inside a police organization. *Criminology & Criminal Justice*, 15(4), 443-463. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1748895814566288>
- Schafer, J. A. (2013). The role of trust and transparency in the pursuit of procedural and organizational justice. *Journal of Policing, Intelligence, and Counter Terrorism*, 8(2), 131-143. <https://doi.org/10.1080/18335330.2013.821738>
- 149 Staub, E. (2018). Preventing violence and promoting active bystandership and peace: My life in research and applications. *Peace and Conflict: Journal of Peace Psychology*, 24(1), 95-111. <https://doi.org/10.1037/pac0000301>
- 150 <https://www.law.georgetown.edu/cics/able/>
- 151 Taniguchi, T., Vovak, H., Corder, G., Amendola, K., Yang, Y., Hoogesteyn, K., & Bartness, M. (2022). The impact of active bystander training on officer confidence and ability to address ethical challenges. *Policing: A Journal of Policy and Practice*. Advance online publication. <https://doi.org/10.1093/policing/paac034>

to by some as “racist blue humor,” it may be intended as “joking,” but it degrades racial, ethnic, and other minorities.¹⁵²

THE IMPACT OF HIGHER EDUCATION ON POLICE BEHAVIOR IS MIXED

The impact of higher education on individual officer behavior is mixed, although there appears to be more agreement on two key points. First, research suggests that higher education is associated with less authoritarian attitudes and greater cognitive flexibility.¹⁵³ The effects of college education on orientation toward authoritarianism are divided along gender and racial lines, as well as the amount of college education (e.g., freshman versus senior students).¹⁵⁴ Some research has shown that higher education among police officers reduces use of force but does not appear to alter arrest and search activity.¹⁵⁵ Research has also shown that college-educated officers receive fewer public complaints than officers with a high school diploma.¹⁵⁶

STRESS AND TRAUMA IN POLICING ARE WIDESPREAD AND HARMFUL

Law enforcement officers engage in challenging work with

multiple stressors that put them at risk for physical and psychological harm.¹⁵⁷ The stress and trauma faced on the job can lead to maladaptive coping mechanisms, compassion fatigue, post-traumatic stress disorder, depression, burnout, and adverse health outcomes, all of which impact job performance.¹⁵⁸ Historically, there has been a stigma in law enforcement associated with using mental health and social support services, which may limit its ability to effect improvements in officer health.¹⁵⁹

STRESS AND TRAUMA HAS SPILLOVER EFFECTS ON PARTNERS AND FAMILIES

Police work is challenging and stressful.¹⁶⁰ Negative aspects of the job can impact physical and psychological wellbeing and work performance and contribute to maladaptive coping patterns and burnout.¹⁶¹ At home, this work stress translates to family stress, such as unsatisfactory marriages, spending time away, being uninvolved, and negativity or anger.¹⁶² Some researchers suggest that institutions should extend employee assistance and counseling programs to family members, enhance positive coping strategies for officers, and incorporate information on

- 152 Pérez, R., & Ward, G. (2019). From insult to estrangement and injury: The violence of racist police jokes. *American Behavioral Scientist*, 63(13), 1810-1829. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0002764219842617>
- 153 Guller, I.B. (1972). Higher education and policemen: Attitudinal difference between freshman and senior police college students. *Journal of Criminal Law, Criminology, and Police Science*, 63(3), 396-401. <https://scholarlycommons.law.northwestern.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=5803&context=jclc>
- Telep, C. (2011). The impact of higher education police officer attitudes regarding abuse of authority. *Journal of Criminal Justice Education*, 22(3), 392-419. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10511253.2010.519893>
- 154 Owen, S., & Wagner, K. (2008). The specter of authoritarianism among criminal justice majors. *Journal of Criminal Justice Education*, 19(1), 30-53. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10511250801892748>
- Boyles, C. & Dempsey, K. B. (2020). The specter of authoritarianism among criminal justice majors at outreach centers: Do university outreach efforts breed right-wing authoritarianism? *Journal of Criminal Justice Education*, 31(2), 208-231. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10511253.2019.1692882>
- 155 Rydberg, J. & Terrill, W. (2010). The effect of higher education on police behavior. *Police Quarterly*, 13(1), 92-120. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1098611109357325>
- Terrill, W., & Mastrofski, S. D. (2002). Situational and officer-based determinants of police coercion. *Justice Quarterly*, 19(2), 215-248. <https://doi.org/10.1080/07418820200095221>
- 156 Manis, J., Archbold, C. A., & Hassell, K. (2008). Exploring the impact of police officer education level on allegations of police misconduct. *International Journal of Police Science & Management*, 10(4), 509-523. <https://doi.org/10.1350/ijps.2008.10.4.102>
- 157 Cohen, I. M., McCormick, A. V., & Rich, B. (2019). Creating a culture of police officer wellness. *Policing: A Journal of Policy and Practice*, 13(2), 213-229. <https://doi.org/10.1093/police/paz001>
- 158 Tuttle, B. M., Blumberg, D. M., & Papazoglou, K. (2019). Critical challenges to police officer wellness. *Oxford Research Encyclopedia of Criminology and Criminal Justice* (pp. 1-27). Oxford. <https://doi.org/10.1093/acrefore/9780190264079.013.538>
- Velazquez, E., & Hernandez, M. (2019). Effects of police officer exposure to traumatic experiences and recognizing the stigma associated with police officer mental health: A state-of-the-art review. *Policing: An International Journal*, 42(4), 711-724. <https://doi.org/10.1108/PIJPSM-09-2018-0147>
- Mumford, E. A., Taylor, B. G., & Kubu, B. (2014). Law enforcement officer safety and wellness. *Police Quarterly*, 18(2), 111-133. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1098611114559037>
- 159 Corrigan, P. (2004). How stigma interferes with mental health care. *The American Psychologist*, 59(7), 614-625. <https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/15491256/>
- Karaffa, K. M., & Tochkov, K. (2013). Attitudes toward seeking mental health treatment among law enforcement officers. *Applied Psychology in Criminal Justice*, 9(2), 75-99. <https://psycnet.apa.org/record/2014-10928-001>
- 160 Abdollahi, M. K. (2002). Understanding police stress research. *Journal of Forensic Psychology Practice*, 2(2), 1-24. https://doi.org/10.1300/J158v02n02_01
- 161 Velazquez, E., & Hernandez, M. (2019). Effects of police officer exposure to traumatic experiences and recognizing the stigma associated with police officer mental health: A state-of-the-art review. *Policing: An International Journal*, 42(4), 711-724. <https://doi.org/10.1108/PIJPSM-09-2018-0147>
- 162 Mikkelsen, A., & Burke, R. L. (2004). Work-family concerns of Norwegian police officers: Antecedents and consequences. *International Journal of Stress Management*, 11(4), 429-444. <https://doi.org/10.1037/1072-5245.11.4.429>
- Burke, R. L. (1993). Work-family stress, conflict, coping, and burnout in police officers. *Stress Medicine*, 9(3), 171-180. <https://doi.org/10.1002/smi.2460090308>
- Jackson, S. E., & Maslach, C. (1982). After effects of job-related stress: Families as victims. *Journal of Occupational Behavior*, 3(1), 63-77. <https://doi.org/10.1002/job.4030030106>

the work-family interface during orientation and training. Family support groups can also help mitigate isolation. Offering newly hired officers family member orientations may help prepare family members for the realities of policing and set more realistic expectations of police work.¹⁶³ Supporting law enforcement families can help buffer the effects of toxic stress on individual officers.¹⁶⁴

THERE IS LIMITED EVIDENCE FOR THE EFFECTIVENESS OF SPECIFIC WELLNESS INTERVENTIONS

Wellness interventions are relatively new, and to date, there is weak evidence of their impact on stress-related outcomes.¹⁶⁵ Advocates suggest that law organizations should create a culture of wellness rather than offering specific interventions, such as employee assistance programs or critical incident stress debriefing of wellness. Key components associated with a wellness culture include transformational leadership, employee engagement, and organizational justice.¹⁶⁶

PUBLIC OPINION SUPPORTS POLICE REFORM

Communities have grown increasingly critical of the police over recent years. Black youth and adults voice the lowest levels of trust and confidence in the police¹⁶⁷, and in 2020 the gap in confidence between White and Black adults was the largest ever recorded.¹⁶⁸ There has been broad recognition that not all racial and ethnic groups are treated fairly or equally.¹⁶⁹ There

has also been public support for critical reforms in policing. For instance, over 70% of respondents support banning chokeholds, prohibiting racial profiling, mandating body-worn cameras, de-escalation training, enforcing duty to intervene policies, creating a national registry of misconduct, training to counter implicit bias, and mandating that police shootings be investigated by an independent authority.¹⁷⁰ Despite these calls for reform, the most recent evidence suggests that calls to defund the police have little public support. Data from 2021 indicate that 47% of people would support increasing police funding; only 15% would support decreasing funding.¹⁷¹

COUNCIL RECOMMENDATIONS ►

RECOMMENDATION 17

ASSESS ORGANIZATIONAL CULTURE AND INCLUDE COMMUNITY PERSPECTIVE

The organizational and operational culture of law enforcement agencies must be assessed, and community perspectives should be incorporated, redefining what the culture should be for their community. This should be done through a structured review of agency goals, data and outcomes, officer and leadership perspectives, and organizational climate.

- 163 Mikkelsen, A., & Burke, R. L. (2004). Work-family concerns of Norwegian police officers: Antecedents and consequences. *International Journal of Stress Management*, 11(4), 429-444. <https://doi.org/10.1037/1072-5245.11.4.429>
- Jackson, S. E., & Maslach, C. (1982). After effects of job-related stress: Families as victims. *Journal of Occupational Behavior*, 3(1), 63-77. <https://doi.org/10.1002/job.4030030106>
- Finn, P., & Tomz, J. E. (1997). *Developing a law enforcement stress program for officers and their families*. National Institute of Justice: Issues and Practices in Criminal Justice. <https://www.ojp.gov/pdffiles/163175.pdf>
- 164 Patterson, G. T. (2003). Examining the effects of coping and social support on work and life stress among police officers. *Journal of Criminal Justice*, 31(3), 215-226. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0047-2352\(03\)00003-5](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0047-2352(03)00003-5)
- 165 Patterson, G. T., Chung, I. W., & Swan, P. G. (2012). The effects of stress management interventions among police officers and recruits. *Campbell Systematic Reviews*, 8(1), 1-54. <https://doi.org/10.4073/csr.2012.7>
- 166 Rubim, F., Rubim, L., & Thornton, A. R. (2020). Creating a culture of wellness. In K. Papazoglou & D. M. Blumberg (Eds.), *Power: Police Officer Wellness, Ethics, and Resilience* (pp. 171-187). Academic Press. <https://doi.org/10.1016/B978-0-12-817872-0.00010-0>
- Cohen, I. M., McCormick, A. V., & Rich, B. (2019). Creating a culture of police officer wellness. *Policing: A Journal of Policy and Practice*, 13(2), 213-229. <https://doi.org/10.1093/policing/paz001>
- 167 <https://www.dataforprogress.org/blog/2020/6/9/younger-voters-do-not-trust-the-police-support-an-end-to-qualified-immunity>
- <https://news.gallup.com/poll/352304/black-confidence-police-recovers-2020-low.aspx>
- 168 <https://news.gallup.com/poll/317114/black-white-adults-confidence-diverges-police.aspx>
- 169 <https://www.pewresearch.org/fact-tank/2020/06/03/10-things-we-know-about-race-and-policing-in-the-u-s/>
- 170 <https://www.filesforprogress.org/datasets/2021/4/dfp-vox-police-reform.pdf>
- <https://www.ipsos.com/en-us/news-polls/usa-today-crime-and-safety-2021>
- <https://www.publicconsultation.org/wp-content/uploads/2020/07/PoliceReformReport0720.pdf>
- 171 <https://www.pewresearch.org/fact-tank/2021/10/26/growing-share-of-americans-say-they-want-more-spending-on-police-in-their-area/>

RECOMMENDATION 18

PROMOTE A CULTURE OF COMMUNITY SAFETY AND SERVICE

Law enforcement agencies should move away from an aggressive, control-oriented model of policing and towards a culture of community safety and service. This will require a review of community needs and the goals, policies, strategies, and performance metrics within each agency to ensure alignment with a safety and service model.

RECOMMENDATION 19

TRAINING AND CERTIFICATION STANDARDS SHOULD SUPPORT A CULTURE OF SAFETY AND SERVICE

State training and certification requirements for new and current officers (including in-service training and continuing education) should be re-examined to ensure an emphasis on community safety and a spirit of service.

RECOMMENDATION 20

CONDUCT RESEARCH ON POLICE CULTURE AND STRATEGIES TO CHANGE CULTURE

Research must be conducted on police culture, how it influences operations and outcomes, and how it can be changed. This research should identify all the elements of police culture and determine how to prioritize their implementation.

RECOMMENDATION 21

RESEARCH THE ROLE OF IMPLICIT AND EXPLICIT BIAS IN DECISION-MAKING

Research regarding implicit and explicit biases that exist in policing should (1) measure officer and leadership biases, (2) understand the role it plays in decision-making, and (3) determine how to mitigate its influence on policing outcomes, including police legitimacy.

RECOMMENDATION 22

IMPROVE LEGITIMACY THROUGH PROCEDURAL JUSTICE

Improve police legitimacy within communities by implementing procedural justice training and other practices emphasizing fairness and respectfulness principles.

RECOMMENDATION 23

EXPAND TUITION REIMBURSEMENT PROGRAMS

College education has been shown to reduce use of force, expanding college reimbursement programs to help hire the best officers and further their educational and promotional advancement.

RECOMMENDATION 24

PROMOTE A CULTURE OF WELLNESS FOR OFFICERS

Comprehensive policies and practices should be adopted to promote a culture of officer wellness, including mandatory mental health days and non-punitive assessments. Assessments should promote officers' physical, mental, and emotional health and wellness, which is an essential component of fair and equitable policing.

RECOMMENDATION 25

CREATE A CULTURE OF ACTIVE BYSTANDERSHIP

A culture that encourages early intervention and active bystandership and protects them against retaliation must be created. This will require strong anti-retaliation practices beyond the current legal minimum duty to intervene rules, regulations and laws, and include specific training on active bystandership that both improve police-community relations and ensures the health and safety of officers.

RECOMMENDATION 26

SUPPORT OFFICER FAMILIES

Police officers and their families must be supported by policies that meet inherent policing challenges, such as shift work and risks, and help establish and maintain healthy family relationships.

DATA COLLECTION, ANALYSIS, AND REPORTING

THE PROBLEM ►

Law enforcement in the United States is decentralized, with more than 18,000 law enforcement agencies at the federal, state, and local levels reporting to different governmental structures or democratically elected.¹⁷² Due to this decentralized model, understanding what law enforcement agencies do, how they do it, and how it impacts public safety is challenging. This challenge is exacerbated by data collection, analysis, and reporting processes that vary across jurisdictions and by federal data collection systems with highly variable reporting by agencies and states. This prevents assessments of policing across agencies, at the regional, or national level. The public is left without any reliable way to know what the state of policing is, what is going well, and where there needs improvement. Data collection, analysis, and reporting inconsistencies also hamper policing reform planning and evaluation and limits understanding of racial and other disparities.

WHAT WE KNOW ►

DATA TRANSPARENCY IS A GROWING FOCUS FOR THE GOVERNMENT

The Open Government Directive of the Obama administration¹⁷³ propelled government agencies to maintain and provide public access to government data and establish mechanisms through

which public feedback can be collected and used to evaluate and improve government performance. The President's Task Force on 21st Century Policing¹⁷⁴ recommended that law enforcement agencies develop a climate of openness, specifically that law enforcement agencies should increase transparency by collecting and sharing critical data, policies, and procedures with the public. Some agencies publish data on their website or build their own open data portal. Some agencies participate in open data programs such as the Police Data Initiative, which encourages data sharing to foster a culture of transparency and accountability. More than 120 law enforcement agencies from across the U.S. have voluntarily participated in the program.¹⁷⁵

THERE IS AN INCREASING DEMAND FOR IMPROVED, CONSISTENT, AND TRANSPARENT DATA COLLECTION

The challenges associated with collecting criminal justice data have long been recognized. Much of this responsibility has fallen on non-government entities such as universities, researchers, and non-profit organizations. Establishing national trends in policing has been particularly challenging because it can require extensive data collection and manual standardization efforts.¹⁷⁶ This often requires requesting data from individual agencies through state or federal open records laws. These challenges have led to several private non-governmental attempts to collect more complete data.¹⁷⁷ In an effort to better describe police transparency, Vera developed the Police Data Transparency Index.¹⁷⁸ The Policing Project at New York University's School of Law has developed guidelines for sharing data and transparency.¹⁷⁹ Some of the highest-profile efforts have been around improving data collection on use of force and

172 Reaves, B. (2011). *Census of State and Local Law Enforcement Agencies, 2008*. Washington, DC: U.S. Department of Justice.

173 See obamawhitehouse.archives.gov/open

174 Office of Community Oriented Policing Services. (2015). *Final Report of the President's Task Force on 21st Century Policing*. Washington, DC: Office of Community Oriented Policing Services.

175 Police Data Initiative. (n.d.). Retrieved July 2022, from www.policedatainitiative.org

176 For one example of the challenges of collecting police activity data, see Mummolo, J. (2018, August 23), What I Learned by Studying Militarized Policing. *The Atlantic*. www.theatlantic.com/ideas/archive/2018/08/where-is-the-data-on-police-behavior/568258/

177 See for example the Washington Post's Police Shooting Database (www.washingtonpost.com/graphics/investigations/police-shootings-database/) or the Fatal Encounter dataset (fatalencounters.org/).

178 policetransparency.vera.org

179 www.policingproject.org/transparency-framework

use of deadly force.

DATA STANDARDIZATION IS CRITICAL FOR UNDERSTANDING LOCAL AND NATIONAL TRENDS AND CHANGES OVER TIME

Despite advancements in technology and data systems, the state of knowledge regarding policing and other criminal justice systems is extremely limited. Data still tend to be siloed, challenging to link over time, and poorly standardized across jurisdictions. In assessing this problem, a study by Arnold Ventures recommended that the federal government should develop a National Commission on Criminal Justice Data Modernization. This commission would be responsible for building a roadmap for federal and state governments to improve data quality and collection, creating metrics for reporting on agency transparency, and increasing Bureau of Justice Statistics funding to improve data collection and timely dissemination of findings.¹⁸⁰

POLICE OPEN DATA EFFORTS HAVE GREATLY CONTRIBUTED TO THE ADVANCEMENT OF RESEARCH AND IMPROVEMENT OF PRACTICES

Openly published public safety datasets have been used to study a variety of policing and crime issues, such as predictors and

dynamics of crime¹⁸¹, crime concentration^{182;183}, racial disparities in traffic stops^{184;185}, police use of force¹⁸⁶, stop and frisk¹⁸⁷, officer decision making and discretion in traffic stops and arrests¹⁸⁸, and de-policing effect following Ferguson¹⁸⁹, among others.

DATA IS LIKELY TO END UP IN THE PUBLIC VIEW

In the absence of open data regulations and compliance, the public, researchers, non-profit organizations, and others have engaged in efforts to compile and publish critical data. For instance, the Washington Post compiles data on officer-involved fatal shootings across the United States.¹⁹⁰ The National Police Misconduct Reporting Project and PoliceMisconduct.net collected data on police misconduct using media reports.¹⁹¹ Researchers also collected data on officers arrested for misconduct using Google News search.¹⁹²

TRANSPARENCY CAN BENEFIT POLICE-COMMUNITY RELATIONS

High-profile actions of transparency and accountability can lead to increased trust in police, although this may differ depending on the race of community members.¹⁹³ Another study found that being informed of police performance data affects the public's trust significantly; the effect was contingent on whether the performance was positive and the community's predisposition to the police.¹⁹⁴

-
- 180 Buck, S. (2021, April 15). We Need Criminal Justice Data That Doesn't Exist. Here's How the Biden Administration Can Fix It. *Arnold Ventures*. www.arnoldventures.org/stories/we-need-criminal-justice-data-that-doesnt-exist-heres-how-the-biden-administration-can-fix-it
- 181 Zhang, Y., Siriaraya, P., Kawai, Y., & Jatowt, A. (2020). Analysis of street crime predictors in web open data. *Journal of Intelligent Information Systems*, 55(3), 535-559.
- 182 Almanie, T., Mirza, R., & Lor, E. (2015). Crime prediction based on crime types and using spatial and temporal criminal hotspots. *International Journal of Data Mining & Knowledge Management Process*, 5(4).
- 183 Belesiotis, A., Papadakis, G., & Skoutas, D. (2018). Analyzing and predicting spatial crime distribution using crowdsourced and open data. *ACM Transactions on Spatial Algorithms and Systems (TSAS)*, 3(4), 1-31.
- 184 Pierson, E., Simoiu, C., Overgoor, J., Corbett-Davies, S., Jenson, D., Shoemaker, A., ... & Goel, S. (2020). A large-scale analysis of racial disparities in police stops across the United States. *Nature Human Behaviour*, 4(7), 736-745.
- 185 Rivera, R., & Rosenbaum, J. (2020). Racial disparities in police stops in US cities. *Significance*, 17(4), 4-5.
- 186 Fryer, R. G. (2016). *An empirical analysis of racial differences in police use of force* (No. w22399). National Bureau of Economic Research.
- 187 Khan, M. R., Kapadia, F., Geller, A., Mazumdar, M., Scheidell, J. D., Krause, K. D., ... & Halkitis, P. N. (2021). Racial and ethnic disparities in "stop-and-frisk" experience among young sexual minority men in New York City. *PLoS One*, 16(8), e0256201.
- 188 Zhang, Y., & Zhang, L. (2021). Racial characteristics of areas and police decisions to arrest in traffic stops: multilevel analysis of contextual racial effects. *Policing: An International Journal*.
- 189 Shjarback, J. A., Pyrooz, D. C., Wolfe, S. E., & Decker, S. H. (2017). De-policing and crime in the wake of Ferguson: Racialized changes in the quantity and quality of policing among Missouri police departments. *Journal of Criminal Justice*, 50, 42-52.
- 190 <https://www.washingtonpost.com/graphics/investigations/police-shootings-database/>
- 191 <https://web.archive.loc.gov/all/20181031010432/>
<https://www.unlawfulshield.com/2018/07/what-happened-to-policemisconduct-net/>
- 192 Stinson, P. M., Liederbach, J., Brewer, S. L., & Todak, N. E. (2014). Drink, drive, go to jail? A study of police officers arrested for drunk driving. *Journal of Crime and Justice*, 37(3), 356-376.
- 193 Kochel, T. R., & Skogan, W. G. (2021). Accountability and transparency as levers to promote public trust and police legitimacy: findings from a natural experiment. *Policing: An International Journal of Police Strategies and Management*, 44(6), 1046-1059.
- 194 Mason, D., Hillenbrand, C., & Money, K. (2014). Are informed citizens more trusting? Transparency of performance data and trust towards a British police force. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 122(2), 321-341.

COUNCIL RECOMMENDATIONS ►

RECOMMENDATION 27

DEVELOP A DATA COLLECTION, ANALYSIS, AND DISSEMINATION PLAN

To increase transparency, a comprehensive plan should be developed for collecting, analyzing, and disseminating data, at the incident level, on traffic stops, pedestrian stops, crime incidents, arrests, use of force events, and community complaints. The plan, with input from the community, should include:

- » **Performance measures:** Agency-wide and unit-specific performance measures that consider input from the community, elected officials, and others.
- » **Data collection:** A data collection plan that addresses key performance measures and specifies who will collect data, how data should be stored, and what quality assurance measures will be performed.
- » **Data sharing:** Data sharing plan that includes what data will be shared, with whom, and at what cadence. The plan should also include mechanisms for maintaining the privacy of individuals and adherence to privacy laws.
- » **Data analysis:** Data should be analyzed periodically to assess performance and identify ineffective or potentially problematic practices and the most effective and promising practices. The results of these analyses, along with supporting data, should be made publicly available in plain language.

RECOMMENDATION 28

MAXIMIZE THE VALUE OF DATA BY ENSURING ITS CONSISTENCY

To maximize the understanding of regional, state, and national public safety as well as policing trends, data must be in a consistent format. Funding partners and researchers to make data consistent and unifying and merging data sets to allow comparison with other data sources will help maximize the value of policing data.

RECOMMENDATION 29

DESIGN AND IMPLEMENT DATA COLLECTION SYSTEMS AND PROCESSES

Data collection and analysis capacity must be prioritized and funded to achieve the transparency that the public desires.

RECOMMENDATION 30

ISSUE ANNUAL REPORTS ON ACTIVITIES AND IMPACTS

Every law enforcement agency should issue an annual report and include data on key activities, traffic and pedestrian stops and arrests, and document any impact and outcomes, including disparate impacts to the community. The report should describe actions taken to address disparities and be included with all funding requests.

RECOMMENDATION 31

PARTICIPATE IN FEDERAL DATA COLLECTION EFFORTS

Wherever possible, agencies should voluntarily send data to federal data collection systems designed to better inform law enforcement agencies and communities and offer critical, comprehensive, and data-driven evidence to improve the effectiveness and transparency of policing activities. For example, the Federal Bureau of Investigation (FBI) collects voluntarily reported data on officer use of force and the Bureau of Justice Statistics (BJS) periodically collects data on law enforcement agency structure and activity.

FINES AND FEES

THE PROBLEM ►

Police enforcement actions can result in fines or fees as determined by state and local law. Though fines and fees may be preferred alternatives to incarceration, studies have shown that monetary penalties disproportionately impact the economically disadvantaged and racial and ethnic minorities. Monetary fines are often compounded with fees and additional penalties (e.g., late payment), adding significantly to the overall cost of resolving the original sanction. More importantly, non-payment may have considerable collateral consequences, including owing more money (e.g., penalties), extended probation, suspension of driving privileges, warrants for arrest, incarceration, and restrictions on other rights (e.g., loss of voting privileges or loss of occupational licenses).

Law enforcement agencies are responsible for enforcing laws (many of which include financial sanctions) and the consequences of failure to comply with sanctions. Police are typically not responsible for collecting court-imposed fines and fees. They are, however, required to execute arrest warrants, thereby indirectly engaging in the enforcement of financial sanctions imposed by courts. Compounding fines and fees can result in increased criminal justice system involvement and undermine economic stability for the most vulnerable people. Placing police at the center of enforcing financial sanctions can erode the relationship between police and the communities they serve.

WHAT WE KNOW ►

FINES AND FEES ARE ROUTINELY IMPOSED ON PEOPLE THROUGHOUT THE CRIMINAL JUSTICE SYSTEM

While fines are typically meant to be punitive and deter future unlawful behaviors, fees are imposed solely to offset costs and generate revenue for the government. Failure to make timely payments can lead to additional financial penalties, driver's license suspension, private collection, warrants for arrest, incarceration, and other sanctions. These practices are ubiquitous in the criminal justice system across states.

FINES AND FEES HAVE A RACIALLY DISPROPORTIONATE IMPACT

Although there is no national data on this issue, numerous examinations of local jurisdictions suggest that racial and ethnic minorities are overrepresented among people who face sanctions for failure to comply.¹⁹⁵ Blacks are over-represented among individuals who do not have the financial means to comply with monetary sanctions. For these individuals, legal and financial obligations and subsequent sanctions intensify and prolong their involvement with the criminal justice system.¹⁹⁶

USING TRAFFIC ENFORCEMENT FINES TO GENERATE REVENUE CREATES RACIAL DISPARITIES

When properly applied, fines can deter driving violations and improve roadway safety.¹⁹⁷ However, governments, especially smaller municipal governments, are more likely to use traffic fines to generate revenue rather than to directly improve

195 FFJC (n.d.). First Steps Toward More Equitable Fines and Fees Practices: Policy Guidance on Ability-to-Pay Assessments, Payment 1 Plans, and Community Service. Fines and Fees Justice Center. https://finesandfeesjusticecenter.org/content/uploads/2020/11/FFJC_Policy_Guidance_Ability_to_Pay_Payment_Plan_Community_Service_Final_2.pdf

196 Shannon, S., Huebner, B. M., Harris, A., Martin, K., Patillo, M., Pettit, B., ... & Uggen, C. (2020). The broad scope and variation of monetary sanctions: Evidence from eight states. *UCLA Criminal Justice Law Review*, 4(1).

197 Bar-Ilan, A., & Sacerdote, B. (2004). The response of criminals and noncriminals to fines. *The Journal of Law and Economics*, 47(1), 1-17; Killias, M., Villettaz, P., & Nunweiler-Hardegger, S. (2016). Higher fines—fewer traffic offences? a multi-site observational study. *European Journal on Criminal Policy and Research*, 22(4), 619-634.

roadway safety.¹⁹⁸ Using traffic enforcement to generate revenue can create a racially disparate impact; in one study, increases in traffic fines were more frequent in low-income places with predominant Hispanic residents or counties with more travelers and visitors.¹⁹⁹

FINES AND FEES MAY IMPAIR PUBLIC SAFETY AND CONTRIBUTE TO RECIDIVISM, ESPECIALLY AMONG THOSE WHO ARE HEAVILY INVOLVED IN THE CRIMINAL JUSTICE SYSTEM OR LACK LEGITIMATE MEANS TO PAY COURT-IMPOSED DEBTS

- » **Fines and fees can hinder reentry.** For example, fees associated with phone calls from an incarcerated person are a barrier to maintaining family connections, which disproportionately affects Black and low-income individuals and can reduce the likelihood of successful reentry.²⁰⁰
- » **Fines and fees could lead to new crimes.** One survey of individuals, most of whom were already involved in the justice system in some way, found that 38% of individuals admitted to committing at least one crime to pay off their court debt. Among those who only owed fines for traffic offenses, about one in five admitted to committing a more serious crime to help them pay their debt.²⁰¹ More research is needed to examine this unintended consequence.
- » **Time spent collecting fines and fees may result in reduced clearance rates.** One study found that for every 1% increase in a municipality's revenue generated from fines and fees (i.e., traffic tickets), there was a 6.1% decrease in clearing violent crime cases (in smaller agencies) and an 8.3% decrease in clearing property crime cases (clearance rates).²⁰²

DEBT-BASED LICENSE SUSPENSION HAS AN INCONSISTENT DETERRENT EFFECT ON COMPLIANCE AND LEADS TO ADDITIONAL ADVERSE OUTCOMES

Failure to pay (FTP) a traffic ticket or other fines and fees are a leading reason for driver's license suspension in the United States.²⁰³ The efficacy of license suspension in increasing compliance and preventing future traffic violations has been linked to drivers' race and the socio-economic status of where they live. Financial penalties and FTP suspensions reduce the probability of receiving a subsequent ticket for White drivers. However, among Black drivers, financial penalties had no effect on future traffic citations, and FTP suspensions increased the probability of receiving a second ticket by 6—9%. This disparity does not appear to be caused by differences in behavioral actions by racial groups – both White and Black drivers made behavioral adjustments to minimize the probability of future tickets. This evidence suggests that supposedly racially neutral policies can still result in racially disparate outcomes. Some researchers argue that FTP suspensions should be removed from the driver's record once the financial obligations are met or eliminate FTP suspensions altogether.²⁰⁴ Debt-based suspensions can lead to lost income, financial instability, and mental and physical health consequences.²⁰⁵ An analysis of budget data from jurisdictions in Washington State suggests that fines and fees account for just over 0.3% of the state's total revenue.²⁰⁶

JURISDICTIONS EMPLOY A VARIETY OF STRATEGIES TO MITIGATE OR PROVIDE ALTERNATIVES TO FINES AND FEES

- » **Behavioral nudges.** There is some evidence that the negative impact of fines and fees can be mitigated by small behavioral nudges. For example, one study redesigned the summons form and provided text message reminders to

198 Mughan, S. (2021). Municipal reliance on fine and fee revenues: How local courts contribute to extractive revenue practices in US cities. *Public Budgeting & Finance*, 41(2), 22-44; Su, M. (2021). Discretion in traffic stops: the influence of budget cuts on traffic citations. *Public Administration Review*, 81(3), 446-458.

199 Su, M. (2020). Taxation by citation? Exploring local governments' revenue motive for traffic fines. *Public Administration Review*, 80(1), 36-45.

200 CEO. (2021). The impact of criminal court and prison fines and fees in Philadelphia. City of Philadelphia. <https://www.phila.gov/media/20210505004207/FinesandFees-final.pdf>

201 Alabama Appleseed Center for Law and Justice. (2020). Economic Injustice. Fines and fees hurt people, undermine public safety, and drive Alabama's racial wealth divide. Alabama Appleseed Center for Law and Justice. <https://www.alabamaappleseed.org/fines-fees/>

202 Goldstein, R., Sances, M. W., & You, H. Y. (2020). Exploitative revenues, law enforcement, and the quality of government service. *Urban Affairs Review*, 56(1), 5-31.

203 Borbon, M. (2021, April 27). New ACLU Report Finds Debt-Based Driver's License Suspension Laws Impose Harm and Waste Resources. ACLU. <https://www.aclu.org/news/criminal-law-reform/new-aclu-report-finds-debt-based-drivers-license-suspension-laws-impose-harm-and-waste-resources/>; Mughan, S., & Carroll, J. (2021). Escaping the long arm of the law? Racial disparities in the effect of drivers' license suspensions on offense probabilities. *Southern Economic Journal*, 87(4), 1366-1389.

204 Mughan and Corroll (2020)

205 Borbon, M. (2021, April 27). New ACLU Report Finds Debt-Based Driver's License Suspension Laws Impose Harm and Waste Resources. ACLU. <https://www.aclu.org/news/criminal-law-reform/new-aclu-report-finds-debt-based-drivers-license-suspension-laws-impose-harm-and-waste-resources/>

206 Rafael, M. (2021). The High Price of Using Justice Fines and Fees to Fund Government in Washington State. Vera Center on Sentencing + Corrections. <https://www.vera.org/downloads/publications/the-high-price-of-using-justice-fines-and-fees-washington.pdf>

people with outstanding warrants. Those changes reduced failure to appear by 13–21% and resulted in 30,000 fewer arrest warrants over a 3-year period.²⁰⁷

- » **Ability-to-pay determinations.** Fines can be better matched to the ability to pay using online evidence-based scoring systems. Some view this as an efficient step that courts can take to make the use of fines as sanctions fairer and more effective while waiting for larger legislative reforms.²⁰⁸
- » **Flexible payment plans.** Flexibility with payment options allows people to pay fines over time while minimizing additional penalties and fees.
- » **Community service.** Community service is the most common alternative to financial sanctions, though there are no national standards for determining the fines-to-community-service conversion. Notably, the use of community service can create challenges by taking time away from employment or family demands. In some states, community service hours are assigned a standard wage equivalent value, which is used to “pay” financial sanctions. For example, in 2020, California raised its conversion rate to double the minimum wage, so that every hour of service corresponds to two hours in “wages” towards paying fines.²⁰⁹
- » **Education and workforce development.** Some jurisdictions use educational classes or skills courses in place of financial penalties and are exploring remote-learning technology to satisfy this requirement.
- » **Substance and alcohol abuse programs or mental health counseling.** People may be assigned to substance or mental health treatment as an alternative to financial sanctions.

COUNCIL RECOMMENDATIONS ►

RECOMMENDATION 32

DO NOT USE LAW ENFORCEMENT TO COLLECT FINES AND FEES

Law enforcement officers should not be assigned to collect fines and fees imposed by statutes and implemented by the criminal justice system. The current practice has a disparate impact on the economically disadvantaged and racial and ethnic minorities, threatens police-community relationships, and undermines more public safety goals.

207 Fishbane, A., Ouss, A., & Shah, A. K. (2020). Behavioral nudges reduce failure to appear for court. *Science*, 370(6517), eabb6591. <https://doi.org/doi:10.1126/science.abb6591>

208 O’Neil, M. M., & Prescott, J. J. (2019). Targeting poverty in the courts: Improving the measurement of ability to pay. *Law & Contemporary Problems*, 82, 199. <https://scholarship.law.duke.edu/lcp/vol82/iss1/9>

209 Menyard, Y., Ume, C., DeWolf, E., & Daly, R. (2020). Price of Justice: Challenging the Future of Fines and Fees. Center for Court Innovation. https://www.courtinnovation.org/sites/default/files/media/documents/2020-11/Guide_POJ_09302020.pdf

RECOMMENDATION 33

DECOUPLE LAW ENFORCEMENT AGENCY BUDGETS FROM FINES

Law enforcement agency budgets should never be tied to revenue generated through law enforcement activity. When a law enforcement agency derives a substantial portion of its operating budget from fines associated with traffic stops and other minor violations, it can encourage policing practices focused on generating revenue rather than enhancing public safety and forming positive police-community relationships.

RECOMMENDATION 34

DO NOT USE LAW ENFORCEMENT TO SERVE WARRANTS FOR UNPAID FINES AND FEES

Warrants for non-criminal matters, including unpaid fines and fees or failure to appear at traffic hearings, should not be served by officers. This practice adds to community tension and mistrust, particularly among people with the least means to pay and the most to lose.

RECOMMENDATION 35

REDUCE THE HARM OF FINES AND FEES

The impact of fines and fees should be reduced using evidence-based strategies to determine individuals’ ability to pay, flexible payment plans, fine-to-work conversions, education and workforce development, and substance and alcohol counseling in place of monetary sanctions.

RECOMMENDATION 36

IMPLEMENT STRATEGIES TO REDUCE NON-PAYMENT OF FINES AND FEES

Evidenced-based strategies should be adopted to increase compliance with court orders and reduce the need for fines, fees, and other sanctions. Small behavioral nudges, such as text-message reminders, can reduce non-compliance with court orders and warrant-amnesty events can help people address outstanding warrants for low-level offenses.

MENTAL HEALTH & SUBSTANCE ABUSE

THE PROBLEM ►

The criminal justice system is ill-equipped to provide the services and treatment needed for those suffering from mental illness and addiction. Yet, in the vast majority of communities in the United States, law enforcement is the only option for initial response to individuals in crisis. Officers often have few options or resources to resolve these situations other than resorting to formal criminal justice sanctions, including taking these individuals into custody where they are unlikely to receive the appropriate treatment for their health issues.

Contacts between police officers and persons with perceived mental illness (PwPMI) pose significant challenges. Surveys suggest that a substantial proportion of officers feel they lack the skills and training or were not qualified to handle calls involving PwPMI.^{210,211} At the same time, some research shows that calls involving mental health-related circumstances account for a disproportionate share of use of force events.²¹² About one in four people suffering from mental health problems have a history of arrest.²¹³ Poorly handled police-community contacts involving PwPMI can lead to negative public sentiment, unnecessary hospital visits, repeated contact with the criminal justice system (criminalization of an illness), ineffective treatment, and inefficient use of limited police resources. Law enforcement interactions with PwPMI are compounded by broader social challenges such as the stigma associated with mental illness and substance abuse, a lack of social safety nets for people in crisis, and limited access to mental health or drug-abuse treatment services. These limitations often force law enforcement to be the

primary, and in many places only, government resource available to people experiencing a crisis.

Similarly, law enforcement encounters with individuals experiencing substance use disorders also pose significant challenges. Substance use is very common among people who become involved in the criminal justice system.^{214,215} However, access to drug treatment services, both for the public at large and for justice-involved individuals, is extremely limited. For example, approximately 50% of state prisoners meet the criteria for a diagnosis of drug use, but only about 10% reported receiving any kind of drug treatment.²¹⁶ Only 9% of individuals with co-occurring mental health and substance use disorders receive both mental health care and substance use treatment.²¹⁷

Overall, diverting individuals with mental health and substance use disorders from the criminal justice system to community or corrections treatment services is a significant and urgent issue in the United States.

WHAT WE KNOW ►

PEOPLE WITH SUBSTANCE USE DISORDERS ARE OVER-REPRESENTED IN THE CRIMINAL JUSTICE SYSTEM

Research shows that the prevalence of drug use among arrestees varies by sample, location, and timeframe²¹⁸, but systematic studies have found that over 60% of arrestees tested positive or

- 210 Ruiz, J., & Miller, C. (2004). An exploratory study of Pennsylvania police officers' perceptions of dangerousness and their ability to manage persons with mental illness. *Police quarterly*, 7(3), 359-371. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1098611103258957>
- 211 Wells, W., & Schafer, J. A. (2006). Officer perceptions of police responses to persons with a mental illness. *Policing: An International Journal of Police Strategies & Management*, 29(4), 578-601. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1108/13639510610711556>
- 212 Yang, S. M., Gill, C., Kanewski, L. C., & Thompson, P. S. (2018). Exploring police response to mental health calls in a nonurban area: A case study of Roanoke County, Virginia. *Victims & Offenders*, 13(8), 1132-1152. <https://doi.org/10.1080/15564886.2018.1512540>
- 213 James, D. J., & Glaze, L. E. (2006). *Mental health problems of prison and jail inmates*. U.S. Department of Justice. <https://bjs.ojp.gov/content/pub/pdf/mhppji.pdf>
- 214 Belenko, S., Hiller, M., & Hamilton, L. (2013). Treating substance use disorders in the criminal justice system. *Current Psychiatry Reports*, 15(11), 1-11.
- 215 Office of National Drug Control Policy. ADAM II: 2012 annual report. Washington, DC: The White House; 2013.
- 216 Zarkin, G. A., Cowell, A. J., Hicks, K. A., Mills, M. J., Belenko, S., Dunlap, L. J., & Keyes, V. (2015). Lifetime benefits and costs of diverting substance-abusing offenders from state prison. *Crime & Delinquency*, 61(6), 829-850.
- 217 Han, B., Compton, W. M., Blanco, C., & Colpe, L. J. (2017). Prevalence, treatment, and unmet treatment needs of US adults with mental health and substance use disorders. *Health Affairs*, 36(10), 1739-1747.
- 218 Lattimore, P. K., Steffey, D. M., Gfroerer, J., Bose, J., Pemberton, M. R., & Penne, M. A. (2014). Arrestee Substance Use: Comparison of Estimates from the National Survey on Drug Use and Health and the Arrestee Drug Abuse Monitoring Program. In *CBHSQ Data Review*. Substance Abuse and Mental Health Services Administration (US).

were estimated to have recently used at least one illicit drug.²¹⁹

EVIDENCE INDICATES CONSIDERABLE COOCCURRENCE OF MENTAL ILLNESS AND SUBSTANCE USE DISORDERS

The National Institute on Drug Abuse estimated that of the 42.1 million adults with mental illness, about 18% also had a substance use disorder.²²⁰ The comorbidity rate is considerably higher among justice-involved individuals. About half of male detainees with a severe mental disorder also tested positive for drug use at arrest,²²¹ and almost three-quarters of female jail detainees with severe mental disorders also met the criteria for at least one substance use disorder.²²²

A SMALL PERCENTAGE OF LAW ENFORCEMENT CALLS FOR SERVICE INVOLVE PWPMI

Contrary to popular belief, research suggests that just over 1% of total law enforcement calls for service involve PwPMI.^{223;224;225} This research, however, may be undercounting PwPMI-involved events because mental health issues tend not to be reliably recorded in law enforcement agency records.²²⁶ Despite the fact that PwPMI-involved calls are a small percentage of overall agency activity, they tend to disproportionately involve young males²²⁷ and are more likely to end in negative outcomes such as a use of force.²²⁸

NO CONSENSUS EXISTS ON WHETHER CRISIS RESPONSES SHOULD BE HANDLED PRIMARILY BY LAW ENFORCEMENT OR INDEPENDENT HEALTH SERVICES

Crisis response programs include police-led models that prepare officers to respond to persons in crises (e.g., the Crisis Intervention Team (CIT) model) and co-responder programs that rely on active collaboration between police and mental health professionals. Police and health providers generally hold positive but mixed perceptions of co-responder teams. Despite concerns over roles and responsibilities, police generally held positive opinions of co-responder programs and believed these programs helped people obtain necessary health services²²⁹ while acknowledging having to address potential safety issues of having unarmed civilian responders present during potentially dangerous situations. At the same time, mental health providers voiced concern that some events might be more effectively handled with mental health professionals alone.²³⁰

CONSIDERABLE CHALLENGES EXIST IN EFFECTIVELY RESPONDING TO PERSONS WITH MENTAL HEALTH AND SUBSTANCE USE DISORDERS

Many communities lack programs to provide a non-policing alternative or co-responder model, wherein mental health professionals assist the police during incidents involving persons in crisis. Although some research has been conducted in larger urban jurisdictions, less is known about the use of these models

- 219 Brecht, M. L., Anglin, M. D., & Lu, T. H. (2003). *Estimating drug use prevalence among arrestees using ADAM data: An application of a logistic regression synthetic estimation procedure*. US Department of Justice, Office of Justice Programs, National Institute of Justice. <https://www.ojp.gov/pdffiles1/nij/grants/198829.pdf>
- 220 National Institute on Drug Abuse. (2018, August 15). *Comorbidity: Substance Use and Other Mental Disorders* [Infographic]. National Institute on Drug Abuse. <https://nida.nih.gov/research-topics/trends-statistics/infographics/comorbidity-substance-use-other-mental-disorders>
- 221 Abram, K. M., & Teplin, L. A. (1991). Co-occurring disorders among mentally ill jail detainees: implications for public policy. *American Psychologist*, 46(10), 1036
- 222 Abram, K. M., Teplin, L. A., & McClelland, G. M. (2003). Comorbidity of severe psychiatric disorders and substance use disorders among women in jail. *American Journal of Psychiatry*, 160(5), 1007-1010.
- 223 Lum, C., Koper, C. S., & Wu, X. (2021). Can we really defund the police? A nine-agency study of police response to calls for service. *Police Quarterly*. Advance online publication. <https://doi.org/10.1177/10986112111035002>
- 224 Yang, S. M., Gill, C., Kanewske, L. C., & Thompson, P. S. (2018). Exploring police response to mental health calls in a nonurban area: A case study of Roanoke County, Virginia. *Victims & Offenders*, 13(8), 1132-1152. <https://doi.org/10.1080/15564886.2018.1512540>
- 225 Livingston, J. D. (2016). Contact between the police and people with mental disorders: A review of rates. *Psychiatric Services*, 67(8), 850-857. <https://doi.org/10.1176/appi.ps.201500312>
- 226 Koziarski, J., Ferguson, L., & Huey, L. (2022). Shedding Light on the Dark Figure of Police Mental Health Calls for Service. *Policing: A Journal of Policy and Practice*. Advance online publication. <https://doi.org/10.1093/police/paac006>
- 227 Evans Cuellar, A., Snowden, L. M., & Ewing, T. (2007). Criminal records of persons served in public mental health system. *Psychiatric Services*, 58(1), 114-120. <https://doi.org/10.1176/ps.2007.58.1.114>
- 228 Morabito, M. S., Kerr, A. N., Watson, A., Draine, J., Ottai, V., & Angell, B. (2012). Crisis intervention teams and people with mental illness: Exploring the factors that influence the use of force. *Crime & Delinquency*, 58(1), 57-77. <https://doi.org/10.1177/001128710372456>
- 229 <https://www.newsobserver.com/news/local/crime/article257454503.html>
- 230 Watson, A. C., Compton, M. T., & Pope, L. G. (2019). *Crisis response services for people with mental illnesses or intellectual and developmental disabilities: A review of the literature on police-based and other first response models*. Vera Institute. <https://www.vera.org/downloads/publications/crisis-response-services-for-people-with-mental-illnesses-or-intellectual-and-developmental-disabilities.pdf>

in smaller, suburban, and rural communities. A 2021 survey conducted by the National Policing Institute found that smaller and rural communities struggle with personnel, training, and community-based resource limitations for implementing such strategies, particularly those that depend on community-based organizations and treatment services.²³¹ Further, more rigorous evaluations are needed to better understand the impact of alternative or co-responder models on outcomes, including arrest, injury, use of force, subsequent criminal justice contacts, and long-term mental health outcomes.²³²

CRISIS RESPONSE PROGRAMS ARE LIMITED BY RESOURCE AVAILABILITY

Diversion – or directing people from the criminal justice system and into health services – might not be feasible without a substantial investment of resources. Most co-responder or community-based crisis response programs have limited availability and do not operate full-time.²³³ In many nonurban and rural jurisdictions, community-based or specialized resources for dealing with PwPMI are often limited, leaving the police to respond to those experiencing crisis.²³⁴ Even in communities with sufficient mental health resources, people of color experience more barriers to resources and poorer outcomes than their White peers.²³⁵

MOBILE CRISIS TEAMS FACE OPERATIONAL CHALLENGES

As a non-police response mechanism, mobile crisis teams (MCTs) are housed within the mental health system and consist of mental health professionals who respond to behavioral health crisis calls in the community. Several early evaluations suggested that MCTs can increase community-based service use, reduce hospital-based mental health service use, and link people to community-based care after an emergency department admission.^{236,237} The primary downside of MCTs is limited capacity and a long response time.²³⁸ MCTs implemented in various cities still involve police collaboration to some extent, and therefore their efficacy as a non-police response mechanism remains limited.²³⁹

CO-RESPONDER TEAMS SHOW PROMISE IN ADDRESSING CALLS INVOLVING PWPMI

Overall evidence suggests that co-responder teams are effective in reducing criminal justice involvement for PwPMI.^{240,241} Studies have found that co-responder teams: 1) better connect clients to mental health services, 2) reduce the number of hospital transports and admissions, and 3) increase the likelihood of individuals remaining in the community, as opposed to being transferred to emergency departments or jails.^{242,243} However, evidence to support co-responding teams' impact on the number of arrests, detentions, or the prevalence of repeat contact among

-
- 231 Davis, R., Lebron, M., & Reuland, M. (2021). *How small law enforcement agencies respond to calls involving persons in crisis? Results from a national survey*. National Police Foundation. <https://www.policefoundation.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/01/Small-Agencies-Crisis-Response-Survey-020120214-1.pdf>
- 232 Rogers, M. S., McNeil, D. E., & Binder, R. L. (2019). Effectiveness of police crisis intervention training programs. *Journal of American Academy of Psychiatry and the Law*, 47(4), 1-8. <https://doi.org/10.29158/JAAPL.003863-19>
- 233 Puntis, S., Perfect, D., Kirubarajan, A., Bolton, S., Davies, F., Hayes, A., Harriss, E., & Molodynski, A. (2018). A systematic review of co-responder models of mental health 'street' triage. *BMC Psychiatry*, 18(256), 1-11. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s12888-018-1836-2>
- 234 Westervelt, E. (2020, September 5). *Mental health and police violence: How crisis intervention teams are failing*. NPR. <https://www.npr.org/2020/09/18/913229469/mental-health-and-police-violence-how-crisis-intervention-teams-are-failing>
- 235 Alegria, M., Zhen-Duan, J., Shaheen O'Malley, I., & DiMarzio, K., (2022). A new agenda for optimizing investments in community mental health and reducing disparities. *American Journal of Psychiatry*, 179(6), 402-416. <https://doi.org/10.1176/appi.ajp.21100970>
- 236 Scott, R. L. (2000). Evaluation of a mobile crisis program: Effectiveness, efficiency, and consumer satisfaction. *Psychiatric Services*, 51(9), 1153-1156. <https://doi.org/10.1176/appi.ps.51.9.1153>
- 237 Zealberg, J. J., Santos, A. B., & Fisher, R. K. (1993). Benefits of mobile crisis programs. *Hospital & Community Psychiatry*, 44(1), 16-17. <https://doi.org/10.1176/ps.44.1.16>
- 238 IACP and University of Cincinnati Center for Police Research and Policy. (n.d.). Assessing the impact of mobile crisis teams: A review of research. <https://www.theiacp.org/sites/default/files/IDD/Review%20of%20Mobile%20Crisis%20Team%20Evaluations.pdf>
- 239 Isselbacher, J. (2020, July 29). As mobile mental health teams work to de-escalate crises, some warn their models still rely on police partnerships. Stat News. <https://www.statnews.com/2020/07/29/mobile-crisis-mental-health-police/>
- 240 Kisely, S., Campbell, L. A., Peddle, S., Hare, S., Pyche, M., Spicer, D., & Moore, B. (2010). A controlled before-and-after evaluation of a mobile crisis partnership between mental health and police services in Nova Scotia. *Canadian Journal of Psychiatry*, 55(10), 662-668. <https://doi.org/10.1177/070674371005501005>
- 241 Dempsey, C., Quanbeck, C., Bush, C., & Kruger, K. (2019). Decriminalizing mental illness: Specialized policing responses. *CNS Spectrums*, 25(2), 181-195. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S1092852919001640>
- 242 Watson, A. C., Compton, M. T., & Pope, L. G. (2019). *Crisis response services for people with mental illnesses or intellectual and developmental disabilities: A review of the literature on police-based and other first response models*. Vera Institute. <https://www.vera.org/downloads/publications/crisis-response-services-for-people-with-mental-illnesses-or-intellectual-and-developmental-disabilities.pdf>
- 243 Abramson, A. (2021, July 1). Building mental health into emergency responses: More cities are pairing mental health professionals with the police to better help people in crisis. <https://www.apa.org/monitor/2021/07/emergency-responses>

clients remains limited.²⁴⁴

CRISIS INTERVENTION TRAINING (CIT) MAY IMPROVE POLICE RESPONSE BUT MORE RESEARCH IS NEEDED

CIT for officers can improve their knowledge and disposition toward de-escalation²⁴⁵ and may increase the use of referrals to community services.²⁴⁶ Outcomes such as arrests, use of force, and injuries, are difficult to ascertain; the evidence on these outcomes is less conclusive. A meta-analysis of seven evaluations found that CIT did not impact arrest, use of force, and injuries. Still, there has also been considerable variation across CIT implementations which limits the ability to make direct comparisons.²⁴⁷ Cost savings associated with CIT depend on a variety of characteristics (e.g., hospital admissions, arrests, and other outcomes) and on the timeline considered (i.e., short-versus long-term gain).

CRISIS RESPONSE PROGRAMS CAN HELP STANDARDIZE OFFICER DECISION-MAKING AND REDUCE DISPARITIES

Police response to persons in an acute mental health crisis has raised concern about the lack of standardization, oversight, and documentation that goes along with field-based decision-making. Because officer discretion is a key component of the decision-making process, their response could be influenced by personal beliefs, stigma, and bias related to mental illness, a person's history of substance use, and race and ethnicity. Crisis response programs can help standardize officers' decision-making through training on program standards, agency policy,

and local laws. Because crisis response training improves officer understanding of mental illness and substance use disorders, their decision-making abilities should consequently be improved as well. Some research has found that CIT training is associated with officers' decision to transfer individuals to mental health resources rather than jail.²⁴⁸

CRISIS RESPONSE PROGRAMS CAN BENEFIT PEOPLE WITH MENTAL HEALTH PROBLEMS, BUT SUBSTANCE USE PRESENTS AN ADDED CHALLENGE

Crisis response programs largely focus on individuals with mental health problems. These programs result in increased referrals and linkage to community-based services.²⁴⁹ When a crisis response program includes addressing substance use disorders, it leads to increased use of treatment services²⁵⁰ and hospitalization.^{251,252} Unfortunately, the overall use of treatment services still tends to be low.²⁵³ Recipients of crisis response programs who were re-referred following their initial treatment were more likely to have substance use disorders, indicating more complex needs for the subset of individuals with co-occurring mental and substance use disorders.^{254,255}

DIVERSION PROGRAMS, ESPECIALLY POST-ARREST DIVERSION, CAN BENEFIT INDIVIDUALS WITH SUBSTANCE USE DISORDERS

Research suggests that persons with substance abuse disorder and co-occurring mental illness can be diverted from the criminal justice system with increased access to services,

- 244 Seo, C., Kim, B., & Krus, N. (2021). Variation across police response models for handling encounters with people with mental illnesses: A systematic review and meta-analysis. *Journal of Criminal Justice*, 72, [101752]. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jcrimjus.2020.101752>
- 245 Compton, M. T., Esterberg, M. L., McGee, R., Kotwicki, R. J., & Oliva, J. R. (2006). Crisis intervention team training: Changes in knowledge, attitudes, and stigma related to schizophrenia. *Psychiatric Services*, 57(8), 1199-1202.
- 246 Ritter, C., Teller, J. L., Marcussen, K., Munetz, M. R., & Teasdale, B. (2011). Crisis intervention team officer dispatch, assessment, and disposition: Interactions with individuals with severe mental illness. *International Journal of Law and Psychiatry*, 34(1), 30-38.
- 247 Taheri, S. A. (2016). Do crisis intervention teams reduce arrests and improve officer safety? A systematic review and meta-analysis. *Criminal Justice Policy Review*, 27(1), 76-96. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0887403414556289>
- 248 Ritter, C., Teller, J. L., Marcussen, K., Munetz, M. R., & Teasdale, B. (2011). Crisis intervention team officer dispatch, assessment, and disposition: Interactions with individuals with severe mental illness. *International Journal of Law and Psychiatry*, 34(1), 30-38.
- 249 Compton, M. T., Bakeman, R., Broussard, B., Hankerson-Dyson, D., Husbands, L., Krishan, S., ... & Watson, A. C. (2014). The police-based crisis intervention team (CIT) model: II. Effects on level of force and resolution, referral, and arrest. *Psychiatric Services*, 65(4), 523-529.
- 250 Dyer, W., Steer, M., & Biddle, P. (2015). Mental health street triage. *Policing: A Journal of Policy and Practice*, 9(4), 377-387.
- 251 Broner, N., Lattimore, P. K., Cowell, A. J., & Schlenger, W. E. (2004). Effects of diversion on adults with co occurring mental illness and substance use: Outcomes from a national multi site study. *Behavioral Sciences & the Law*, 22(4), 519-541.
- 252 Min, M. O., Biegel, D. E., & Johnsen, J. A. (2005). Predictors of psychiatric hospitalization for adults with co-occurring substance and mental disorders as compared to adults with mental illness only. *Psychiatric Rehabilitation Journal*, 29(2), 114.
- 253 Broner, N., Lattimore, P. K., Cowell, A. J., & Schlenger, W. E. (2004). Effects of diversion on adults with co occurring mental illness and substance use: Outcomes from a national multi site study. *Behavioral Sciences & the Law*, 22(4), 519-541.
- 254 Min, M. O., Biegel, D. E., & Johnsen, J. A. (2005). Predictors of psychiatric hospitalization for adults with co-occurring substance and mental disorders as compared to adults with mental illness only. *Psychiatric rehabili*
- 255 Dyer, W., Steer, M., & Biddle, P. (2015). Mental health street triage. *Policing: A Journal of Policy and Practice*, 9(4), 377-387.

increased time in the community, and reduced jail days with no additional risk for re-arrest or psychiatric symptoms.^{256;257;258;259}

There is stronger evidence that post-arrest diversion programs can improve criminal justice and drug use outcomes^{260;261}; research on pre-arrest diversion, however, is more limited. One systematic review of diversion programs found that they were less effective for males, frequent drug users, members of racial and ethnic minority groups, and those who had lower educational attainment or lacked social stability.²⁶² Treatment completion can be associated with positive outcomes, but these programs often face challenges in maintaining participant involvement over time.^{263;264} Increasing service linkage and delivery are key to enhancing these deflection and diversion programs.

DIVERTING PEOPLE WITH SUBSTANCE USE DISORDERS AWAY FROM THE CRIMINAL JUSTICE SYSTEM CAN PRODUCE COST SAVINGS, BUT THE COST OF COMMUNITY-BASED TREATMENT REMAINS A CHALLENGE

Studies suggest that diversion programs that help individuals post-arrest can lead to cost savings, but pre-arrest diversion programs can be associated with higher costs.^{265;266} This is primarily because treatment costs are higher in community-based service programs. Developing affordable, long-term community-based service options is key to improving the efficacy of diversion programs and reducing criminal justice contact for

individuals experiencing substance use disorders.

LITTLE IS KNOWN ABOUT PROGRAMS DESIGNED TO ASSIST PEOPLE EXPERIENCING HOMELESSNESS

According to the National Coalition for the Homeless, 20-25% of the homeless population in the United States experiences some form of severe mental illness.²⁶⁷ Moreover, adults experiencing homelessness and severe mental illness are more likely to come into contact with the criminal justice system.²⁶⁸ Some police agencies have formed homeless outreach teams or specialized units that respond to homelessness-related calls. The units coordinate with shelters, advocates, and other service providers to connect people experiencing homelessness to support services. However, there is a current lack of evaluative studies on the effectiveness of these specialized units for increasing the number of referrals and transports to housing and health services and decreasing arrest rates among the homeless population.²⁶⁹

-
- 256 Broner, N., Lattimore, P. K., Cowell, A. J., & Schlenger, W. E. (2004). Effects of diversion on adults with co occurring mental illness and substance use: Outcomes from a national multi site study. *Behavioral Sciences & the Law*, 22(4), 519-541.
- 257 Harvey, E., Shakeshaft, A., Hetherington, K., Sannibale, C., & Mattick, R. P. (2007). The efficacy of diversion and aftercare strategies for adult drug involved offenders: A summary and methodological review of the outcome literature. *Drug and Alcohol Review*, 26(4), 379-387.
- 258 Min, M. O., Biegel, D. E., & Johnsen, J. A. (2005). Predictors of psychiatric hospitalization for adults with co-occurring substance and mental disorders as compared to adults with mental illness only. *Psychiatric Rehabilitation Journal*, 29(2), 114.
- 259 Steadman, H. J., & Naples, M. (2005). Assessing the effectiveness of jail diversion programs for persons with serious mental illness and co occurring substance use disorders. *Behavioral Sciences & the Law*, 23(2), 163-170.
- 260 Bright, D. A., & Martire, K. A. (2013). Does Coerced Treatment of substance using offenders lead to improvements in substance use and recidivism? A Review of the Treatment Efficacy Literature. *Australian Psychologist*, 48(1), 69-81.
- 261 Hayhurst, K. P., Leitner, M., Davies, L., Millar, T., Jones, A., Flentje, R., ... & Shaw, J. (2019). The effectiveness of diversion programmes for offenders using Class A drugs: a systematic review and meta-analysis. *Drugs: Education, Prevention and Policy*, 26(2), 113-124.
- 262 Lindquist-Grantz, R., Mallow, P., Dean, L., Lydenberg, M., & Chubinski, J. (2021). Diversion Programs for Individuals Who Use Substances: A Review of the Literature. *Journal of Drug Issues*, 51(3), 483-503.
- 263 Broner, N., Lattimore, P. K., Cowell, A. J., & Schlenger, W. E. (2004). Effects of diversion on adults with co occurring mental illness and substance use: Outcomes from a national multi site study. *Behavioral Sciences & the Law*, 22(4), 519-541.
- 264 Lindquist-Grantz, R., Mallow, P., Dean, L., Lydenberg, M., & Chubinski, J. (2021). Diversion Programs for Individuals Who Use Substances: A Review of the Literature. *Journal of Drug Issues*, 51(3), 483-503.
- 265 Cowell, A. J., Broner, N., & Dupont, R. (2004). The cost-effectiveness of criminal justice diversion programs for people with serious mental illness co-occurring with substance abuse: Four case studies. *Journal of Contemporary Criminal Justice*, 20(3), 292-314.
- 266 Zarkin, G. A., Cowell, A. J., Hicks, K. A., Mills, M. J., Belenko, S., Dunlap, L. J., & Keyes, V. (2015). Lifetime benefits and costs of diverting substance-abusing offenders from state prison. *Crime & Delinquency*, 61(6), 829-850.
- 267 National Coalition for the Homeless (NCH). (2009). Mental Illness and Homelessness. <http://www.nationalhomeless.org>
- 268 Roy, L., Crocker, A. G., Nicholls, T. L., Latimer, E. A., & Ayllon, A. R. (2014). Criminal behavior and victimization among homeless individuals with severe mental illness: a systematic review. *Psychiatric Services*, 65(6), 739-750.
- 269 Batko, S., Gillespie, S., Ballard, K., Cunningham, M., Poppe, B., & Metraux, S. (2020). Alternatives to arrests and police responses to homelessness. The Urban Institute.

COUNCIL RECOMMENDATIONS ►

RECOMMENDATION 37

INSTITUTE A PUBLIC HEALTH APPROACH TO SUBSTANCE USE DISORDERS

Non-violent individuals with substance use disorders (SUDs) should be diverted from the criminal justice system to community-based treatment services. Public health approaches, rather than zero-tolerance or single-approach policies, should be used to prevent and reduce substance use disorders within the community.

RECOMMENDATION 38

REMOVE BARRIERS TO TREATMENT

Barriers to obtaining drug-treatment services, such as a lack of services or facilities and being uninsured or underinsured, should be identified and minimized. These barriers are particularly salient for individuals that are frequently in contact with the criminal justice system.

RECOMMENDATION 39

RESEARCH, DESIGN, AND IMPLEMENT ALTERNATIVES TO ARREST

Research is needed on the design, implementation, and evaluation of alternatives to arrest, including pre-arrest deflection, diversion, community views on diversion, SUD treatment, the impact of decriminalization of certain drugs, and how non-arrest interventions impact involvement in the criminal justice system, particularly with respect to any potential racially disparate impact. It is crucial to understand what programs work, how to best implement them, and what barriers prevent successful implementation, including stigma, treatment capacity, funding, and disparities in decision-making by police.

RECOMMENDATION 40

IMPLEMENT AND EVALUATE NON-POLICE CRISIS RESPONSE TEAMS AND CO-RESPONDER PROGRAMS

Local non-police crisis response teams (also referred to as

alternative responders) should respond to persons in crisis, stabilize the situation without relying on the criminal justice system interventions, and connect them to resources and treatment. Research should be conducted on how to build this capacity, particularly outside of urban centers. Where models are currently implemented, research should determine what works and the community conditions that influence effectiveness.

RECOMMENDATION 41

IMPROVE RESPONSES TO PEOPLE EXPERIENCING HOMELESSNESS

Punitive approaches to people experiencing homelessness must be minimized through collaborations by the public and private sectors to identify and fund programs to solve the root causes of homelessness. Research is needed to evaluate the effectiveness of existing programs, such as homeless outreach teams in law enforcement agencies, and to identify best practices, including training protocols, and particularly, which program components are best performed by police officers and which would be better performed by other experts. Data collection, analysis, and sharing must be improved regarding the experiences of individuals experiencing homelessness when they encounter service providers, including law enforcement.

RECOMMENDATION 42

DEVELOP ALTERNATE STRATEGIES FOR ADDRESSING NUISANCE OFFENSES

Low-level offenses, such as illegal vending and panhandling, should be decriminalized, and alternative non-punitive strategies should be developed to address the disparate racial impact of arrest, which forces people into a cycle of monetary damage caused by fines and fees and that can also result in incarceration.

RECOMMENDATION 43

ENSURE OFFICER TRAINING TO ADDRESS SUDS, MENTAL HEALTH CRISES, AND PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES

Recognizing that alternatives to police-response models cannot be implemented immediately or in all places, agencies should implement current best training practices in de-escalation techniques, addressing substance-use disorders, responding to mental health crises, and recognizing and responding to people with physical and developmental disabilities.

PEDESTRIAN STOPS

THE PROBLEM ►

Every year 2.5 million people are subject to pedestrian stops by law enforcement agencies.²⁷⁰ Pedestrian stops include stop-and-search, stop-question-and-frisk (referred to as a Terry stop, from the 1968 United States Supreme Court Case *Terry v. Ohio*), and street stops. Evidence supporting the effectiveness of pedestrian stops to improve public safety outcomes is mixed.²⁷¹ Research consistently demonstrated that law enforcement disproportionality stop racial and ethnic minorities and that extensive use of pedestrian stops can undermine police-community relations.^{272;273;274} Although the U.S. Supreme Court has recognized the constitutionality of Terry stops, it has also created limitations around their use. In *Floyd v. City of New York*, the Court found that the broad use of pedestrian stops may be unconstitutional if used in a way that violates the rights of individuals.²⁷⁵

WHAT WE KNOW ►

EVIDENCE SUGGESTS THAT POLICE STOP INDIVIDUALS OF DIFFERENT RACIAL

GROUPS AT DISPARATE RATES

People of historically marginalized groups (especially African American individuals and people of Hispanic descent) are subjected to pedestrian stops at rates higher than White individuals²⁷⁶ and in disproportionate numbers when accounting for their representation in the population.²⁷⁷ One study examined patterns of stop and frisk data across New York City, New York neighborhoods found that neighborhood racial composition, poverty level, and the extent of social disorganization (e.g., households receiving public assistance, racial diversity) were stronger predictors of pedestrian stops than the neighborhood crime rates. The researchers concluded that the stop and frisk practice effectively was a strategy of “policing poor people in poor places.”²⁷⁸

EVIDENCE OF THE EFFECTIVENESS OF PEDESTRIAN STOPS FOR CRIME CONTROL IS LIMITED

Police-initiated pedestrian stops infrequently lead to arrests, summons, or the seizure of weapons or other contraband.^{279;280} There is limited evidence that stop and frisk helps reduce gun crime.²⁸¹ A 2006 systematic review of directed police patrol interventions (including traffic and pedestrian stops) across high-crime areas in five U.S. cities found that, overall, increased stop and frisk practices resulted in an increase in seizures of illegal guns and reductions of gun crime in the targeted areas.²⁸² However, only one of the cities specifically reported

- 270 Davis, E., Whyde, A., & Langton, L. (2018). Contacts between police and the public, 2015. Bureau of Justice Statistics.
- 271 See Greene, J. R. (2012). Police field stops: What do we know, and what does it mean? In N. La Vigne, P. Lachman, A. Matthews, & S. R. Neusteter (Eds.), *Key Issues in the Police Use of Pedestrian Stops and Searches: Discussion Papers from an Urban Institute Roundtable*. Urban Institute.
- 272 Ferrandino, J. A. (2018). The effectiveness and equity of NYPD stop and frisk policy, 2003–2014. *Journal of Crime and Justice*, 41(2), 119–135.
- 273 Shedd, C. (2012). What about the other 99%? The broader impact of street stops on minority communities. In N. La Vigne, P. Lachman, A. Matthews, & S. R. Neusteter (Eds.), *Key Issues in the Police Use of Pedestrian Stops and Searches: Discussion Papers from an Urban Institute Roundtable*. Urban Institute.
- 274 Tyler, T. R., & McCarthy, G. (2012). The impact of stop and frisk policies upon police legitimacy. In N. La Vigne, P. Lachman, A. Matthews, & S. R. Neusteter (Eds.), *Key Issues in the Police Use of Pedestrian Stops and Searches: Discussion Papers from an Urban Institute Roundtable*. Urban Institute.
- 275 *Floyd v. City of N.Y.* - 959 F. Supp. 2d 540 (S.D.N.Y. 2013)
- 276 Dunn, C., & Shames, M. (2019). *Stop-and-Frisk in the de Blasio Era*. New York Civil Liberties Union (NYCLU).
- 277 Andrew Gelman, Jeffrey Fagan & Alex Kiss (2007). An Analysis of the New York City Police Department’s “Stop-and-Frisk” Policy in the Context of Claims of Racial Bias, *Journal of the American Statistical Association*, 102:479, 813–823, DOI: 10.1198/016214506000001040
- 278 Fagan, J., & Davies, G. (2000). Street stops and broken windows: Terry, race, and disorder in New York City. *Fordham Urban. Law Journal*, 28, 457.
- 279 Tyler, T. R., Fagan, J., & Geller, A. (2014). Street Stops and Police Legitimacy: Teachable Moments in Young Urban Men’s Legal Socialization. *Journal of Empirical Legal Studies*, 11(4), 751–785. doi:10.1111/jels.12055
- 280 Jones Brown, D., Gill, J., & Trone, J. (2010). Stop, question, & frisk policing practices in New York City: A primer. John Jay College of Criminal Justice.
- 281 McGarrell, E. F., Chermak, S., Weiss, A., & Wilson, J. (2001). Reducing Firearms Violence Through Directed Police Patrol. *Criminology and Public Policy*, 1(1), 119–148
- 282 Koper, C. S., & Mayo-Wilson, E. (2006). Police crackdowns on illegal gun carrying: A systematic review of their impact on gun crime. *Journal of Experimental Criminology*, 2(2), 227–261.

using pedestrian stops alongside traffic stops, and they did not differentiate which strategy resulted in what percentage of gun seizures. Overall, there was no strong or converging evidence to support the effectiveness of pedestrian stops for gun crime reduction beyond the influence of traffic stops and other directed patrol strategies.

PEDESTRIAN STOPS ARE NOT ALWAYS CONDUCTED ACCORDING TO THE LAW

Although pedestrian stops for crime control is supported by legal precedents²⁸³, evidence shows that they are not always conducted according to constitutional standards.^{284,285} In 2004, researchers using field observations found that nearly one-third of searches conducted by officers were unconstitutional, and most of those did not have sufficient documentation in the description of the stop to be reviewed by courts or other oversight bodies to determine constitutionality.²⁸⁶ In another study, the New York Office of the Attorney General, analyzing data collected by New York City police officers, found that the stops described on the reports violated constitutional protections against unreasonable search and seizure.²⁸⁷

PEDESTRIAN STOPS UNDERMINE PERCEPTIONS OF POLICE LEGITIMACY

In one study, young Black participants from St. Louis, Missouri, reflected on their experience when stopped by law enforcement, and a majority reported that they believed the officers stopped them without a legitimate reason to do so.²⁸⁸ Another study examined the factors that contribute to perceived police

legitimacy among young males in New York City. Findings showed that, compared to their White counterparts, Latino participants were less likely to perceive officers as legitimate, in part due to the frequency and intrusiveness of pedestrian and vehicle stops.²⁸⁹ It is important to examine how pedestrian stops are conducted, as some researchers note that perceptions of justice and legitimacy are not based on the stop outcomes but rather how the police behave toward the stopped individuals.²⁹⁰

PROCEDURAL JUSTICE MAY HELP INCREASE PERCEPTIONS OF LEGITIMACY DURING PEDESTRIAN STOPS

Procedural justice training has been suggested to help foster legitimacy during pedestrian stops and other proactive policing activities.^{291,292,293} When an officer treats the stopped individual with fairness and respect, the individual is more likely to view the police as legitimate and more likely to cooperate.²⁹⁴ Some research has begun to examine whether vehicle stops conducted in a procedurally just manner are perceived more favorably compared to neutral stops or ones conducted in a manner opposite of procedural justice.²⁹⁵ However, there is a lack of research specifically examining the impact of procedural justice training on pedestrian stops.

It is worth noting that some scholars remain skeptical of procedural justice as a solution to the challenges created by pedestrian stops. Procedural justice requires three components: trust (or the belief an individual has that the officer will act fairly in the future), standing (or the individual's belief that the officer values the individual as a person and therefore behaves

- 283 Terry v. Ohio (ruled that pat-down searches were constitutional under the Fourth Amendment if the police could demonstrate enough reasonable suspicion); La Vigne, N., Lachman, P., Matthews, A., & Neusteter, S. R. (2012). Key Issues in the Police Use of Pedestrian Stops and Searches. *Washington, DC: Urban Institute*. <https://www.urban.org/sites/default/files/publication/25781/412647-Key-Issues-in-the-Police-Use-of-Pedestrian-Stops-and-Searches.PDF>
- 284 Skogan, W. G., & Meares, T. L. (2004). Lawful policing. *The Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science*, 593(1), 66-83.
- 285 Heffernan, W. C., & Lovely, R. W. (1990). Evaluating the fourth amendment exclusionary rule: The problem of police compliance with the law. *University of Michigan Journal of Law Reform*, 24, 311.
- 286 Gould, J. B., & Mastrofski, S. D. (2004). Suspect searches: Assessing police behavior under the U.S. Constitution. *Criminology & Public Policy*, 3(3), 315-362. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1745-9133.2004.tb00046.x>
- 287 Fagan, J., & Davies, G. (2000). Street stops and broken windows: Terry, race, and disorder in New York City. *Fordham Urban Law Journal*, 28, 457.
- 288 Brunson, R. K., & Miller, J. (2006). Young black men and urban policing in the United States. *British Journal of Criminology*, 46(4), 613-640.
- 289 Tyler, T. R., Fagan, J., & Geller, A. (2014). Street stops and police legitimacy: Teachable moments in young urban men's legal socialization. *Journal of empirical legal studies*, 11(4), 751-785.
- 290 La Vigne, N., Lachman, P., Matthews, A., & Neusteter, S. R. (2012). Key Issues in the Police Use of Pedestrian Stops and Searches. *Washington, DC: Urban Institute*. <https://www.urban.org/sites/default/files/publication/25781/412647-Key-Issues-in-the-Police-Use-of-Pedestrian-Stops-and-Searches.PDF>
- 291 Horowitz, J. (2007). Making every encounter count: Building trust and confidence in the police. *National Institute of Justice Journal*, 256(1), 8-11.
- 292 Epp, C. R., Maynard-Moody, S., & Haider-Markel, D. P. (2014). *Pulled over: How police stops define race and citizenship*. University of Chicago Press.
- 293 Weisburd, D., Telep, C. W., Vovak, H., Zastrow, T., Braga, A. A., & Turchan, B. (2022). Reforming the police through procedural justice training: A multicity randomized trial at crime hot spots. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences*, 119(14), e2118780119. <https://doi.org/doi:10.1073/pnas.2118780119>
- 294 Mazerolle, L., Bennett, S., Davis, J., Sargeant, E., & Manning, M. (2013). Procedural justice and police legitimacy: a systematic review of the research evidence. *Journal of Experimental Criminology*, 9(3), 245-274. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11292-013-9175-2>
- 295 Johnson, D., Wilson, D. B., Maguire, E. R., & Lowrey-Kinberg, B. V. (2017). Race and perceptions of police: Experimental results on the impact of procedural (in) justice. *Justice Quarterly*, 34(7), 1184-1212.

with politeness and respect), and neutrality (or the individual's perception that they are not being discriminated against).²⁹⁶ Pedestrian stops, however, may be based on police officers' biased suspicions and, therefore, unlikely to be perceived by the stopped individual as neutral or unbiased. If pedestrian stops are perceived as being biased, it is unlikely they will be able to achieve high levels of perceived procedural justice.²⁹⁷

COUNCIL RECOMMENDATIONS ►

RECOMMENDATION 44

LIMIT PEDESTRIAN STOPS

Pedestrian stops, which allow officers to temporarily detain, question, and search a person once constitutional thresholds have been reached, should be limited to those with a clear public safety impact. Although they have been associated with reduced violent crime and increased firearm recovery, overreliance is not only likely to harm police-community relationships, including the public's perception of police legitimacy, but may also constitute a discriminatory pattern of practice and, thus, be unconstitutional.

[NOTE: A pedestrian "Terry stop" or "Stop, question, frisk," is different from a general contact between an officer and a member of the community.]

RECOMMENDATION 45

IMPROVE TRAINING ON PEDESTRIAN STOPS

Officers and supervisors must receive regular training to ensure that pedestrian stops are performed in a way that is constitutional, respectful, effective, and not overused.

RECOMMENDATION 46

IMPLEMENT MANDATORY DATA COLLECTION FOR PEDESTRIAN STOPS

Key data regarding pedestrian stops must be recorded, analyzed,

and reported to the public. Data should include time and location, demographics of the person stopped, justification for the stop, whether a protective pat down or search was used, and if actions were taken (e.g., citation or arrest) as a result of the stop.

RECOMMENDATION 47

INCLUDE COMMUNITY INPUT IN ESTABLISHING STRATEGIES FOR PEDESTRIAN STOPS

Goals, policies, and strategies for pedestrian stops must be established with community input, clearly articulated, and tied to larger goals that place the highest value on police-community relations and respect for individuals.

RECOMMENDATION 48

DEVELOP AND IMPLEMENT PEDESTRIAN STOP MONITORING AND ACCOUNTABILITY STRATEGIES

Strategies to monitor the racial and ethnic impact of pedestrian stops must be developed and implemented to prevent disparate outcomes. The behavior and actions of officers during pedestrian stops should be routinely observed and audited, and officers should periodically review body-worn camera footage and the bases and outcomes of the stops to ensure that their actions follow federal, state, and local laws; agency policies; and the tenets of procedural justice. An evaluation of pedestrian stop activity in the aggregate and over time should be performed to ensure there is no racial and ethnic disproportionality, paying particular attention to the larger effects of pedestrian stops on the community. Any evidence of disparity should be addressed.

RECOMMENDATION 49

COMMUNICATE PEDESTRIAN STOP STRATEGIES, POLICIES, AND DATA TO THE COMMUNITY

Strategies, policies, and stop activity data should be reported to the community. Community input should be solicited and, where appropriate, incorporated into policies and procedures regarding the use of pedestrian stops as a public safety strategy.

296 Tyler, T. R., & Lind, E. A. (1992). A relational model of authority in groups. In *Advances in experimental social psychology* (Vol. 25, pp. 115-191). Academic Press.

297 Blanks, J. (2015). Thin blue lies: How pretextual stops undermine police legitimacy. *Case Western Reserve Law Review*, 66, 931.

POLICE TRAINING

THE PROBLEM ►

Basic (academy) and in-service (on-the-job) training is designed to shape how officers do their job, develop new skills and knowledge, and learn how policies and procedures should be implemented. Police training is relatively short in duration, may be limited, and often focuses on physical and tactical policing responses and procedures. Research studies show that training in other areas, such as prioritizing guardian philosophies, problem-solving, and understanding and respecting cultural differences, is very limited. Because of this, officers are often underprepared to engage with the complex challenges involving individuals who are economically and/or socially disenfranchised. In addition to content deficiencies, officer training may be further weakened by the quality and methods of training delivery.

WHAT WE KNOW ►

BASIC TRAINING AVERAGES 833 HOURS OR ROUGHLY 21 WEEKS

Although almost all agencies have minimum education requirements for new officers, the amount of education prior to hiring tends to be low. The most recent nationwide data reveals

that 84% of municipal police agencies²⁹⁸ and 89% of sheriffs' offices²⁹⁹ require a high school diploma and less than 1% require a 4-year college degree.^{300,301} Most but not all law enforcement agencies require field training in addition to basic classroom training. However, even when field training is mandatory, this requirement may not apply to all recruits.³⁰² Despite these minimum requirements, approximately 1/3 of police officers have 4-year college degrees.³⁰³

MOST INSTRUCTIONAL TIME IS SPENT ON FIREARM SKILLS, DEFENSIVE TACTICS, AND PATROL PROCEDURES

Hundreds of hours are spent on traditional law enforcement topics such as firearms, defensive tactics, and use of force procedures. Far fewer hours are spent on non-traditional "guardian-style" topics such as diversity, de-escalation, communication, crisis intervention, and stress management.^{304,305} About 75% of academies provide instruction on mediation and conflict management (average length of instruction 13 hours) and problem-solving (average length of instruction 16 hours).³⁰⁶ Nearly 100% reported providing training on ethics and integrity. Less than half reported providing training on restraints such as the carotid hold.³⁰⁷ Different types of training and a re-allocation of hours or re-prioritization of training hours may be necessary to move American policing towards more of a "guardian" orientation as opposed to "warrior" orientation, and to address other important topics such as self-improvement.³⁰⁸

298 Reaves, B. (2015). *Local Police Departments, 2013: Personnel, Policies, and Practices*. Bureau of Justice Statistics.

299 Burch, A (2012). *Sheriffs' Offices, 2007 – Statistical Tables*. Bureau of Justice Statistics.

300 Reaves, B. (2015). *Local Police Departments, 2013: Personnel, Policies, and Practices*. Bureau of Justice Statistics.

301 Burch, A (2012). *Sheriffs' Offices, 2007 – Statistical Tables*. Bureau of Justice Statistics.

302 Buehler, E. D. (2021). *State and Local Law Enforcement Training Academies, 2018 – Statistical Tables*. Bureau of Justice Statistics. <https://bjs.ojp.gov/sites/g/files/xvckuh236/files/media/document/slleta18st.pdf>

303 Gardiner, C (2017). *Policing around the Nation: Education, Philosophy, and Practice*. https://www.policinginstitute.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/10/PF-Report-Policing-Around-the-Nation_10-2017_Final.pdf

304 Police Executive Research Forum. (2015). *Critical Issues on Policing Series: Re-Engineering Training On Police Use of Force*. <https://www.policeforum.org/assets/reengineeringtraining1.pdf>

305 Sloan, J. J. III, & Paoline, E. A. III. (2021). "They Need More Training!" A National Level Analysis of Police Academy Basic Training Priorities. *Police Quarterly*, 24(4), 486-518. <https://doi.org/10.1177/10986111211013311>

306 Buehler, E. D. (2021). *State and Local Law Enforcement Training Academies, 2018*

307 Police Executive Research Forum. (2015). *Critical Issues on Policing Series: Re-Engineering Training On Police Use of Force*. <https://www.policeforum.org/assets/reengineeringtraining1.pdf>

308 Sloan, J. J. III, & Paoline, E. A. III. (2021). "They Need More Training!" A National Level Analysis of Police Academy Basic Training Priorities. *Police Quarterly*, 24(4), 486-518. <https://doi.org/10.1177/10986111211013311>

ENHANCED PSYCHOLOGICAL AND COGNITIVE SKILLS TRAINING MAY BE NECESSARY

Psychological skills training, using an adult learning model that includes the integration of cognitive, emotional, social, and moral skills development may improve performance, including police-community relations, but it is not sufficient without cultural support within the agency.³⁰⁹ Police academies can facilitate the development of critical thinking skills, conscientiousness, adaptability, emotional regulation and intelligence, stress tolerance, performance techniques, social competence, teamwork, assertiveness and persuasiveness, integrity, ethics, and spirituality (many of which are also psychological screening factors in some states). In addition to being emphasized in the academy, these skills should be reinforced in field training. Methods to enhance macro-cognitive skill development include sensemaking, naturalistic decision-making, and the ShadowBox methods of cognitive skills training.³¹⁰

INSTRUCTOR BACKGROUNDS, EXPERIENCE, AND EDUCATION VARY

Forty-two percent of academies required a high-school diploma or equivalent for full-time instructors; 25% had no formal education requirement for instructors; 25% require a 2-year degree or higher for instructors. On average, about four years of policing experience is required to be a full-time instructor.³¹¹ Despite these requirements, it is unclear if and how these qualifications impact instruction quality and learning outcomes.

TRAINING ACADEMIES ARE NOT ALWAYS OPERATED BY LAW ENFORCEMENT

In 2018, nearly half of the basic training academies were operated by colleges or technical schools. However, two-thirds of recruits graduate from law enforcement-operated academies. In the Midwest, two-thirds of the academies are operated by non-law enforcement entities,³¹² often serving multiple and smaller law enforcement agencies.

FIELD TRAINING OFFICERS (FTOS) HAVE A LASTING IMPACT ON NEW OFFICERS

FTOs are responsible for reinforcing academy training, teaching competencies beyond those taught in the academy, and developing new officer values.³¹³ Because recruit training faces challenges with incorporating both book knowledge and applied knowledge, field training is crucial in providing officers with social learning that instills intangible value-based decision-making during unpredictable incidents in complex situations. FTOs can teach both positive and negative behaviors and thinking that has lasting impacts on officers. Field-training processes may negatively impact a new officer's attitudes toward community policing and problem-solving.³¹⁴ Further, complaints against new officers is at least partially attributable to their FTO.³¹⁵

EVIDENCE ON THE EFFECTIVENESS OF SPECIFIC TYPES OF TRAINING IS LIMITED, AND EFFECTIVENESS VARIES

» Officers who received crisis-intervention training were more likely to de-escalate, use less physical force, and perceive physical force as less effective compared to nonphysical

- 309 Andersen, J. P., & Gustafsberg, H. (2016). A Training Method to Improve Police Use of Force Decision Making: A Randomized Controlled Trial. *Psychology*, 6(2). <https://doi.org/10.1177/2158244016638708>
- Blumberg, D. M., Schlosser, M. D., Papazoglou, K., Creighton, S., & Kaye, C. (2019). New Directions in Police Academy Training: A Call to Action. *International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health*, 16(24). <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC6950698/>
- 310 Suss, J., & Ward, P. (2018). Revealing perceptual-cognitive expertise in law enforcement: An iterative approach using verbal-report, temporal-occlusion, and option-generation methods. *Cognition, Technology and Work*, 20(4), 585-596. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10111-018-0493-z>
- 311 Buehler, E. D. (2021). *State and Local Law Enforcement Training Academies, 2018*
- 312 Buehler, E. D. (2021). *State and Local Law Enforcement Training Academies, 2018*
- 313 Buehler, E. D. (2021). *State and Local Law Enforcement Training Academies, 2018*
- Bennett, R. R. (1984). Becoming Blue: A Longitudinal Study of Police Recruit Occupational Socialization. *Journal of Police Science and Administration*, 12(1), 47-58. https://www.researchgate.net/publication/232495465_Becoming_blue_A_longitudinal_study_of_police_recruit_occupational_socialization
- Engelson, W. (1999). The organizational values of law enforcement agencies: The impact of field training officers in the socialization of police recruits to law enforcement organizations. *Journal of Police and Criminal Psychology*, 14, 11-19. <https://link.springer.com/article/10.1007/BF02830064>
- 314 Haarr, R. N. (2001). Making of a Community Policing Officer: The Impact of Basic Training and Occupational Socialization on Police Recruits. *Police Quarterly*, 4(4), 402-433. <https://www.ojp.gov/ncjrs/virtual-library/abstracts/making-community-policing-officer-impact-basic-training-and>
- 315 Getty, R. M., Worrall, J. L., & Morris, R. G. (2016). How Far From the Tree Does the Apple Fall? Field Training Officers, Their Trainees, and Allegations of Misconduct. *Crime & Delinquency*, 62(6), 821-839. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0011128714545829>

actions during scenario-based vignettes.^{316,317} These officers also felt better prepared to interact with people with perceived mental illness.³¹⁸

- » There was significant variation and little standardization across de-escalation programs, but some evidence suggests the programs generated moderate attitudinal, perceptual, and behavioral benefits.³¹⁹ For instance, officers reported more positive attitudes towards compromise, prioritizing safety for everyone involved, and knowing when to disengage.³²⁰
- » Social-interaction training can improve officer attitudes regarding procedurally just communication but does not alter use-of-force behaviors, and officers are skeptical that it enhances their skillset.³²¹
- » Officers who receive procedural justice training report more positive perceptions of public engagement, more positive attitudes toward officer respect and empathy, and fewer complaints and use-of-force instances.³²²
- » Educating officers about disproportionate contact with minority youth improves officer knowledge, attitudes, and

understanding regarding effective interaction strategies.³²³

- » Training on community-oriented or problem-oriented policing (COP) has little impact on officer perceptions, attitudes, and behaviors.³²⁴ However, implementation of COP has been demonstrated to improve a community's satisfaction in and trust of the police, as well as reducing community perceptions of disorder.³²⁵
- » Trainings designed to reduce implicit biases can improve officer knowledge and understanding on the science of bias; however, it has limited effects on attitudes about discriminatory or prejudiced behavior and no impact on reducing actual disparities in enforcement outcomes.³²⁶

VIRTUAL REALITY (VR) AND SIMULATION TRAINING MODALITIES MAY SHOW PROMISE

VR training allows for greater perspective-taking and has been used in various domains to build empathy in interactions

- 316 Compton, M. T., Demir Neubert, B. N., Broussard, B., McGriff, J. A., Morgan, R., & Oliva, J. R. (2009). Use of force preferences and perceived effectiveness of actions among Crisis Intervention Team (CIT) police officers and non-CIT officers in an escalating psychiatric crisis involving a subject with schizophrenia. *Schizophrenia Bulletin*, 37(4), 737-745.
- 317 Rogers, M. S., McNeil, D. E., & Binder, R. L. (2019). Effectiveness of Police Crisis Intervention Training Programs. *The Journal of the American Academy of Psychiatry and the Law*, 47(4), 414-421. <https://doi.org/10.29158/JAAPL.003863-19>
- 318 Tully, T., & Smith, M. (2015). Officer perceptions of crisis intervention team training effectiveness. *The Police Journal: Theory, Practice and Principles*, 88(1), 51-64. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0032258X15570558>
- 319 Engel, R. S., McManus, H. D., & Herold, T. D. (2020). Does de-escalation training work? *Criminology & Public Policy*, 19(3), 721-759. <https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.1111/1745-9133.12467>
- 320 White, M. D., Mora, V.J., Orosco, C., & Hedberg, E.C. (2021). Moving the needle: Can training alter officer perceptions and use of de-escalation? *Policing: An International Journal*, 44(3), 418-436. <https://doi.org/10.1108/PIJPSM-08-2020-0140>
- 321 McLean, K., Wolfe, S. E., Rojek, J., Alpert, G. P., & Smith, M. R. (2020). Randomized controlled trial of social interaction police training. *Criminology & Public Policy*, 19(3), 805-832. <https://doi.org/10.1111/1745-9133.12506>
- Wolfe, S., Rojek, J., McLean, K., & Alpert, G. (2020). Social Interaction Training to Reduce Police Use of Force. *The Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science*, 687(1), 124-145. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0002716219887366>
- 322 Skogan, W. G., Van Craen, M., & Hennessy, C. (2014). Training police for procedural justice. *Journal of Experimental Criminology*, 11, 319-334. <https://link.springer.com/article/10.1007%2Fs11292-014-9223-6>
- Rosenbaum, D. P., & Lawrence, D. S. (2011). *Teaching Respectful Police-Citizen Encounters and Good Decision Making: Results of a Randomized Control Trial with Police Recruits*. Michigan State University. <http://www.ippsr.msu.edu/research/teaching-respectful-police-citizen-encounters-and-good-decision-making-results-randomized>
- Schuck, A. M., & Rosenbaum, D. P. (n. d.) *The Chicago Quality Interaction Training Program: A Randomized Control Trial of Police Innovation*. National Police Research Platform. <https://www.hsd.org/?view&did=687722>
- Wood, G., Tyler, T. R., & Papachristos, A. V. (2020). Procedural justice training reduces police use of force and complaints against officers. *PNAS*, 117(18). <https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1920671117>
- 323 LaMotte, V., Ouellette, K., Sanderson, J., Anderson, S. A., Kosutic, I., Griggs, J., & Garcia, M. (2010). Effective Police Interactions with Youth: A Program Evaluation. *Police Quarterly*, 13(2), 161-179. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1098611110365689>
- 324 Paoline, E. A. III, Myers, S. M., & Worden, R. E. (2000). Police culture, individualism, and community policing: Evidence from two police departments. *Justice Quarterly*, 17(3), 575-605. <https://doi.org/10.1080/07418820000094671>
- Quinet, K., Nunn, S., & Kincaid, N. (2003). Training police: A case study of differential impacts of problem-oriented policing training. *Police Practice and Research*, 4(3), 263-283. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1561426032000113889>
- 325 Gill, C., Weisburd, D., Telep, C. W., Vitter, Z., & Bennett, T. (2014). Community-oriented policing to reduce crime, disorder and fear and increase satisfaction and legitimacy among citizens: A systematic review. *Journal of Experimental Criminology*, 10, 399-428. <https://link.springer.com/article/10.1007/s11292-014-9210-y>
- 326 Worden, R. E., McLean, S. J., Engel, R. S., Cochran, H., Corsaro, N., Reynolds, D., Najdowski, C. J., Isaza, G. T. (2020). *The Impacts of Implicit Bias Awareness Training in the NYPD*. John Finn Institute for Public Safety, the IACP, and the University of Cincinnati's Center for Police Research and Policy. https://www1.nyc.gov/assets/nypd/downloads/pdf/analysis_and_planning/impacts-of-implicit-bias-awareness-training-in-%20the-nypd.pdf
- Forscher, P. S., Lai, C. K., Axt, J. R., Ebersole, C. R., Herman, M., Devine, P. G., Nosek, B. A. (2019). A Meta-Analysis of Procedures to Change Implicit Measures. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, 117(3), 522-559. <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC6687518/>

including medicine³²⁷, psychology³²⁸, and education³²⁹. Virtual scenarios (designed to be more similar to live interactions) can facilitate enhanced presence in simulated interactions,³³⁰ and therefore may be a more effective way of identifying racial bias and increase prosocial behavior with longer-term impacts on police-community interactions and prejudice reduction.³³¹ Simulation (aka scenario-based) training involves realistic scenarios, including use of equipment on the job and equipment-based feedback.³³² As in VR training, simulation-based training has been demonstrated to be superior to more basic training formats (e.g., problem-solving approaches) especially for complex tasks, in fields such as aviation³³³, management³³⁴, and medicine³³⁵. There is some research showing the success of VR training in policing³³⁶.

COUNCIL RECOMMENDATIONS ►

RECOMMENDATION 50

DEVELOP AND DELIVER TRAINING THAT SUPPORTS ORGANIZATIONAL AND CULTURAL GOALS

Training curricula that support law enforcement agency organizational and cultural goals and values, as defined by agency leadership and the community, should be developed and delivered. Trainers and the curriculum should be certified by the International Association of Directors of Law Enforcement Standards and Training (IADLEST) National Certification Program (NCP). Training curricula that support law enforcement agency organizational and cultural goals and values, as defined by agency leadership and the community, should be developed and delivered. Trainers and the curriculum should be certified by the International Association of Directors of Law Enforcement Standards and Training (IADLEST) National Certification Program (NCP) or some other nationally recognized certification program.

- 327 Li, L., Yu, F., Shi, D., Shi, J., Tian, Z., Yang, J., Wang, X., & Jiang, Q. (2017). Application of virtual reality technology in clinical medicine. *American Journal of Translational Research*, 9(9), 3867–3880.
- 328 Glantz, K., Durlach, N. I., Barnett, R. C., & Aviles, W. A. (1996). Virtual reality (VR) for psychotherapy: From the physical to the social environment. *Psychotherapy: Theory, Research, Practice, Training*, 33(3), 464–473. <https://doi.org/10.1037/0033-3204.33.3.464>
- 329 Kavanagh, S., Luxton-Reilly, A., Wuensche, B. & Plimmer, B. (2017). A systematic review of Virtual Reality in education. *Themes in Science and Technology Education*, 10(2), 85-119.
- 330 Garcia, E. T., & Baker, L. J. (2019). *Measuring Presence and Performance in a Virtual Reality Police Use of Force Training Simulation Prototype*. Florida Artificial Intelligence Research Society Conference. <https://www.aaai.org/ocs/index.php/FLAIRS/FLAIRS19/paper/viewPaper/18223>
- 331 Gillath, O., McCall, C., Shaver, P. R., & Blascovich, J. (2008). What Can Virtual Reality Teach Us About Prosocial Tendencies in Real and Virtual Environments? *Media Psychology*, 11(2), 259-282. <https://doi.org/10.1080/15213260801906489>
- Groom, V., Bailenson, J. N., & Nass, C. (2009). The influence of racial embodiment on racial bias in immersive virtual environments. *Social Influence*, 4(3), 231-248. <https://doi.org/10.1080/15534510802643750>
- Salmanowitz, N. (2018). The impact of virtual reality on implicit racial bias and mock legal decisions. *Journal of Law and the Biosciences*, 5(1), 174-203. <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC5912078/>
- Eastwick, P. W., & Gardner, W. L. (2009). Is it a game? Evidence for social influence in the virtual world. *Social Influence*, 4(1), 18-32. <https://doi.org/10.1080/15534510802254087>
- Doan, L., Ray, R., Powelson, C., Fuentes, G., Shankman, R., Genter, S., & Bailey, J. (2021). Evaluation of a Virtual Reality Simulation Tool for Studying Bias in Police-Civilian Interactions. *Lecture Notes in Computer Science*, 12776, 388-399. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-78114-9_26
- 332 Jenkins, B., Semple, T. & Bennell, C. (2021). An evidence-based approach to critical incident scenario development. *Policing: An International Journal*, 44(3), 437-454. <https://doi.org/10.1108/PJIPSM-02-2020-0017>
- 333 Moorthy, K., Vicent, C., & Darzi, A. (2005). Simulation based training. *British Medical Journal*, 330, 493. <https://doi.org/10.1136/bmj.330.7490.493>
- 334 Salas, E., Wildman, J. L., & Piccolo, R. F. (2017). Using Simulation-Based Training to Enhance Management Education. *Academy of Management Learning & Education*, 8(4). <https://doi.org/10.5465/amlle.8.4.zqr559>
- 335 Steadman, R. H., Coates, W. C., Huang, Y. M., Matevosian, R., Larmon, B. R., McCullough, L., & Ariel, D. (2006). Simulation-based training is superior to problem-based learning for the acquisition of critical assessment and management skills. *Critical Care Medicine*, 34(1), 151-157. <https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/16374169/>
- 336 Andersen, J. P., Pitel, M., Weerasinghe, A., & Papazoglou, K. (2016). Highly realistic scenario-based training simulates the psychophysiology of real world use of force encounters: Implications for improved police officer performance. *Journal of Law Enforcement*, 5(4).

RECOMMENDATION 51

REVIEW ROLES OF FIELD TRAINING OFFICERS (FTOS)

Field training officer (FTO) training, selection, assignment, and impact should be reviewed to ensure alignment with organizational values and culture. Differences between academy training and guidance provided by FTOs should be analyzed, including observational analysis and surveys of attitudinal and other possible changes before and after the academy, and after field training. Officers with founded complaints, misconduct, or multiple uses of excessive force on their record should not be selected as FTOs. The Police Training Officer (PTO) model, which emphasizes community problem-solving and other approaches, should be considered, tested, and evaluated.

RECOMMENDATION 52

EVALUATE IMPACT OF TRAINING ON OFFICER BEHAVIOR

The impact of all training on policing outcomes should be evaluated, including for possible disparate impact.

RECOMMENDATION 53

INCORPORATING ELEMENTS OF CONTEMPORARY POLICING IN TRAINING

Essential elements of contemporary policing must be incorporated in all academies, in-service, and field training. These elements include procedural justice, de-escalation, active bystandership, respect for all persons, sanctity of life, value of diversity, fair and impartial policing, and interpersonal and communication skills. To ensure that trainees understand and can implement these elements, the time spent on these elements (including refresher work and skill-based proficiency assessments) should be compared to time spent on training that may prioritize more aggressive law enforcement tactics.

POLICING IN SCHOOLS

THE PROBLEM ►

The threat of violence and other crimes in schools is a serious concern. School Resource Officer (SRO) programs have been developed to address this issue by providing safety and crime prevention in the school setting. Many also believe that law enforcement presence in schools can lead to more positive relationships between police and youth in the community. However, others regard the growing presence of officers in schools as leading to more exclusionary discipline and criminal justice involvement. These actions contribute to outcomes with greater racial disparities and what is termed a “school-to-prison pipeline” that disproportionately impacts youth of color.³³⁷

WHAT WE KNOW ►

About 40% of municipal law enforcement agencies have at least one full-time school resource officer. A 2019 study showed that about 2.5% of all municipal law enforcement officers were assigned SRO positions.³³⁸ The U.S. Department of Education suggests that the risk of victimization for students aged 12–18 has decreased over the last decade. During the 2019–2020 school year, 77% of public schools documented one or more incidents of violence, theft, and other crime; 47% reported one or more of these incidents to the police. These numbers represent a reduction from 2009–2010. The number of shootings at public and private elementary and secondary schools increased from

11 in 2000–2001 to 93 in 2020–2021, representing a large increase; still, these incidents are considered rare³³⁹ though it is acknowledged that the statistically infrequent nature of the events should not be interpreted to infer that they are any less of a priority to prevent.

THERE IS CURRENTLY LIMITED EVIDENCE THAT SROS REDUCE CRIME OR IMPROVE SCHOOL SAFETY

Research to date has failed to find strong evidence that SROs improve school safety. One study found that SROs were associated with reduced crime and increased arrests for property and violence offenses on the grounds of middle schools, and increased drug arrests for high school youth outside of school grounds.³⁴⁰ However, a recently conducted comprehensive review of the research concluded: “An examination of systematic reviews and quasi-experiments of school policing, along with expert panel opinions, reveals that the research to date does not support school policing as an effective strategy in increasing safety and security.”³⁴¹ Other research has found limited³⁴² or no effect^{343;344} of SROs on levels of crime. There is also insufficient evidence to conclude whether SROs in schools deter mass shooting events.³⁴⁵

EVIDENCE INDICATES THAT SROS DO NOT APPEAR TO IMPROVE STUDENT PERCEPTIONS OF SAFETY

A dozen studies, using various measurement and evaluation strategies, have explored how SROs affect student perceptions of safety. No consistent evidence has linked SROs to improved student perceptions of school safety.³⁴⁶

337 Justice Policy Institute. (2011). *Education under arrest: The case against police in schools*. Washington, DC: Author.

338 Hyland, S., & Davis, E. (2019). *Local Police Departments 2016: Personnel*. Bureau of Justice Statistics.

339 Irwin, V., Wang, K., Cui, J., & Thompson, A. (2022). *Report on Indicators of School Crime and Safety, 2021*. National Center for Education Statistics, U.S. Department of Education, and Bureau of Justice Statistics, Office of Justice Programs, U.S. Department of Justice. <https://bjs.ojp.gov/sites/g/files/xyckuh236/files/media/document/jscs21.pdf>

340 Owens, E. G. (2017). *Testing the school to prison pipeline*. *Journal of Policy Analysis and Management*, 36(1), 11–37.

341 McKenna, J., & Petrosino, A. (2022). *School Policing Programs: Where We Have Been and Where We Need to Go Next*. National Institute of Justice.

342 Gonzalez, J., Jetelina, K., & Jennings, W. 2016. Structural school safety measures, SROs, and school-related delinquent behavior and perceptions of safety: A state-of-the-art review. *Policing: An International Journal of Police Strategies & Management*, 39(3), 438–454.

343 Barnes, L. M. 2008. *Policing the schools: An evaluation of the North Carolina School Resource Officer Program*. Doctoral dissertation, Rutgers.

344 Sullivan, W. J. 2013. *Kentucky SRO programs: An examination of impact on reported criminal violations and board violations*. Online theses and dissertations. 139.

345 James, N., & McCallion, G. (2013). *School resource officers: Law enforcement officers in schools*. Washington, DC: Library of Congress, Congressional Research Service.

346 McKenna, J., & Petrosino, A. (2022). *School Policing Programs: Where We Have Been and Where We Need to Go Next*. National Institute of Justice.

TO THE EXTENT THAT SROS MAY IMPROVE PERCEPTIONS OF THE POLICE, THE EFFECT IS MIXED AND VARIES BY RACE

Numerous studies have explored how students perceive police in their communities and their schools. In general, most research suggests that SROs do not improve perceptions of police, in general, although SROs are viewed more favorably than community police officers. Compared to their White peers, Black students held fewer positive perceptions of the police in both settings.³⁴⁷ More than 60% of Black students in the Los Angeles Unified School District did not believe that school police were trustworthy.³⁴⁸ Black students, compared to their White peers, have less positive perceptions of police both in the community and in schools.³⁴⁹ Similarly, at least one study suggests that SROs view the source of threats to school safety differently if they are assigned to a White-majority school district versus a Black-majority district.³⁵⁰

SRO INVOLVEMENT IN DISCIPLINE MAY REFLECT THE SCHOOL'S EXISTING DISCIPLINARY PRACTICES

Nationwide, 43% of elementary and 63% of secondary school administrators in schools with SROs reported that their SROs were involved in maintaining school discipline.³⁵¹ This involvement takes various forms and appears to be affected by school context, existing disciplinary practices, and student body demographics.³⁵² A meta-analysis³⁵³ found that the presence of SROs in high schools was associated with higher rates of exclusionary discipline (such as suspension or expulsion).^{354,355}

However, they were unable to distinguish the impact of SROs from that of other measures utilized by the school at the same time. A subset of more rigorous studies shows that the rate of exclusionary discipline was not significantly different from the rate in schools without SROs. Another review of the evidence was inconclusive (due to limitations of the review) regarding the effectiveness of school policing programs.³⁵⁶

THE PRESENCE OF SROS HAS BEEN ASSOCIATED WITH GREATER DISCIPLINE, WHICH RESEARCH HAS FOUND TO DISPROPORTIONATELY AFFECT BLACK STUDENTS WHO ARE OF LOWER SOCIOECONOMIC STATUS AND HAVE DISABILITIES

Research suggests that these students were disproportionately disciplined (e.g., suspension and expulsion) in K–12 public schools.³⁵⁷ These disparities were widespread and persisted regardless of the type of disciplinary action, level of school poverty, or type of public school.³⁵⁸ Research also shows a consistent positive association between suspensions and dropouts and involvement in criminal behaviors later in life.³⁵⁹ This affected Black students more than White students.

PLACING LAW ENFORCEMENT OFFICERS INSIDE SCHOOLS MAY IMPROVE SAFETY BUT CAN HAVE UNINTENDED IMPACTS ON RACIAL DISPARITIES

Recent research suggests that weighing the costs (both financial

347 Nakamoto, J., Cerna, R., & Stern, A. (2019). *High school students' perceptions of police vary by student race and ethnicity: Findings from an analysis of the California Healthy Kids Survey, 2017/18*. San Francisco, CA: WestEd.

348 Sparks, S. (2020). "Do school police make Black students feel more or less safe?"

349 Nakamoto, J., Cerna, R., & Stern, A. (2019). *High school students' perceptions of police vary by student race and ethnicity: Findings from an analysis of the California Healthy Kids Survey, 2017/18*. San Francisco, CA: WestEd.

350 McKenna, J., & Petrosino, A. (2022). *School Policing Programs: Where We Have Been and Where We Need to Go Next*. National Institute of Justice.

351 Musu-Gillette, L., Zhang, A., Wang, K., Zhang, J., Kemp, J., Diliberti, M., & Oudekerk, B. A. (2018). *Indicators of school crime and safety: 2017*. U.S. Department of Education. <https://bjs.ojp.gov/sites/g/files/xyckuh236/files/media/document/iscs17.pdf?ed2f26df2d9c416fbd3d362330a778c6=cbobieglen-cbbigine>

352 Curran, F. C., Fisher, B. W., Viano, S., & Kupchik, A. (2019). Why and when do school resource officers engage in school discipline? The role of context in shaping disciplinary involvement. *American Journal of Education*, 126(1), 33–63.

353 Fisher, B. W., & Hennessy, E. A. (2016). School resource officers and exclusionary discipline in US high schools: A systematic review and meta-analysis. *Adolescent Research Review*, 1(3), 217–233.

354 U.S. Department of Education. (2021). An overview of exclusionary discipline practices in public schools for the 2017–18 school year.

355 Finn, J. D., & Servoss, T. J. (2014). Misbehavior, suspensions, and security measures in high school: Racial/ethnic and gender differences. *Journal of Applied Research on Children: Informing Policy for Children at Risk*, 5(2), 11.

356 Petrosino, A., Guckenburg, S., & Fronius, T. (2011). *Policing schools' strategies: A systematic search for experimental and quasi-experimental studies*. National Police Improvement Agency, United Kingdom and George Mason Center for Evidence-Based Crime Policy, Woburn, MA: Learning Innovations at WestEd.

357 Fisher, B. W., & Hennessy, E. A. (2016). School resource officers and exclusionary discipline: A systematic review and meta-analysis. *Adolescent Research Review*, 1, 217–233. doi: 10.1007/s40894-015-0006-8

358 Nowicki, J. M. (2018). *K-12 Education: Discipline Disparities for Black Students, Boys, and Students with Disabilities. Report to Congressional Requesters*. GAO-18-258. US Government Accountability Office.

359 Cuellar, A. E., & Markowitz, S. (2015). School suspension and the school-to-prison pipeline. *International Review of Law and Economics*, 43, 98–106.

and social) and benefits of SROs should remain an ongoing public policy debate. One study found that SROs were associated with reduced crime but also increased arrests for property and violence offenses (on middle school grounds) and drug arrests (among high school youth off school grounds).³⁶⁰ SROs have also been associated with increased student involvement in the criminal and juvenile justice systems. For example, SROs in middle schools increased disciplinary actions by 6%, driven by sanctions for low-level offenses or school code of conduct violations and the largest increase in discipline.³⁶¹ Further, after receiving a three-year federal grant for school police, schools in Texas saw a 2.5% decrease in high school graduation rates and a 4% decrease in college enrollment rates.³⁶²

ALTERNATIVE APPROACHES MAY ADDRESS PROBLEMATIC BEHAVIORS WITHOUT CRIMINAL JUSTICE INVOLVEMENT

Schools are adopting alternatives to exclusionary disciplines, such as initiatives that promote positive behavioral expectations for students.³⁶³ A few studies suggest that school-based restorative justice programs demonstrate promising impacts, including reductions in disparities in suspensions and other disciplines, increased PSAT scores, and improvements in teacher perception of school climate.^{364;365;366;367} Program impacts, however, suggest room for further study and development. One large study found that implementing restorative justice practices did not improve academic performance for some grade levels and did not reduce arrest rates.³⁶⁸ A meta-analysis of school-based social and emotional learning (SEL) programs found a positive effect on academic performance of having SROs in the schools, but this finding has not received further support from other,

higher-quality randomized studies.^{369;370}

COUNCIL RECOMMENDATIONS ►

RECOMMENDATION 54

ARTICULATE THE ROLE OF SCHOOL-BASED OFFICERS

The role of school-based officers should be clearly defined and limited to addressing serious crimes and threats involving students or the school itself. Officer involvement in non-criminal or public safety emergency matters on school grounds should be avoided, as they are best handled outside of the juvenile and criminal justice systems.

RECOMMENDATION 55

RESEARCH AND MINIMIZE THE POTENTIAL FOR NEGATIVE IMPACT OF SCHOOL-BASED LAW ENFORCEMENT

Additional research is needed to develop strategies that mitigate the potential negative impacts of school-based law enforcement officers on academic achievement, discipline, violence prevention, crime reduction, and police-youth relations. Placement of officers in schools below the high school level should be based on evidence of criminal threats involving the school and should be reviewed annually to determine how

360 Owens, E. G. (2017). Testing the school to prison pipeline. *Journal of Policy Analysis and Management*, 36(1), 11-37.

361 Weisburst, E. K. (2019). Patrolling Public Schools: The Impact of Funding for School Police on Student Discipline and Long-term Education Outcomes. *Journal of Policy Analysis and Management*, 38(2), 338-365. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1002/pam.22116>

362 Weisburst, E. K. (2019). Patrolling Public Schools: The Impact of Funding for School Police on Student Discipline and Long-term Education Outcomes. *Journal of Policy Analysis and Management*, 38(2), 338-365. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1002/pam.22116>

363 Nowicki, J. M. (2018). *K-12 Education: Discipline Disparities for Black Students, Boys, and Students with Disabilities. Report to Congressional Requesters*. GAO-18-258. US Government Accountability Office.

364 Augustine, C. H., Engberg, J., Grimm, G. E., Lee, E., Wang, E. L., Christianson, K., & Joseph, A. A. (2018). *Can restorative practices improve school climate and curb suspensions. An evaluation of the impact of restorative practices in a mid-sized urban school district*. Rand.

365 Fronius, T., Darling-Hammond, S., Persson, H., Guckenburger, S., Hurley, N., & Petrosino, A. (2019). *Restorative Justice in US Schools: An Updated Research Review*. WestEd.

366 Hashim, A. K., Strunk, K. O., & Dhaliwal, T. K. (2018). Justice for all? Suspension bans and restorative justice programs in the Los Angeles Unified School District. *Peabody Journal of Education*, 93(2), 174-189.

367 Jain, S., Basse, H., Brown, M. A., & Kalra, P. (2014). *Restorative justice in Oakland schools: Implementation and impacts* (Prepared for The Office of Civil Rights, US Department of Education). Oakland Unified School District, Data In Action, Oakland, CA.

368 Augustine, C. H., Engberg, J., Grimm, G. E., Lee, E., Wang, E. L., Christianson, K., & Joseph, A. A. (2018). *Can restorative practices improve school climate and curb suspensions. An evaluation of the impact of restorative practices in a mid-sized urban school district*. Rand.

369 Corcoran, R. P., Cheung, A. C., Kim, E., & Xie, C. (2018). Effective universal school-based social and emotional learning programs for improving academic achievement: A systematic review and meta-analysis of 50 years of research. *Educational Research Review*, 25, 56-72.

370 Cho, V., Mansfield, K. C., & Claughton, J. (2020). The past and future technology in classroom management and school discipline: A systematic review. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 90, 103037.

SROs contribute to school safety without negative impacts on educational achievement and to the potential for students to enter the school-to-prison pipeline.

RECOMMENDATION 56

DEVELOP, IMPLEMENT, AND EVALUATE ALTERNATIVES TO SCHOOL-BASED LAW ENFORCEMENT

Communities should explore, implement, and evaluate discipline and safety alternatives to using sworn law enforcement officers in schools, absent a clear, compelling, and continuing reason to do so. Experimentation is encouraged with alternatives that do not contribute to the school-to-prison pipeline, such as restorative justice and social and behavioral approaches, including prevention of substance use and bullying. All such approaches should be evaluated for their impact on outcomes, including academic achievement, safety, and racially disparate outcomes.

MEET THE COUNCIL

COUNCIL CO-CHAIRS ►

CONGRESSWOMAN VAL BUTLER DEMINGS

Congresswoman Val Demings represents Florida's 10th Congressional District in the U.S. House of Representatives.

She received a B.S. in Criminology and M.P.A. from Florida State University. Demings holds an honorary doctorate of laws from Bethune-Cookman University, and honorary doctorates from Florida Technical College and City College Fort Lauderdale.

Demings began her career in Jacksonville as a social worker, working to protect foster children. Then, in the early 1980s, Rep. Demings moved to Orlando to join the police force. During her distinguished 27-year career with the Orlando Police Department (OPD), she served in virtually every department.

In 2007, Val Demings made history when she was appointed to serve as Orlando's first female Chief of Police. Through the work of Chief Demings and her dedicated officers, OPD reduced violent crime by more than 40 percent.

Rep. Demings sits on the House Permanent Select Committee on Intelligence, the House Judiciary Committee, and the House Committee on Homeland Security.

Besides serving as a Subcommittee Vice-Chair, Congresswoman Demings' leadership positions include serving as Assistant and Regional Whip for the House Democratic Caucus, Co-Chair of Candidate Recruitment for the Democratic Congressional Campaign Committee, and Vice Chair of the Gun Violence Prevention Task Force.

JAMES FORMAN JR.

James Forman Jr. is the J. Skelly Wright Professor of Law at Yale Law School. He attended public schools in Detroit, New York City, and Atlanta, then Brown University and Yale Law School.

Forman began his legal career as a staff attorney at Washington D.C.'s Public Defender Service. While there, he co-founded the Maya Angelou School, which serves young people who have struggled in school, dropped out, or have been arrested. The school has grown to five campuses and is currently celebrating 25 years of service.

Professor Forman teaches criminal law and a seminar called *Inside Out: Issues in Criminal Justice*, in which Yale students study alongside incarcerated men and women. He is the faculty director of the Yale Center for Law and Racial Justice and the founder of the Access to Law School Program, an innovative pipeline program serving first-generation and under-represented students from New Haven who wish to pursue a legal career.

His first book, *Locking Up Our Own: Crime and Punishment in Black America*, won the 2018 Pulitzer Prize.

COUNCIL MEMBERS ►

DR. SHON F. BARNES

The Police and Fire Commission hired Shon F. Barnes Ph.D., as the Madison, Wisconsin Police Department's Police Chief in December of 2020. Chief Barnes is a nationally recognized leader in crime reduction and community-police relations. He was previously the Director

of Training and Professional Development for the Civilian Office of Police Accountability in Chicago, Illinois. Chief Barnes was the Deputy Chief of Police in Salisbury, North Carolina (2017-2020) and a Captain with the Greensboro Police Department (NC) where he began his career as a patrol officer in the fall of 2000. Chief Barnes was honored as a National Institute of Justice, LEADS Scholar, for using innovative technology to reduce crime and is a council member on the National Police Foundation's Council on Policing Reforms and Race.

REV. JEFFREY BROWN

Rev. Jeffrey Brown was one of the key architects behind the “Boston Miracle,” which saw the violent crime rate among youth plummet by 79% over a decade. Today, he works with faith groups, cities, government, and police to stop gang violence as the president of RECAP and co-founder of My City at Peace. He speaks on “collaborative leadership,” community building, and what it takes to institute real change in organizations of all stripes.

“Reverend Brown’s groundbreaking work provides concrete evidence of what can be achieved when committed individuals work together to bridge divides. His work shows us the way to a world in which social justice is an active practice, not an abstract concept.”— Ron Liebowitz, Brandeis University President

Rev. Jeffrey Brown’s TED keynote garnered a standing ovation—and has since been viewed over 1 million times. He is currently the president of RECAP: Rebuilding Every Community Around Peace. He is also a co-founder of the Boston Ten Point Coalition, a faith-based group that was an integral part of the famous “Boston Miracle,” during which the city experienced a 79% decline in violent crime among youth over ten years, including 29 consecutive months of zero juvenile homicides. These efforts also spawned countless urban collaborative efforts in subsequent years and were widely covered in the press.

Rev. Brown is also the host of the podcast *The Courage to Listen*, available on iTunes, Google Play, and Feedburner. Each episode offers stories and insight from the people— clergy and politicians, former gang members and street workers—striving to reduce violence. And each episode discusses timely issues such as community-police relations, the Black Lives Matter movement, gang-based mindsets, urban unrest and protest, and more.

Rev. Brown consults municipalities and police departments (and policing initiatives) nationwide on issues around youth violence and community mobilization. He helps rebuild trust between neighborhoods and police departments, speaking with officers to strengthen their ties to the communities they serve. He has worked with the US State Department on Countering Violent Extremism (CVE) initiatives, based on his nationally recognized success with developing robust violence prevention and intervention strategies. As part of the Society for Organizational Learning North America, Rev. Brown also assists the World Bank, IMF, and IFC with senior leadership development and learning, teaching cutting-edge models for leadership, problem solving, flexibility, and adaptability.

As co-founder of My City at Peace—a community-based, collaborative organization that builds alliances between conflicting constituencies to find peace and end violence—Rev. Brown has also been working with housing authorities to rebuild communities in distressed areas and avoid the more damaging effects of gentrification. In order to attract buyers, while still retaining low-income residents, Brown argues for a combination of market-rate, affordable, and Section 8 housing. For his service, Rev. Brown was named a Brandeis University Richman Distinguished Fellow in Public Life.

ROD K. BRUNSON

Rod K. Brunson is a professor in the Department of Criminology and Criminal Justice at the University of Maryland. He is a widely sought-after speaker and has received numerous professional awards in recognition of his distinguished body of scholarly work, including American Society of Criminology, Fellow (2019). Furthermore, Dr. Brunson co-directs the Racial Democracy Crime and Justice Network, social scientists conducting research on crime, inequality, and the criminal justice system.

Professor Brunson’s expertise centers on police-community relations, youth violence, and evidence-based criminal justice policy. He has consistently called for effective crime reduction strategies that do not result in racially disparate treatment of minority individuals and disadvantaged neighborhoods. Dr. Brunson’s scholarship appears in the *Annual Review of Sociology*, *British Journal of Criminology*, *City & Community*, *Criminology*, *Criminology & Public Policy*, *Evaluation Review*, *Justice Quarterly*, *Preventive Medicine*, *Urban Affairs Review*, and *Journal of Urban Health*.

RALPH A. CLARK

Ralph Clark serves as the President and CEO of ShotSpotter, Inc., a publicly traded (NASDAQ SSTI) SaaS-based precision policing solutions company bringing the power of digital transformation to law enforcement.

Mr. Clark joined ShotSpotter in 2010 and led the business model and technology transformation resulting in ShotSpotter's initial public offering in 2017. ShotSpotter has been designated a Great Place to Work Company and has consistently driven Excellent to World Class NPS ratings.

Prior to joining ShotSpotter, Mr. Clark was the CEO of GuardianEdge Technologies, a leading end-point data protection company that he joined in 2005 which was acquired by Symantec in 2010. Mr. Clark started his career as an IBM large systems marketing representative. After IBM and post-business school, Mr. Clark spent three years in investment banking with Goldman Sachs and Merrill Lynch before pursuing a career as a high-tech entrepreneur.

Mr. Clark received the 2019 EY Entrepreneur of the Year Award for Northern California and was recognized as San Francisco Business Times Most Admired CEO in 2019.

Mr. Clark holds a B.S. in Economics from University of the Pacific and an M.B.A. from Harvard Business School where he also serves on HBS Global Advisory Board.

JERRY L. CLAYTON

Jerry L. Clayton has served as criminal justice professional for 34 years. He is currently serving his fourth term as the Sheriff of Washtenaw County. Sheriff Clayton leads a values and mission driven organization, focused on co-producing community wellness and safety.

During his career with the Sheriff's Office, Jerry served in a variety of front-line positions and was appointed to the following executive positions, Corrections Commander, Police Services Commander and SWAT Team Commander.

Jerry has also been a certified criminal justice trainer and instructor for more than thirty years, specializing in a number of areas including: Cultural Diversity, Bias-Free Policing, Organizational Change and Leadership. Sheriff Clayton has provided training, monitoring and Subject Matter Expert consulting services to a variety of private and public sector clients, including the United States Department of Justice, the National Sheriff's Association, and the American Civil Liberties Union.

Jerry has also served as a Governor appointed commissioner for the Michigan Commission on Law Enforcement Standards from 2013-2019. MCOLES is responsible for developing and managing the training and licensing standards for all law enforcement officers in Michigan. Sheriff Clayton served as Chairperson for the commission.

Sheriff Clayton serves on the boards of numerous local organizations. These include the Washtenaw Area Council for Children, the local Chapter of NAMI (National Alliance on Mental Illness), the Washtenaw County Mental Health Treatment Court Advisory Board and the Washtenaw County Continuum of Care Board (ending homelessness). He is also a member of numerous other national community service and law enforcement organizations.

Jerry has also received international recognition for his work in the Criminal Justice field. In 2016 he was invited as a representative of law enforcement to attend an international Community Policing conference in Barcelona, Spain. In 2017, at the invitation of the United Nations High Commission on Human Rights, Sheriff Clayton was the representative from the United States and a presenter at an international conference on law enforcement and bias-based policing in Geneva, Switzerland.

Sheriff Clayton attended Eastern Michigan University, majoring in Public Safety Administration. He also graduated from the EMU School of Staff and Command and numerous other Leadership programs.

WARRICK DUNN

Warrick Dunn is a former NFL running back and a three-time Pro Bowl selection. Dunn is well known for his philanthropic endeavors and success as a professional football player.

Warrick started Homes for the Holidays in 1997 during his rookie year with the Tampa Bay Buccaneers. The program is a tribute to his mother, Betty Smothers, a Baton Rouge police officer who as a single mother of six worked tirelessly to achieve the American dream of

owning her own home. While working a second job as a security guard, she was killed in the line of duty and was never able to realize that dream.

Warrick Dunn Charities was founded in 2002, to improve lives through innovative programming inspired by Dunn's life journey. To date, the program has rewarded over 204 single parents and over 549 dependents for achieving first-time homeownership nationwide.

Dunn's football career began at Florida State University. In 1997, Dunn was drafted by the Tampa Bay Buccaneers. He played for the Bucs for five years before signing with the Atlanta Falcons in 2002. Six seasons later, in 2008, he returned to the Tampa Bay Buccaneers for his final season.

His 2008 autobiography, *Running For My Life*, details his life and battles with depression. As a public speaker and advocate, he often speaks about his battle with mental health and the importance of going to counseling.

After a 12-year career, Dunn retired and in 2009 was approved by NFL owners to become a limited partner of the Atlanta Falcons.

In 2013, Dunn graduated with his EMBA from Emory University and also was selected to join the first class of NFL Legends.

In February 2020, Dunn launched his second nonprofit, WD Communities. WD Communities will support families from the beginning to the end of the purchase of affordable or transitional housing and provide support services, including Financial Literacy, Health & Wellness, Education Attainment, and Entrepreneurship & Workforce Development. The organization is committed to working with families over the course of several years

Warrick serves on numerous boards and has made it his life's mission to impact future generations by helping fulfill his mother's dream and by continually giving back to the community and challenging others around him to do the same.

DR. ROBIN S. ENGEL

Robin S. Engel, PhD, a nationally known and highly respected criminologist, has served as a Professor of Criminal Justice at the University of Cincinnati (UC) and Director of the Center for Police Research and Policy. From 2015 to 2019, she served as UC's Vice President for Safety and Reform, where her administrative duties included oversight of daily operations and implementation of comprehensive police reforms in the aftermath of a critical incident involving the fatal police shooting of an unarmed motorist.

For more than two decades, Dr. Engel has worked to engage in policing research designed to reduce harm in communities and make police-citizen encounters safer, promoting best practices through academic-practitioner partnerships. She has served as Principal Investigator for over ninety studies and projects and was ranked among the top academics in the field of criminal justice/criminology based on publications in prestigious peer-reviewed journals.

Dr. Engel currently serves as a governor-appointed member of the Ohio Collaborative Community-Police Advisory Board, co-chair of the International Association of Chiefs of Police's Research Advisory Committee, and member of the National Policing Institute's Council on Policing Reforms and Race. Dr. Engel currently leads research teams implementing and evaluating violence reduction, police training, and police reform initiatives across dozens of cities, along with a large-scale evaluation of state-mandated police reforms.

As a top scholar and a trusted, leading authority in police science, Dr. Engel brings valuable expertise, strategy, and thought leadership to the Institute, further enabling us to bring about positive and evidence-informed changes and improvements to policing and public safety in communities nationwide. On behalf of the Institute's Board of Directors and staff, we are proud to welcome Dr. Engel and her team to the Institute," said James Burch, the Institute's President. The Institute's Board Chair, Ronal Serpas, PhD of Loyola University, added, "we are proud to welcome such a prestigious scholar to the Institute who will help us to lead the way in advancing policing in an independent and non-partisan manner as our mission requires."

As the Senior Vice President of the Institute, Dr. Engel will provide leadership and oversight of the Institute's scientific investments and strategy and the Institute's work to translate and integrate research into practices.

MICHAEL S. HARRISON

Michael S. Harrison is the Commissioner of the Baltimore, Maryland, Police Department's. Before coming to Baltimore, Commissioner Harrison served in the New Orleans, Louisiana, Police Department (NOPD). He joined the NOPD in 1991 and ascended steadily through

the ranks. He was appointed to Superintendent in 2014 and led the department for over four years.

Commissioner Harrison has been instrumental in the development, implementation, and assessment of community policing programs that have led to increased partnership and collaboration. He also has considerable experience in navigating a policing agency through the rigors of operating under a federal consent decree.

Commissioner Harrison is the President of the Police Executive Research Forum Board of Directors and is a member of the Major Cities Chiefs Association, the International Association of Chiefs of Police, the National Organization of Black Law Enforcement Executives, and the Law Enforcement Immigration Task Force.

He received a bachelor's degree in Criminal Justice from the University of Phoenix and a Masters of Criminal Justice from Loyola University New Orleans. He is also a graduate of the Senior Management Institute for Police, the Northwestern University's School of Police Staff and Command, and the F.B.I.'s National Executive Institute.

MAURICE A. JONES

Maurice A. Jones was appointed CEO of OneTen in March of 2021. OneTen is a coalition of leading chief executives and their companies who are coming together to upskill, hire and promote one million Black Americans over the next 10 years who do not yet have a four-year degree into family-sustaining jobs with opportunities for advancement. Prior to joining OneTen, Maurice was the President and CEO of the Local Initiatives Support Corporation (LISC), one of the country's largest organizations supporting projects to revitalize communities and catalyze economic opportunity for residents.

During his time at LISC, Maurice led the company's effort to expand its footprint into the southern part of the country. He grew the company's annual investment from a billion dollars to over two billion dollars. He also increased the economic development investments of LISC throughout the country, including launching a subsidiary company dedicated to small business lending. During his tenure, LISC diversified its partnerships with multiple industries, including healthcare, technology, sports, retail and advanced manufacturing.

He previously served as Secretary of Commerce and Trade for the Commonwealth of Virginia where his primary job was to leverage Virginia's assets to solidify its position as the preeminent place to live, work and conduct business.

Maurice also served as Deputy Secretary for the U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development (HUD) from April 2012 through January 2014. As the second most senior official at HUD, Maurice managed the Department's day-to-day operations, the annual operating budget of \$40 billion and the agency's 8,900 employees.

Before his appointment at HUD, Maurice was President of Pilot Media, the largest print and digital organization in Hampton Roads, Virginia. He joined Landmark Media Enterprises, owner of Pilot Media, in 2005, serving as Vice President of the Landmark Publishing Group. In 2006, he became the Vice President and General Manager of Pilot Media, and in 2008 he became President and Publisher of The Virginian-Pilot.

Maurice was also the Commissioner of the Virginia Department of Social Services and Deputy Chief of Staff to then-Virginia Governor Mark R. Warner. Other positions include: Special Assistant to the General Counsel at the U.S. Treasury Department, Legal Counsel to the Community Development Financial Institutions (CDFI) Fund and Director of the Fund during the Clinton Administration, Associate Attorney at Hunton & Williams in Richmond, Virginia, and Partner at Venture Philanthropy Partners.

Maurice received a Bachelor of Arts in Political Science from Hampden-Sydney College and attended Oxford University in England on a Rhodes Scholarship, where he received a Master of Philosophy in International Relations. He later received a Juris Doctor from the University of Virginia.

DR. TARRICK MCGUIRE

Tarrick McGuire began a career in public service with the Arlington, Texas, Police Department in 2003. During his tenure, he has served in multiple positions before being appointed to Assistant Police Chief in 2022. As a nationally recognized public speaker and published author, Chief McGuire has been a leading authority on community police relations, police pattern and practice, evidence-based policing, and public policy.

In 2016, Chief McGuire served as a law enforcement fellow with the International Association of Chiefs of Police (IACP) contributing research and technical assistance to police departments on 21st century policing. During this period, Chief McGuire worked with the Department of Justice COPS Office and Obama White House Administration to improve policing practices, policy, and community-police relations.

Chief McGuire received the IACP 40 Under 40 Award, the Anthony L. Sutin Department of Justice COPS Office Award for his work in community police relations, and the Martin Luther King Jr. Award for Governmental Leadership. In 2020, he was inducted into the Evidence-Based Policing Hall of Fame.

Chief McGuire has earned a B.S. in Speech Communications from Oklahoma State University, a M.A. in Christian Leadership from Criswell College, and a Doctor of Public Administration from California Baptist University.

MARY BETH O'CONNOR

Mary Beth O'Connor: Founder and managing partner Ironbound Film and Television Studios and Lucky VIII films. In 2015, O'Connor joined RKO Pictures under its chairman and ceo, Ted Hartley, coinciding with the company's development of its legendary library for new film, television and live theatrical productions. Recent Broadway credits include *The Girl From the North Country* (2022), Conor McPherson's critically acclaimed new work featuring the music of Bob Dylan.

BILL TAYLOR

William Taylor began his professional career in the insurance industry in 1975. In February 2012, Mr. Taylor formed Miravast, an investment management firm that specializes in the life settlements asset. As Founder of the firm, Mr. Taylor was responsible for establishing the firm's strategy and general oversight of all of the firm's functional areas. Prior to forming Miravast, Mr. Taylor was the Senior Vice President, Chief Underwriting Officer for the AIG division responsible for investing in life insurance policies. He was the principal founder of its life settlements operation and managed the largest life settlement portfolio in the market, featuring over \$5 billion invested.

Mr. Taylor has served on many nonprofit Boards and is currently a Board member of six organizations, Acorn Montessori School, Salvation Army Advisory Board, Grace United Church of Christ, Team Walker, New Jersey Association of the Central Atlantic Conference of the United Church of Christ, and the National Police Foundation.

Mr. Taylor has a B.S. in Applied Mathematics from Brown University and is a Fellow of the Society of Actuaries, as well as a member of the American Academy of Actuaries.

RONALD WEITZER

Ronald Weitzer received his Ph.D. from the University of California, Berkeley, in 1985, and is currently professor emeritus at George Washington University. He is a criminologist, and much of his research has investigated police-minority relations and police accountability in the United States and other countries. He is the author of many journal articles and several books, including *Race and Policing in America: Conflict and Reform* and *Policing Under Fire: Police-Community Relations in Northern Ireland*.

SPECIAL ADVISOR TO THE COUNCIL ►



CONNIE RICE

Connie Rice is renowned for her unconventional approaches to tackling problems of inequity and exclusion. For example, she has teamed up with conservatives on education issues and the Los Angeles Police Department to support the Watts gang truce. Rice has received more than 50 major awards for her leadership of diverse coalitions, and her nontraditional approaches to litigating major cases involving police misconduct, employment discrimination and fair public resource allocation. She received the 2001 Peace Prize from the

California Wellness Foundation and this year (2002) will receive the John Anson Ford Humanitarian Award from Los Angeles County. She successfully co-litigated class-action, civil rights cases winning more than \$1.6 billion in policy changes and remedies during her nine-year tenure in the Los Angeles office of the NAACP Legal Defense & Educational Fund, Inc. (LDF).

Rice is a graduate of Harvard College and the New York University School of Law. In 1998, the Los Angeles Times designated her one of 24 leaders considered the “most experienced, civic-minded and thoughtful people on the subject of Los Angeles.” In 1999, California Law Business named her one of California’s top 10 most influential lawyers. She serves on the boards of the Public Policy Institute of California and public radio station KPCC.

[READ CONNIE'S STATEMENT](#)

VISITING SCHOLAR ►



DR. ANDREA HEADLEY

The Foundation has appointed Dr. Andrea Headley as the Visiting Scholar on Policing, Race, and Crime, a new position that will consider and address the issues of police reform as it relates to race. Dr. Headley is currently serving as Assistant Professor at the McCourt School of Public Policy at Georgetown University. She is a scholar of public management, criminal justice policy, and racial equity. In her role as NPI’s Visiting Scholar, Dr. Headley will be supporting the Council and providing expertise in conducting policing and crime research and analysis in cases where race is a major factor.